



Neutral

As of: February 8, 2017 2:29 PM EST

## *In re Bard IVC Filters Prods. Liab. Litig.*

United States District Court for the District of Arizona

September 16, 2016, Decided; September 16, 2016, Filed

No. MDL 15-02641-PHX DGC

### Reporter

317 F.R.D. 562 \*; 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 126448 \*\*; 95 Fed. R. Serv. 3d (Callaghan) 1389; 2016 WL 4943393

IN RE: Bard IVC Filters Products Liability Litigation,

**Prior History:** [\*In re Bard IVC Filters Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 15443 \(J.P.M.L., Feb. 4, 2016\)\*](#)

### Core Terms

discovery, communications, regulators, parties, entities, proportionality, amendments, scope of discovery, Relevancy, appears, filters, issues, cases, reasonably calculated to lead, admissible evidence, purposes

**Counsel:** **[\*\*1]** For Bard IVC Filters Products Liability Litigation, In Re: Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For George Leus (WD MO - 4:13cv-585), Plaintiff: Amanda Montee, LEAD ATTORNEY, Montee Law Firm, St. Joseph, MO; James P Cannon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Montee Law Firm, St. Joseph, MO; James Albert Montee, LEAD ATTORNEY, Montee Law Firm, St. Joseph, MO; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Gary Milton (MD GA - 5:14cv351), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Robert M Hammers, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Jason Schneider PC, Atlanta, GA; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Denise Ocasio (MD FL - 8:13cv1962) an individual, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; John J Glenn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Anderson Glenn LLC, Boca Raton, FL; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W

Palm Beach, FL; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, **[\*\*2]** Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Wilnar Jeanne Julmiste, LEAD ATTORNEY, Anderson Glenn LLC, Boca Raton, FL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Carmelo Ocasio (MD FL - 8:13cv-1962) an individual, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; John J Glenn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Anderson Glenn LLC, Boca Raton, FL; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Wilnar Jeanne Julmiste, LEAD ATTORNEY, Anderson Glenn LLC, Boca Raton, FL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Casey Wyatt (MD FL - 6:14cv1853) an individual, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy **[\*\*3]** PA, Phoenix, AZ; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Lessie Tillman (MD FL - 3:13cv222), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; James P Cannon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Montee Law Firm, St. Joseph, MO; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Laura Elizabeth Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA;

Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Michael William Heaviside, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic - Washington, DC, Washington, DC; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Joseph A Osborne, Jr, Osborne & Associates, Boca Raton, FL.

For Carol Kruse (NE 8:15cv108) an individual, Plaintiff: Richard J Schicker, LEAD ATTORNEY, Schicker Law Firm, Omaha, NE; Ben C Martin, [\*\*4] Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For David L Sizemore (CD CA - 2:15cv1945), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Michael L Armitage, LEAD ATTORNEY, Waters Kraus & Paul, El Segundo, CA; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Albert Miller (MD TN - 3:15cv533), Plaintiff: Matthew Ryan McCarley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fears Nachawati PLLC, Dallas, TX; W Bryan Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Morgan & Morgan PA - Memphis, TN, Memphis, TN; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Joseph Rowe (NM - 1:15cv173), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; William H Carpenter, LEAD ATTORNEY, William H Carpenter Law Office Limited, Albuquerque, NM; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; [\*\*5] Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Tonya Munson (ND MS 0 3:14cv279), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Nathan Craig Van Der Veer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Farris Riley & Pitt LLP, Birmingham, AL; Richard Arthur Freese, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC, Birmingham, AL; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law

Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; John Pinckney Harloe, III, Freese & Goss PLLC - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Alice Jackson (ND IL - 1:14cv4080), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Russell T Button, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Timothy John Freiberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freiberg Law Offices, Rockford, IL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Anthony Jackson (ND IL - 1:14cv4080), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, [\*\*6] LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Russell T Button, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Timothy John Freiberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freiberg Law Offices, Rockford, IL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Angela M Henley (ED WI - 2:14cv59), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Kevin R Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Martin Law Offices SC, Oak Creek, WI; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Humana Insurance Company (ED WI - 2:14cv59) Named as an "Involuntary Plaintiff", Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Marcia Roeder (ND OH - 3:15cv858), Plaintiff: David W Zoll, LEAD ATTORNEY, Zoll Kranz & Borgess, [\*\*7] Toledo, OH; Ben C Martin, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Dawn Merritt (WD NY - 1:14cv917), Plaintiff: Clair A Montroy, III, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Office of Clair A Montroy III, Orchard Park, NY; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL;

Laura Elizabeth Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Michael William Heaviside, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic - Washington, DC, Washington, DC; Julia Reed-Zaic, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Debra Branch (ND TX - 3:15cv1131), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Juanita C Graham (SD TX - 2:15cv205), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices [\*\*8] of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Charles Conn (SD TX - 4:14cv298), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Russell T Button, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Alyssa Conn (SD TX - 4:14cv298), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Russell T Button, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Mary Jo Anderson (ED WI - 1:15cv574), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport [\*\*9] Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Melissa Ebert (ED PA - 5:12cv1253), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; John Neumann Hickey, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of John N Hickey, Media, PA; Joshua A Mankoff, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Michael S Katz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA,

Philadelphia, PA; John Pinckney Harloe, III, Freese & Goss PLLC - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Sheila M Bossier, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Vicki Wetzel (ED PA - 2:14cv2729), Plaintiff: Michael S Katz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Joseph R Johnson, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Harry Keen, III (ED PA - 5:13cv5361), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*10] Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Joshua D Miller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Michael S Katz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Michael Joseph Ryan, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Homer W McClarty (ED MI - 4:14cv13627), Plaintiff: Craig E Hilborn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hilborn & Hilborn, Birmingham, MI; Ben C Martin, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Vicki Rivera (ED MI - 4:14cv13627), Plaintiff: Craig E Hilborn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hilborn & Hilborn, Birmingham, MI; Ben C Martin, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Brittany Ann Hough (NJ - 2:15cv1892), Plaintiff: David [\*\*11] B Krangle, LEAD ATTORNEY, Alonso Krangle LLP, Melville, NY; Andres F Alonso, Alonso Krangle LLP, Melville, NY; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Jason Hough (NJ - 2:15cv1892), Plaintiff: David B Krangle, LEAD ATTORNEY, Alonso Krangle LLP, Melville, NY; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law

Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Pamela B Cason (ND GA - 1:12cv1288), Plaintiff: Jason T Schneider, LEAD ATTORNEY, Schneider Hammers LLC, Atlanta, GA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert M Hammers, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Jason Schneider PC, Atlanta, GA; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA.

For Susan Fox (ND TX - 3:14cv133), Plaintiff: Christopher Thomas Kirchmer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Provost & Umphrey Law Firm LLP - Beaumont, TX, Beaumont, TX; Elizabeth Hosea Lemoine, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wick Phillips Gould & Martin LLP, Dallas, TX; Jamie Jean McKey, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kendall Law Group LLP, Dallas, TX; Jody Lynn Rudman, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*12] Kendall Law Group LLP, Dallas, TX; Joe Kendall, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kendall Law Group LLP, Dallas, TX; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Jason Pickard (ND TX - 5:14cv30), Plaintiff: Charles R Houssiere, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Houssiere Durant & Houssiere, Houston, TX; Randal A Kauffman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Houssiere Durant & Houssiere, Houston, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Jessica Deserio-Mintz (ED NY - 2:14cv4942), Plaintiff: Andres F Alonso, LEAD ATTORNEY, Alonso Krangle LLP, Melville, NY; David B Krangle, Alonso Krangle LLP, Melville, NY; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Robert Mintz (ED NY - 2:14cv-4942), Plaintiff: Andres F Alonso, LEAD ATTORNEY, Alonso Krangle LLP, Melville, NY; Ramon Rossi Lopez, [\*\*13] Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Jennifer R Coker (ND GA - 1:13cv515), Plaintiff: Kimberly Waters Grant, LEAD ATTORNEY, Grant Law Office, Atlanta, GA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA;

Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Wayne Grant, Grant Law Office, Atlanta, GA.

For Joel A Coker (ND GA - 1:13cv515), Plaintiff: Kimberly Waters Grant, LEAD ATTORNEY, Grant Law Office, Atlanta, GA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA; Wayne Grant, Grant Law Office, Atlanta, GA.

For Pamela Noterman (MD FL - 8:15cv1557), Plaintiff: Daniel C Burke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Parker Waichman LLP, Port Washington, NY; Jordan L Chaikin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Parker Waichman LLP - Bonita Springs, FL, Bonita Springs, FL; Matthew J. McCauley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Parker Waichman LLP, Port Washington, NY; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For [\*\*14] Heather Blacketer (KS - 2:15cv9134), Plaintiff: Brandon L Corl, LEAD ATTORNEY, Potts Law Firm LLP, Westwood, KS; Patricia Lynn Campbell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Potts Law Firm LLP, Westwood, KS; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Christopher Cronan (ED CA 2:15cv1418), Plaintiff: Louisa O Kirakosian, LEAD ATTORNEY, Waters Kraus & Paul, El Segundo, CA; Ben C Martin, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Shannon Cronan-Castellanoes (ED CA - 2:15cv-1418), Plaintiff: Louisa O Kirakosian, LEAD ATTORNEY, Waters Kraus & Paul, El Segundo, CA; Ben C Martin, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Melonee Murray (CD CA - 2:15cv4213), Plaintiff: Douglas S Saeltzer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup [\*\*15] Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Matthew D Davis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Michael A Kelly, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San

Francisco, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Spencer J Pahlke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For John Murray (CD CA - 2:15cv4213), Plaintiff: Douglas S Saeltzer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Matthew D Davis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Michael A Kelly, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Spencer J Pahlke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Walkup Melodia Kelly & Schoenberger, San Francisco, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA.

For Thomas Fregeau (MA - 1:15cv13111), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; [\*\*16] Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas A Kenefick, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Law Office of Thomas A Kenefick III, Springfield, MA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Maureen Fregeau (MA - 1:15cv13111), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas A Kenefick, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Law Office of Thomas A Kenefick III, Springfield, MA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Sandra Scott (ED AR - 4:15cv485), Plaintiff: Clyde Talbot Turner, LEAD ATTORNEY, Turner & Associates PA, N Little Rock, AR; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Debra Green (MD FL - 5:15cv314), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; [\*\*17] Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Luis Castillo (WD TX - 5:15cv544), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas William Arbon, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Clifford Geter (SD MS - 3:15cv403), Plaintiff: Nathan Craig Van Der Veer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Farris Riley & Pitt LLP, Birmingham, AL; Richard Arthur Freese, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC, Birmingham, AL; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS; John Pinckney Harloe, III, Freese & Goss PLLC - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Joseph R Johnson, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, [\*\*18] Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Debra Castellano (CD CA - 2:15cv4494), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Laura Elizabeth Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Michael William Heaviside, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic - Washington, DC, Washington, DC; Joseph A Osborne, Jr, Osborne & Associates, Boca Raton, FL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Jessica Parker (ND AL - 5:15cv787), Plaintiff: Nathan Craig Van Der Veer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Farris Riley & Pitt LLP, Birmingham, AL; Kenneth Riley, Farris Riley & Pitt LLP, Birmingham, AL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For David Shackelford (MD - 1:15cv2278), Plaintiff: Laura Elizabeth Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Michael William Heaviside, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic - Washington, DC, Washington, DC; Peter Thomas Anderson, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*19] Ashcraft & Gerel LLP - Alexandria, VA, Alexandria, VA; Joseph R Johnson, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Joseph A Osborne, Jr, Osborne & Associates, Boca Raton, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, Heaviside Reed

Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Erin Smith (ED TX - 1:13cv633), Plaintiff: Christopher Thomas Kirchmer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Provost & Umphrey Law Firm LLP - Beaumont, TX, Beaumont, TX; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Ernest Winland (CD IL - 2:15cv2144), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Robert D Rowland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg & Heller PC, Edwardsville, IL; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Carol Jo Winland (CD IL - 2:15cv-2144), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon [\*\*20] & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Robert D Rowland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg & Heller PC, Edwardsville, IL; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Lisa Schweska, CD IL - 3:15cv3193; AZ Member Case - 2:15cv1879, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Robert D Rowland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg & Heller PC, Edwardsville, IL; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Teresa C Toriseva, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Daniel P Schweska (CD IL - 3:15cv3193), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Robert D Rowland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg & Heller PC, Edwardsville, IL; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Teresa C Toriseva, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Donald Epps (NV - 2:15cv1210), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, [\*\*21] LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Peter C Wetherall, LEAD ATTORNEY,

Wetherall Group Limited, Las Vegas, NV; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Robert Peery (WD TN - 1:15cv1153), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Ricky L Boren, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hill Boren, Jackson, TN; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Teresa C Toriseva, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Emily Landress (ND GA - 1:15cv2672), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Robert M Hammers, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Jason Schneider PC, Atlanta, GA; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Joji Takada (ND IL - 1:15cv-7165) Trustee in Bankruptcy for John Noonan, Plaintiff: Jacob W Plattenberger, [\*\*22] LEAD ATTORNEY, Torhoerman Law LLC, Chicago, IL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For John Noonan (ND IL - 1:15cv7165), Plaintiff: Jacob W Plattenberger, LEAD ATTORNEY, Torhoerman Law LLC, Chicago, IL; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Michelle Mercurio (WD NY - 6:15cv6535), Plaintiff: Hadley L Matarazzo, LEAD ATTORNEY, Faraci Lange LLP, Rochester, NY; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Claudette Y Mears (MD PA - 1:15cv1253), Plaintiff: Anthony James Urban, LEAD ATTORNEY, Urban Law, Pottsville, PA; John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Lisa Smullen (MD FL - 3:15cv1086), Plaintiff: Joseph R

Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heavyside Reed [\*\*23] Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Angela Voigt (ED OK - 6:15cv239), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Lawrence R Murphy, Jr, LEAD ATTORNEY, Richards & Connor, Tulsa, OK; Mariann M Robison, LEAD ATTORNEY, Richards & Connor, Tulsa, OK; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Teresa C Toriseva, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Pharris Morgan (ED TX - 6:15cv603), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Teresa C Toriseva, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Billy C Morgan, Jr. (ED TX - 6:15cv603) husband, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Joshua D Miller, Toriseva [\*\*24] Law, Wheeling, WV; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Teresa C Toriseva, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Denise O'Neill, formerly known as Denise O'Neil, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Matthew Robert Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Tamika Williams (ND GA - 1:15cv3045), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Roberts Clay Milling, LEAD

ATTORNEY, II, Henry Spiegel Milling LLP, Atlanta, GA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; [\*\*25] Troy Alexander Brenes, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Myra Edwards (WD VA - 7:15cv515) an individual, Plaintiff: John Lacoste Langdoc, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Robert R Hatten, LEAD ATTORNEY, Patten Wornom Hatten Diamonstein LC, Newport News, VA; Roland Karim Tellis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC - Encino, CA, Encino, CA; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; S Ann Saucer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Sindhu Daniel, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Catherine Rowden (ED MO - 4:15cv1489) Individually and on behalf of the Estate of Johnny Rowden, Plaintiff: Christopher J Quinn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Driscoll Firm PC, St Louis, MO; John J Driscoll, LEAD ATTORNEY, Driscoll Firm PC, St Louis, MO; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Andrew D Kinghorn, Driscoll Firm PC, St Louis, MO; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Philip Sholtz, Driscoll Firm PC, St Louis, MO.

For Mary Duffie, ND GA - 1:15cv3095, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, [\*\*26] TX; Michael Brandon Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Childers Schlueter & Smith LLC, Atlanta, GA; Stephen Grant Daniel, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm, Houston, TX.

For James Duffie, ND GA - 1:15cv3095, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX; Michael Brandon Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Childers Schlueter & Smith LLC, Atlanta, GA; Stephen Grant Daniel, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm, Houston, TX.

For Kevin Gross, ED PA - 2:15cv5110, Plaintiff: Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Raymond J Peppelman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr., McNichol Byrne & Matlawski PC, Media, PA; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Adam Tal Funk, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Jennifer Campbell Tate, WD PA - 2:15cv1220, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Mathew R Doebler, LEAD ATTORNEY,

Pribanic & Pribanic LLC, Pittsburgh, PA; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For William Owens, Jr. (CO - 1:15cv1970), Plaintiff: Joseph Jacob Zonies, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reilly Pozner LLP, Denver, CO; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh [\*\*27] LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA.

For Sheila Middleton (CD IL - 3:15cv3287), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Timothy John Freiberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freiberg Law Offices, Rockford, IL.

For Dean Becker (CD CA - 2:15cv7937), Plaintiff: Elaine T Byszewski, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP - Pasadena, CA, Pasadena, CA; Leonard W Aragon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro, Phoenix, AZ; Robert B Carey, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP, Phoenix, AZ.

For Cheryl Rouse (ND CA - 5:15cv4569) Arizona Case: 2:15cv2227, Plaintiff: Alex C Park, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Office of Alex C Park, Santa Clara, CA.

For Karen Brown (ND IL - 1:15cv9020; AZ Case - 2:15cv2302), Plaintiff: Felecia L Stern, LEAD ATTORNEY, Bernstein Liebhard LLP, New York, NY; Raymond Joseph Kramer, III, LEAD ATTORNEY, Torhoerman Law LLC, Chicago, IL; Sandy A Liebhard, Bernstein Liebhard LLP, New York, NY.

For Norma J Dukett (CD IL - 1:15cv1309; AZ Case 2:15-2303), Plaintiff: Steven D Davis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toerhoerman [\*\*28] Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Michael Callahan (ND NY - 1:15cv1263; AZ Case - 2:15cv2304), Plaintiff: Ellen Relkin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Weitz & Luxenberg PC - New York, NY, New York, NY; Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Priscilla Callahan (ND NY - 1:15cv1263; AZ Case 2:15cv2304), Plaintiff: Ellen Relkin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Weitz & Luxenberg PC - New York, NY, New York, NY; Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Joanna Darwactor (SC - 4:15cv4380; AZ Case - 2:15-2308), Plaintiff: Joshua S Whitley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Smyth Whitley, Charleston, SC; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Laura Elizabeth Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Donald E Yates (SD IN - 1:15cv1466; AZ Case 2:15-cv-2380), Plaintiff: Frederick R Hovde, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hovde Dassow & Deets LLC, Indianapolis, IN; John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA.

For Joy E Yates (SD IN - 1:15cv1466; AZ Case 2:15-cv-2380), [\*\*29] Plaintiff: Frederick R Hovde, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hovde Dassow & Deets LLC, Indianapolis, IN; John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA.

For Tammy Lynn Hillsburg (SD TX - 4:15cv3001; AZ Case 2:15cv2379), Plaintiff: Michael T Gallagher, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher Law Firm, Houston, TX.

For Christine Lorthe (MD FL - 6:15cv1864; AZ Case - 2:15cv2446), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For Audrey R Keegan (MD PA - 1:15cv2152; AZ Case - 2:15cv2642), Plaintiff: Gerard C Kramer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Schmidt Ronca & Kramer PC, Harrisburg, PA; Jon C Conlin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Cory Watson Attorneys, Birmingham, AL.

For Kendrick Taylor (SD AL - 1:15cv568; AZ case - 2:15cv2463), Plaintiff: Frank Woodson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Beasley Allen Crow Methvin Portis & Miles PC, Montgomery, AL; Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Debra P Rodrigue (ED LA - 2:15cv5920; AZ Case - 2:15-2462-PHX), Plaintiff: Bruce S Kingsdorf, LEAD ATTORNEY, Barrios Kingsdorf & Casteix LLP, New Orleans, LA; Dawn M Barrios, LEAD ATTORNEY, Barrios Kingsdorf & Casteix LLP, New Orleans, LA; Zachary [\*\*30] Logan Wool, LEAD ATTORNEY, Barrios Kingsdorf & Casteix LLP, New Orleans, LA.

For Mark A Rodrigue (ED LA - 2:15cv5920; AZ Case - CV-15-2462-PHX), Plaintiff: Bruce S Kingsdorf, LEAD ATTORNEY, Barrios Kingsdorf & Casteix LLP, New



Orleans, LA; Dawn M Barrios, LEAD ATTORNEY, Barrios Kingsdorf & Casteix LLP, New Orleans, LA; Zachary Logan Wool, LEAD ATTORNEY, Barrios Kingsdorf & Casteix LLP, New Orleans, LA.

For Priscilla Eaker (ED TX - 6:15cv952; AZ Case - 2:15cv2573), Plaintiff: Rhett A McSweeney, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN; David M Langevin, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Thomas Eaker (ED TX - 6:15cv952; AZ Case - 2:15cv2573), Plaintiff: Rhett A McSweeney, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN; David M Langevin, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Nannette Smith, AZ Case: 2:15-cv-2635, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Patricia Jones (ND GA - 1:15cv4178; AZ Case - 2:15cv2647), Plaintiff: Roberts Clay Milling, LEAD ATTORNEY, II, Henry Spiegel Milling LLP, Atlanta, GA.

For Tommy Lee Beal (WD NC - 5:15cv143; AZ Case - 2:15cv2648), Plaintiff: Elizabeth G Grimes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Michael A DeMayo LLP, Charlotte, NC; Jon C Conlin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Cory Watson Attorneys, Birmingham, AL.

For Jennifer Shropshire (ED KY - 5:15cv374; AZ case - 2:15-2655), Plaintiff: Thomas K Herren, LEAD ATTORNEY, Herren & Adams, Lexington, KY; Yvonne M Flaherty, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lockridge Grindel Nauen PLLP - Minneapolis, MN, Minneapolis, MN.

For Gary Leigh Piazza (WD NY - 1:15cv51048; AZ Case - 2:15-2656), Plaintiff: Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY; Daniel E Seltz, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY.

For Freedom Zybert, AZ Case: 2:16-cv-002, Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Alec Caldwell (ND MS - 1:15cv208; AZ Case - 2:16-10), Plaintiff: David C DeGreeff, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS; Thomas P Cartmell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff &

Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Robert G Harbridge, AZ Case: 2:16-cv-008, Plaintiff: Alexandra V Boone, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Weisbrod LLP - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Les [\*\*32] Weisbrod, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Weisbrod LLP - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Max Freeman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Weisbrod, Dallas, TX.

For Michael Gill (AZ Case: 2:16cv25), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Lynn Ann Agnew (AZ Member Case: 2:16-cv-27-PHX), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For James Edward Agnew (AZ Member Case: 2:16-cv-27), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Linda Lue King (AZ Case:2:16-cv-034), Plaintiff: Donald A Migliori, LEAD ATTORNEY, Motley Rice LLC, Providence, RI; Fred Thompson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Motley Rice LLC, Mt Pleasant, SC; John C Duane, LEAD ATTORNEY, Motley Rice LLC, Mt Pleasant, SC.

For Regina Kinney (AZ Case: 2:16-cv-0040), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, [\*\*33] Newport Beach, CA.

For James Kinney (AZ Case: 2:16-cv-0040), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Marie Dolan (AZ Member Case - 2:16cv59), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Cynthia Bruhn (AZ Case: 2:16-cv-058), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA;

Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Rick Reed (AZ Case: 2:16-cv-058), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Phillip Batchelder (AZ Member Case: 2:16-cv-060), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kim Batchelder (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-060), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*34] Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Michelle R Layman-Hanes (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv61), Plaintiff: Rand P Nolen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fleming Nolen & Jez LLP, Houston, TX.

For Michael King (AZ Member Case: 2:16-cv-67), Plaintiff: Moze Cowper, LEAD ATTORNEY, Cowper Law, Austin, TX.

For Wilford L Edwards (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv79), Plaintiff: Monte Bond, LEAD ATTORNEY, Tautfest Bond PLLC, Dallas, TX.

For Karen S Thomas (AZ Member Case: 2:16-cv-90), Plaintiff: Brian A Goldstein, LEAD ATTORNEY, Cellino & Barnes PC, Buffalo, NY.

For Debbie Anderson (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv97), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Vivian Baldwin (AZ Member Case: 2:15cv109), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Anders Linster (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv111), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport [\*\*35] Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez

McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Denise Gill (AZ Member Case - 2:15-cv-0110), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Mark Seaman (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv113), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Dona Seaman (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv113), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Paula Peters (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-0112), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Brett Waliczek (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv115), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Elizabeth [\*\*36] Waliczek (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv115), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For April Buracker (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv121), Plaintiff: Moze Cowper, LEAD ATTORNEY, Cowper Law, Austin, CA.

For Maygret Wood (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-0114), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For John Bradshaw Wood, III (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-0114), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Jamie M Barrow (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-0126), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Tammy Hesser-Schluter (NM - 1:15cv1067; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv129), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson [\*\*37] Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Eric M Terry, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Bradley Ricker (MD PA - 1:15cv2453; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv130), Plaintiff: Carrie R Capouellez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Florence Bures (MD PA - 3:15cv2420; AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-137), Plaintiff: Carrie R Capouellez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Michael S Katz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA.

For Roger B Knotts (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-138), Plaintiff: Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Vanice Knotts (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-138), Plaintiff: [\*\*38] Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For John L Kuhn, Jr. (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-140), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher &

Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Jodi Smith (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv143), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Jay Brian Madson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-148), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese [\*\*39] & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Linda Madson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-148), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For George Borden (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-150), Plaintiff: Charles R Houssiere, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Houssiere Durant & Houssiere, Houston, TX; Randal A Kauffman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Houssiere Durant & Houssiere, Houston, TX.

For Melody Borden (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-150), Plaintiff: Charles R Houssiere, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Houssiere Durant & Houssiere, Houston, TX; Randal A Kauffman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Houssiere Durant & Houssiere, Houston, TX.

For Thomas P Torpey, AZ Member Case: 2:16cv151), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Michael Viola (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv153), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Corrina M Hardeman (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-154), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, [\*\*40] Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Nicole Elizabeth Gross (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv161),

Plaintiff: H Forest Horne, LEAD ATTORNEY, Martin & Jones PLLC, Raleigh, NC.

Michael Alan Gross (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv161), Plaintiff, Pro se.

For Stephanie Grygiel (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-160), Plaintiff: Gregory N McEwen, LEAD ATTORNEY, McEwen Law Firm Limited, Inver Grove Heights, MN.

For Amber Nordin (S.D. - 4:16cv4005; AZ Member Case: 2:16cv171), Plaintiff: Michael F Marlow, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Miner Marlow Woodward & Huff PLLC, Yankton, SD.

For Dezarae Anzaldua, AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-174), Plaintiff: Annesley H DeGaris, LEAD ATTORNEY, DeGaris Law Group LLC, Birmingham, AL; Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP, New York, NY; Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY.

For Deborah Kucharski (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv175), Plaintiff: Annesley H DeGaris, LEAD ATTORNEY, DeGaris Law Group LLC, Birmingham, AL; Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP, New York, NY; Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, [\*\*41] New York, NY.

For Kirsten Bicica, AZ Member Case: 2:16cv177, Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Kimberly Curry (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv179), Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Cheyenne Carter (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-178), Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Judy Gibson (AZ Member Case: 2:16cv181), Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Patty King, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv183, Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron &

Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Robert Dougal (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-180), Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Susan Hayes (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-182), Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, [\*\*42] Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Farah E Radjewski (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-187), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Mary L Faulk (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-188), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Deborah A Kaiser (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-190), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lorene M Crowe, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv191, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Terry J Harless, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Ivana L Hudson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv193, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila [\*\*43] M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Rhonda V White (AZ Member Case - 2:169-cv-194), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Russell J Webster, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv197,

Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Jered J Salmon (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-196), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Bernard Pikal, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv201, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Roger Lee Presswood, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv203, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Timothy A Barnett (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-198), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, [\*\*44] LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lenore B Lieberman (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-200), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For James Dustin Kouns, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv205, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For James Anthony Carlyle (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-202), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Jason Lee Perkins (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-204), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Jacob Richardson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-206), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport [\*\*45] Beach, CA.

For Andrea Jean Richardson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-206), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For James Brassard (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-208), Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Jamie Brassard (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-208), Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For William T Jones, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv211, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Sherly Fairchild, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv213, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, [\*\*46] Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Johnny Kestner, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv215, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Matthew Smith, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv217, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Patricia Levy, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv219, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, [\*\*47] LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For William Levy, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv219, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Heather E Miller, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv221, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Tiffany C Burns, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv225, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lishus R Gore, Jr., AZ Member Case - 2:16cv223, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Sandra B Green, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv223, [\*\*48] Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Kathleen Frame, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv227, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews &

Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Ramiro V Soliz, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv229, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lucille A Kowalczyk, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv231, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Allen Gene Erlitz (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-212), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, [\*\*49] AZ.

For Sally Ann Erlitz (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-212), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Cristal Morris, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv233, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Gary Tomlinson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv235, Plaintiff: Matthew Ryan McCarley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fears Nachawati PLLC, Dallas, TX.

For Sheryl Harvey (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-214), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Michael Williams, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv239,

Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD [\*\*50] ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Kelly Williams, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv239, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Beth Hardenbrook (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-216), Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Ron Hardenbrook (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-216), Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Joyce A Smith (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-218), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC [\*\*51] - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Margaret Owens, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv241, Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Willie Owens, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv241, Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Cindy Terry (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-220), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Janet A Kimbro (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-224), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Tammy Lopez (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-226), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For James E Henry (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-228), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, [\*\*52] LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Daniel W Hodge, Jr. (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-232), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Gale Robinson (AZ Member Case - 2:-16-cv-242), Plaintiff: Marlene J Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Stuart Goldenberg, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg Law PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Chastity Sepulveda (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-246), Plaintiff: Hadley L Matarazzo, LEAD ATTORNEY, Faraci Lange LLP, Rochester, NY.

For Michael L Guarino, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv247, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For Audrey I Kasler, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv249, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Martha Mendes (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-250), Plaintiff: Graham B LippSmith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kasdan LippSmith Weber Turner LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Jaclyn L Anderson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kasdan LippSmith Weber Turner LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, [\*\*53] CA.

For Pamela Bingham, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For James E Pugh, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv255, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Mary Hudson-Pierce (AZ Member Case - 2:-cv-256), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, Heavyside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For George Pierce (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-256), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For Sonia K Nunn, AZ Member Case - 2 :16cv257, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Ryan Wilson, AZ Member Case: 2:16cv259, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For LaTrina Harris, AZ [\*\*54] Member Case - 2:16cv261, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For Debra Tinlin, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv263, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For James Frances Tinlin, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv263, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Audrey Valente-Kropf, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv265, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For John Kropf, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv265, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez

McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Eileen Schmuck, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv267, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh [\*\*55] LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kevin Schmuck, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv267, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Nathan Anastasoff (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-262), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For George Borden, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv269, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Melody Borden, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv269, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Wanda Faye Jensen (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-264), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert [\*\*56] W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For David Troulliet (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-266), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Joseph Catlin Mixson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-268), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,



CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Virginia Breann Mixson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-268), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For John Anderson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-270), Plaintiff: Matthew Ryan McCarley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fears Nachawati PLLC, Dallas, TX.

For George M Hahn (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-274), Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL; Tor A Hoerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Concepcion [\*\*57] Lopez (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-276), Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL; Tor A Hoerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Paul Kerbel, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv275, Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL; Tor A Hoerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For David Allen Ruck, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv277, Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL; Tor A Hoerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Shirley M Doze-Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv285, Plaintiff: Rand P Nolen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fleming Nolen & Jez LLP, Houston, TX.

For David Light (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-282), Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL; Tor A Hoerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Ronald Moody, Jr. (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-286), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, [\*\*58] CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Patricia Kilcran (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-289), Plaintiff: Daniel C Burke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Parker Waichman LLP, Port Washington, NY; Matthew J. McCauley, Parker Waichman LLP, Port Washington, NY.

For Goldie Brown (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-294), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Naomi Brewer (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-303), Plaintiff: Graham B LippSmith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kasdan LippSmith Weber Turner LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Jaclyn L Anderson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kasdan LippSmith Weber Turner LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA.

For Gerald Copple (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-306), Plaintiff: Jennifer Nolte Williams, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jackson Allen & Williams LLP, Dallas, TX; John H Allen, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Jackson Allen & Williams LLP, Dallas, TX.

For Robert Paschal (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-309), Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Dawn M Hendrickson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-318), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, [\*\*59] LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Stephen E Hendrickson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-318), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Janice L Blakley, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv317, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Thomas Mallory, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv319 (as Administrator of the Estate of Paula E. Mallory), estate of Paula E Mallory, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Linda R Mills (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-320), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For James B Mills (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-320),  
Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Randy Nelson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-322),  
Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD [\*\*60] ATTORNEY,  
TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL;  
Tor A Hoerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law  
LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Sara J Evers, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv321 (as Personal  
Representative of the Estate of John M. Evers), estate of John  
M Evers, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Shirley Dance (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-332),  
Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of  
Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Dana Daniels, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv333, Plaintiff:  
Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C  
Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Bianca Fraser-Johnson (DE - 1:15cv968; AZ Member  
Case - 2:16cv336), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Neilli M  
Walsh, LEAD ATTORNEY, Young Conaway Stargatt &  
Taylor LLP, Wilmington, DE; Richard A Zappa, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor LLP,  
Wilmington, DE; Timothy E Lengkeek, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Young Conaway Stargatt [\*\*61] & Taylor LLP, Wilmington,  
DE.

For Michael Johnson, DE - 1:15cv968; AZ Member Case -  
2:15cv336, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Neilli M Walsh, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor LLP,  
Wilmington, DE; Richard A Zappa, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor LLP, Wilmington, DE;  
Timothy E Lengkeek, LEAD ATTORNEY, Young Conaway  
Stargatt & Taylor LLP, Wilmington, DE.

For Dodi Froehlich (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-338),  
Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Valencia Allen (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-340),

Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Wayne Ruden, ND CA - 4:15cv5189; AZ Member Case -  
2:16cv344, Plaintiff: David R Ongaro, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Ongaro PC, San Francisco, CA; David Raymond Ongaro,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Ongaro PC, San Francisco, CA; Glen  
Elliot Turner, LEAD ATTORNEY, Ongaro PC, San  
Francisco, CA; Kirsten McNelly Bibbes, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Ongaro PC, San Francisco, CA; Nevin  
Christopher Brownfield, LEAD ATTORNEY, Ongaro PC,  
San Francisco, CA.

For Brent Dewitt, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv355, Plaintiff:  
Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez [\*\*62]  
McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA;  
Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh  
LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Barbara Van Sciver (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-386),  
Plaintiff: Annesley H DeGaris, LEAD ATTORNEY, DeGaris  
Law Group LLC, Birmingham, AL; Daniel Seltz, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP,  
New York, NY; Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY.

For Wesley Edwards (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-2090),  
Plaintiff: John Lacoste Langdoc, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron  
& Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Laura J Baughman, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Robert R  
Hatten, LEAD ATTORNEY, Patten Wornom Hatten  
Diamonstein LC, Newport News, VA; Roland Karim Tellis,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC - Encino, CA,  
Encino, CA; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron &  
Budd PC, Dallas, TX; S Ann Saucer, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Sindhu Daniel, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Jillaine M Vandervelden, AZ Member Case: 2:16cv389,  
Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt &  
Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Betty Mestre, as plenary [\*\*63] guardian of the person  
and property of Eduardo M. Sanchez, AZ Member Case:  
2:16cv390, on behalf of Eduardo M Sanchez, Plaintiff: Joseph  
R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W  
Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Maureen L Wallace, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv392,  
Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt &  
Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Michelle Boudreau, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv393, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Beau Wilt, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv394, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Heather McLaine, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv395, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Ronald Eugene McLaine, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv395, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*64] Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kristy Williams, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv435, Plaintiff: William B Curtis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Curtis Law Group, Dallas, TX.

For Donna M Day (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-440), Plaintiff: Rand P Nolen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fleming Nolen & Jez LLP, Houston, TX.

For Alexandra Willmarth, WD WI - 3:15cv716; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv445, Plaintiff: Kenneth W Pearson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Lance Cain (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-446), Plaintiff: Eric Davis Holland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Holland Groves Schneller & Stolze LLC, St. Louis, MO; Randall Seth Crompton, LEAD ATTORNEY, Holland Law Firm, St. Louis, MO.

For Albert A Noa (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-470), Plaintiff: Alexandra V Boone, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Weisbrod LLP - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Les Weisbrod, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Weisbrod LLP - Dallas, TX, Dallas, TX; Max Freeman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Weisbrod, Dallas, TX.

For Sherr-Una Booker [\*\*65] (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-474), Plaintiff: Robin P Lourie, LEAD ATTORNEY, Watkins Lourie Roll & Chance PC, Atlanta, GA.

For Charles Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv473, Plaintiff: Brian Keith Jackson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Riley & Jackson PC, Birmingham, AL.

For Jimmy John Besaw, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv477, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Sharon Alethia Rose, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv479, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Jamison Wayne Olds, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv483, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Rebecca Eaton (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-487), Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Timothy Eaton (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-487), Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Roberta Fairman, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv491, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Tabitha Renee Holcomb, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv495, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - [\*\*66] Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Tony Cundiff (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-494), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Randall A Lauhoff, SD TX - 2:16cv04; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv507, Plaintiff: Craig D Henderson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snapka Law Firm, Corpus Christi, TX; Jack Edward Urquhart, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snapka Law Firm, Corpus Christi, TX; Kathryn Snapka, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snapka Law Firm, Corpus Christi, TX.

For Audrey Oliver, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv515, Plaintiff: Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP, New York, NY; Jeff Seldomridge, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA; Wendy R Fleishman, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New

York, NY.

For Teresa Browning, Guardian (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-516), by guardian Cora Browning, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Dorothy Spann, Plaintiff: Agent/Power of Attorney(AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-518), on behalf of Simmy Hill Ethan [\*\*67] L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Yolanda Medina (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-520), Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Theresa Reynolds-McDonnell (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-524), Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Donald S McDonnell (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-524), Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For James Flora, AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-517, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Evan Laufer, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv519, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Harold Perritt, AZ [\*\*68] Member Case - 2:16cv521, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Brian Van Brocklin, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv523, Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Sarah Merrifield, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv525,

Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Ruth E Delbrugge (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-534), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Adam T Tran, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv535, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Ronald Williams (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-542), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kimberly Anne Williams (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-542), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh [\*\*69] LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Carla Fletcher, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv541, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Randy Witmer, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv543, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Barbara E Witmer, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv543, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Susan M Hans (SD CA - 3:15cv2627; AZ Member Case 2:16cv546), Plaintiff: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Jai Jackson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-552), Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For David Turner (AZ Member Case [\*\*70] - 2:16-cv-554), Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Pamela O'Neil (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-558), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Lisa Robles, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv553, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Shanice Williams (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-556), Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Brockett Wagner, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv555, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX. [\*\*71]

For Joseph Yarrington, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv557, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Stephen Ogden (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-566), Plaintiff: Matthew John Skikos, LEAD ATTORNEY, Skikos Crawford Skikos & Joseph LLP, San Francisco, CA; Melissa Erin Mielke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Skikos Crawford Skikos & Joseph LLP, San Francisco, CA; Steven James Skikos, LEAD ATTORNEY, Skikos Crawford Skikos & Joseph LLP, San Francisco, CA.

For Christopher Jowell Valderas, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv569, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Marilyn Ann Ratz (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-574), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Gregory Hall (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-592), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, [\*\*72] NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Reneal Hall (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-592), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Michael L Shinn, Plaintiff: Individually and Husband (ND CA - 3:15cv6041; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv596) Jesse Burl Chrisp, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of J Chrisp, Clearlake, CA.

For Jennifer A Shinn, Individually and Wife (ND CA - 3:15cv6041; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv596), Plaintiff: Jesse Burl Chrisp, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of J Chrisp, Clearlake, CA.

For Alana Bond, NJ - 2:15cv8776; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv598, Plaintiff: Tayjes Matthew Shah, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA.

For Robert Bond, NJ - 2:15cv8776; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv598, Plaintiff: Tayjes Matthew Shah, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA.

For Rachel L Bailey (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-600), Plaintiff: Jaime E Moss, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lenze Kamerrer Moss PLC, Manhattan Beach, CA; Jennifer A Lenze, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lenze Kamerrer Moss PLC, Manhattan Beach, CA; Laurie [\*\*73] E Kamerrer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lenze Kamerrer Moss PLC, Manhattan Beach, CA.

For Joceylayn Mia Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv605, Plaintiff: Donald A Migliori, LEAD ATTORNEY, Motley Rice LLC, Providence, RI; Fred Thompson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Motley Rice LLC, Mt Pleasant, SC; John C Duane, LEAD ATTORNEY, Motley Rice LLC, Mt Pleasant, SC; Kelly Elswick-Hall, LEAD ATTORNEY, Masters Law Firm, Charleston, WV.

For Melissa M Duran, NM - 1:15cv1159; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv610, Plaintiff: Justin Ross Kaufman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heard Robins Cloud LLP - Santa Fe, NM,

Santa Fe, NM.

For Ronnie J Duran, NM - 1:15cv1159; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv610, Plaintiff: Justin Ross Kaufman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heard Robins Cloud LLP - Santa Fe, NM, Santa Fe, NM.

For John Agnelly (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-608), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Sue Agnelly (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-608), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner [\*\*74] Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Jon Broecker (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-612), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Quanita Underwood (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-614), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Robert Underwood (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-614), Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Patricia Hedge, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv613, Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Darlene Smith (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-616), [\*\*75] Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner

Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Ezekiel Crittendon, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv615, Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For Jennie Nelson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-620), Plaintiff: Michael G Daly, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pogust Braslow & Millrood LLC, Conshohocken, PA; T Matthew Leckman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pogust Braslow & Millrood LLC, Conshohocken, PA.

For Ashwin Narayan, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv617, Plaintiff: Adam Tal Funk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Margaret Moses Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM; Turner Williamson Branch, LEAD ATTORNEY, Branch Law Firm, Albuquerque, NM.

For David Capriglione, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv621, Plaintiff: Graham B LippSmith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kasdan LippSmith Weber Turner LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Jaclyn L Anderson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kasdan LippSmith [\*\*76] Weber Turner LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA.

For Kim M Hepler (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-630), Plaintiff: Jonathan Peck, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lowe Law Group, Ogden, UT; Nathan Buttars, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lowe Law Group, Ogden, UT.

For Martha Amy Christiansen, AK - 3:15cv228; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv645, Plaintiff: Joshua D Miller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV; Richard E Vollertsen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Atkinson Conway & Gagnon Incorporated, Anchorage, AK.

For Barbara Satterwhite, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv679, Plaintiff: Jeff Seldomridge, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA.

For Wesley Satterwhite, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv679, Plaintiff: Jeff Seldomridge, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA.

For Ava E Langford, Individually and as wife (ED MO - 4:15cv1749; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv687), Plaintiff: Robert D Rowland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg & Heller PC, Edwardsville, IL.

For David R Brown, Individually and as husband (ED MO - 4:15cv1749; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv687), Plaintiff: Robert D Rowland, LEAD ATTORNEY, Goldenberg & Heller PC, Edwardsville, IL.

For Dorothy Kay Alexander (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-690), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy [\*\*77] PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Jonathan Hankins (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-690), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Sandra Haller, ND IL - 1:15cv10881; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv695, Plaintiff: Brian John Perkins, LEAD ATTORNEY, Meyers & Flowers LLC, St Charles, IL.

For John Marshall (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-701), Plaintiff: David M Langevin, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN; Rhett A McSweeney, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Jeannie Marshall (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-701), Plaintiff: David M Langevin, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin [\*\*78] LLC, Minneapolis, MN; Rhett A McSweeney, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Bridget Cager (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-703), Plaintiff: Rand P Nolen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fleming Nolen & Jez LLP, Houston, TX.

For Valerie A Duncan (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-704), Plaintiff: Rand P Nolen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Fleming Nolen & Jez LLP, Houston, TX.

For Carol Boutin, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv715, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Rudolph Nicholson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv717, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Jeanie Sankitts, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv719, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Brenda Glant (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-716), Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin [\*\*79] W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Darrell Poole (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-718), Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Patricia Sourk (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-728), Plaintiff: David C DeGreeff, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO; Thomas P Cartmell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Gerald O'Neill, SD TX - 2:15cv316; AZ Meber Case 2:15cv1926, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Elmer Steinbrunn, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv739, Plaintiff: Todd E Hilton, LEAD ATTORNEY, Stueve Siegel Hanson LLP - Kansas City, MO, Kansas City, MO.

For Sheila Kennedy, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv742, Plaintiff: Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Gary Meade (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-762), Plaintiff: Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, [\*\*80] LLP, New York, NY; Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY.

For John Kreckel, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv763, Plaintiff:

Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP, New York, NY; Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lief Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY.

For Vonnetta Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv771, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Judith Knights, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv773, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Justin Peterson (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-774), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Shirley Whaley (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-776), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Janice Porter (AZ Member Case [\*\*81] - 2:16-cv-778), Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Tanner Pratt, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv779, Plaintiff: Ben C Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX; Thomas William Arbon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Law Offices of Ben C Martin, Dallas, TX.

For Doris Jones (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-782), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Alfred Jones, Sr. (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-782), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy

PA, [\*\*82] Phoenix, AZ.

For Ronald A Wolfe, ND OH - 4:16cv579; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv786, Plaintiff: Dennis P Mulvihill, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wright & Schulte - Cleveland, OH, Cleveland, OH; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For Rebecca L Haremaker (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-788), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Werner P Haremaker (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-788), Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Mary B Sekera, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv789, Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Glen Watson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv793, Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL.

For William Geoghegan, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv797, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport [\*\*83] Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Amanda K Lucas (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-802), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Doris Frain (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-804), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Barbara J Kaplysh, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv805, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.



For Douglas Spencer, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv807, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lisa D McFalls (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-806), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Yandelli Merced, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv809, Plaintiff: [\*\*84] David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Crystal Senger, AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-888 and AZ Member Case - 2:16cv811 (closed 4/13/16), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Joan Marie Hoffman (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-808), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Cassie L Hutchens (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-810), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Jessica Smith (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-812), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Devin C Jones, [\*\*85] AZ Member Case - 2:16cv817, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For John T Turner (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-816), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews

& Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lavell Affonseca, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv819, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Cedric Justice (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-818), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For John M Wood, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv821, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Arrek P Taylor (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-820), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC [\*\*86] - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Deloris Stroman, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv823, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Danielle Sowinski, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv825, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Lena Harrington (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-824), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Rebecca R Revolinski (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-826), Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Heather McKinney, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv829,

Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kevin James McKinney, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv829, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez [\*\*87] McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Jason Busser (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-830), Plaintiff: Nathan Craig Van Der Veer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Farris Riley & Pitt LLP, Birmingham, AL.

For Daniel M Currie, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv831, Plaintiff: David P Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Matthews & Associates, Houston, TX; Sheila M Bossier, LEAD ATTORNEY, Freese & Goss PLLC - Jackson, MS, Jackson, MS.

For Robin Geoghegan, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv797, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Puja Ohri, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv837, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Michael Mulder (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-842), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kristie Mulder (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-842), Plaintiff: Matthew [\*\*88] Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Christopher Svedise (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-844), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher &

Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Darlene Svedise (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-844), Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Shirley Stout, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv847, Plaintiff: Matthew [\*\*89] Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Johnny Robert Stout, Sr., AZ Member Case - 2:16cv847, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Joyce Hall, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv851, Plaintiff: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Tiffany Wood (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-010), Personal Representative, estate of Maygret Wood, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Thomas P Cartmell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Debra Mulkey, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv853, Plaintiff: David C DeGreeff, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO; Thomas P Cartmell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Donald Germany, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv855, Plaintiff: David C DeGreeff, LEAD [\*\*90] ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO; Thomas P Cartmell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Danielle Montgomery (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-854), Plaintiff: David C DeGreeff, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO; Thomas P Cartmell,

LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Billie Tentori (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-856), Plaintiff: David C DeGreeff, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO; Thomas P Cartmell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP, Kansas City, MO.

For Joseph Pasierb, Jr., AZ Member Case - 2:16cv857, Plaintiff: J Mark Kell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kell Lampin LLC, St. Peters, MO; Lucas James Ude, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kell Lampin LLC, St. Peters, MO.

For Ohnmar Karlin (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-866), Plaintiff: Jeff Seldomridge, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA.

For Wayne Karlin (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-866), Plaintiff: Jeff Seldomridge, LEAD ATTORNEY, Miller Law Firm LLC, Orange, VA.

For Dustin Craig, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv869, Plaintiff: Laura L Voght, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kenneth S Nugent PC, Atlanta, GA.

For Melanie Buttermure Mauldin (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-877), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon [\*\*91] Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For John Shelton (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-878), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Michele Shelton (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-878), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Lisa Hanratty (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-879), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Joseph Hanratty (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-879), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez

McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Lisa Fitch (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-882), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon [\*\*92] Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Bobby Fitch (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-882), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Christy Sessoms (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-883), Plaintiff: Rick Barreca, LEAD ATTORNEY, Bern Ripka LLP, New York, NY; Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Latiesha Parsons, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv887, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Terry Hoke, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv891, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Steven Bushman (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-890), Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Arinda Hoke, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv891, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez [\*\*93] McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Marty Ray Wheeler, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv889, Plaintiff: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL; Julia Reed-Zaic, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heaviside Reed Zaic, Laguna Beach, CA.

For Lisa Hyde, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv893, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Mark E Hyde, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv893, Plaintiff:

Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA;  
Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh  
LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Michelle L Grant, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv899,  
Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Steve Brown, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv899, Plaintiff:  
John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte,  
Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Sylvia Brito (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-900, Plaintiff:  
John A Dalimonte, [\*\*94] LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Victor Brito (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-900), Plaintiff:  
John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon & Dalimonte,  
Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Debra Zamsky (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-901),  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Michael Zamsky (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-901),  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Cory Behlke (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-902), Plaintiff:  
Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA;  
Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh  
LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Britt Sherfy (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-904), Plaintiff:  
Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA;  
Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh  
LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For David Lee Story [\*\*95] (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-  
904), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez

McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Jennifer L Lentz (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-903),  
Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Daniel P Lentz (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-903,  
Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Jennifer Fulton-Wolcott (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-  
905), Plaintiff: Robert M Hammers, Jr, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Jason Schneider PC, Atlanta, GA.

For Karin N Lisowski (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-906),  
Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Ronald M Lisowski (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-906),  
Plaintiff: John A Dalimonte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Karon &  
Dalimonte, Boston, MA; Teresa C Toriseva, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Toriseva Law, Wheeling, WV.

For Amanda Boutin, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv913, Plaintiff:  
Don K Ledgard, LEAD ATTORNEY, Capretz &  
Associates, [\*\*96] Newport Beach, CA; Robert Williams  
Goldwater, LEAD ATTORNEY, III, Goldwater Law Firm  
PC, Scottsdale, AZ.

For Christine Kiscadden, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv919,  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Shelly LaDawn McCabe (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-  
918), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Susan Mae Engroff (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-920),  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Joseph J Engroff (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-920),  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,

CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Beverly Lusk, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv921, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*97] Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Richard Lee Lusk, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv921, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For David Pearson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv923, Plaintiff: Michael G Daly, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pogust Braslow & Millrood LLC, Conshohocken, PA; T Matthew Leckman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pogust Braslow & Millrood LLC, Conshohocken, PA.

Jahnunice Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv925, Plaintiff, Pro se.

For Jahnunice Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv925, Plaintiff: Stephen Barnett Murray, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Murray Law Firm, New Orleans, LA.

For Judy Elaine Painter (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-922), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Donald Eugene Painter (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-922), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Marcia Northern (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-926), Plaintiff: [\*\*98] David A Onstott, LEAD ATTORNEY, Murray Law Firm, New Orleans, LA; Stephen Barnett Murray, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Murray Law Firm, New Orleans, LA.

Jeff M Edwards, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv953, Plaintiff, Pro se, Austin, TX.

For Tara Schneider, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv955, Plaintiff: Eric M Terry, LEAD ATTORNEY, TorHoerman Law LLC - Edwardsville, IL, Edwardsville, IL.

For Tricia Hutchins, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv965, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Kevin E Hutchins, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv965, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Heidi Reck, ND GA - 1:15cv4398; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv966, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA; Stephen Grant Daniel, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm, Houston, TX.

For Alex Alexander, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv967, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*99] Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Joedy Gardner, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv971, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Tammy Gardner, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv971, Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Joyce Teague, SD TX - 4:16cv658; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv987, Plaintiff: Matthew Paul Skrabanek, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pierce Skrabanek Bruera, PLLC, Houston, TX.

For Michael D Stringer, NJ - 2:16cv913; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv988, Plaintiff: Nicholas Rocco Farnolo, LEAD ATTORNEY, Napoli Shkolnik, Melville, NY.

For Thomas Kroeger (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1000), Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Lynn A Kroeger (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1000),

Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*100] Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Denine Callihan, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1005, Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL.

For Denise Jolly, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1007, Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL.

For Roger Presswood, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1009, Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL.

For Cynthia Bradbury (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1006), Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, [\*\*101] FL.

For Jolene Morris (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1008), Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL.

For Wanda Rossmiller (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1010), Plaintiff: Jeff R Gaddy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL; Matthew David Schultz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Levin Papantonio Thomas Mitchell Rafferty & Proctor PA, Pensacola, FL.

For James Edward Pugh (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1016), Plaintiff: Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP, New York, NY; Wendy R Fleishman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP, New York, NY.

For Elizabeth Ann Grave, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1017, Plaintiff: Daniel Seltz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP, New York, NY.

For Vickie Mason, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1031, Plaintiff: Jason P Johnston, LEAD ATTORNEY, Meshbesh & Spence Limited, Minneapolis, MN.

For Albert Johnson, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1035, Plaintiff: Jonathan D Peck, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lowe Law Group, Ogden, UT; Nathan Buttars, [\*\*102] LEAD ATTORNEY, Lowe Law Group, Ogden, UT.

For Tracie Johnson, Plaintiff: Jonathan D Peck, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lowe Law Group, Ogden, UT; Nathan Buttars, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lowe Law Group, Ogden, UT.

For Kari Rae Wickstrom (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1038), Plaintiff: Kenneth W Pearson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Michael K Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Rolf T Fiebiger, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For David Wickstrom (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1038), Plaintiff: Kenneth W Pearson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Michael K Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN; Rolf T Fiebiger, LEAD ATTORNEY, Johnson Becker PLLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For Donna Brooks, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1049, Plaintiff: M Blair Clinton, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heninger Garrison Davison LLC - Birmingham AL, Birmingham, AL.

For Connie Bolton, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1051, Plaintiff: M Blair Clinton, LEAD ATTORNEY, Heninger Garrison Davison LLC - Birmingham AL, Birmingham, AL.

For Jennifer M Micek (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1054), Plaintiff: Brendan J Flaherty, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pritzker Olsen PA, Minneapolis, MN; David J Szerlag, [\*\*103] LEAD ATTORNEY, Szerlag Law Offices, Cranston, RI.

For Joseph J Micek (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1054), Plaintiff: Brendan J Flaherty, LEAD ATTORNEY, Pritzker Olsen PA, Minneapolis, MN; David J Szerlag, LEAD ATTORNEY, Szerlag Law Offices, Cranston, RI.

For Raymond Leon Mitchell, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1077, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Judy Mitchell, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1077, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Prentiss E Mangum, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1078, Plaintiff: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

Sarah Mangum, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1078, Plaintiff, Pro se.

For James Warner Callaway, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1079, Plaintiff: Ethan L Shaw, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Justin W Fishback, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX; Matthew J Riley, LEAD ATTORNEY, Shaw Cowart LLP, Austin, TX.

For Birdie Crathers, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1085, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, [\*\*104] LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Melissa Czarnecki, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1086, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For James Andersen, AZ Case Number - 2:16cv1087, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Scott Davis, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1089, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & [\*\*105] Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Bernardette McBride, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1090, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Timothy Case, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1091, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Margaret B Buxbaum, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1092, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, [\*\*106] AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

Bennett I Buxbaum, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1092, Plaintiff, Pro se.

For David Burton Fish, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1093, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Jill Broome Fish, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1093, Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD

ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ;  
Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy  
PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Gary [\*\*107] L Bussell, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1094,  
Plaintiff: C Lincoln Combs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher  
& Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Mark Stephen O'Connor,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix,  
AZ; Paul Lincoln Stoller, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher &  
Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ; Robert W Boatman, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy PA, Phoenix, AZ;  
Shannon L Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gallagher & Kennedy  
PA, Phoenix, AZ.

For Shelley A Docimo, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1095,  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Marline Prather, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1097,  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach,  
CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez  
McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Karen Miller (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1096),  
Plaintiff: J Mark Kell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Kell Lampin  
LLC, St. Peters, MO; Lucas James Ude, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Kell Lampin LLC, St. Peters, MO.

For Tiffany Hall, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1099, Plaintiff:  
Jacob Levy, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gray & White, Louisville,  
KY; Mark K Gray, LEAD ATTORNEY, Gray & White,  
Louisville, [\*\*108] KY; Matthew White, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Gray & White, Louisville, KY.

For Shawn White (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1100),  
Plaintiff: Eric Roslansky, LEAD ATTORNEY, Ruth Law  
Team, St Petersburg, FL.

Janet Lynn White (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1100),  
Plaintiff, Pro se.

For April Dilworth, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1114, Plaintiff:  
Don K Ledgard, LEAD ATTORNEY, Capretz & Associates,  
Newport Beach, CA.

For Timothy Miller, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1115,  
Plaintiff: David M Langevin, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
McSweeney Langevin LLC, Minneapolis, MN; Rhett A  
McSweeney, LEAD ATTORNEY, McSweeney Langevin  
LLC, Minneapolis, MN.

For John Malestky, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1121, Plaintiff:  
Richard W Schulte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wright & Schulte  
LLC, Vandalia, OH.

For Debbie Malestky, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1121,  
Plaintiff: Richard W Schulte, LEAD ATTORNEY, Wright &  
Schulte LLC, Vandalia, OH.

For Deborah Block, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1131, Plaintiff:  
Joseph A Osborne, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Osborne &  
Associates, Boca Raton, FL.

For Brigitte Tsomos (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1132),  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ryan McCarley, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Fears Nachawati PLLC, Dallas, TX.

For Georgios Tsomos (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1132),  
Plaintiff: Matthew Ryan McCarley, [\*\*109] LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Fears Nachawati PLLC, Dallas, TX.

For Kevin Lenners (AZ Member Case - 2:16-cv-1134),  
Plaintiff: Brian E Tadtman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Peterson &  
Associates PC, Kansas City, MO; David M Peterson, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Peterson & Associates PC, Kansas City, MO;  
Nicholas Clevenger, LEAD ATTORNEY, Peterson &  
Associates PC, Kansas City, MO.

For C R Bard Incorporated, Defendant: Aaron A Clark,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, McGrath North Law Firm, Omaha, NE;  
Alex Cameron Walker, LEAD ATTORNEY, Modrall  
Sperling Roehl Harris & Sisk PA, Albuquerque, NM;  
Amanda Christine Sheridan, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snell &  
Wilmer LLP - Phoenix, AZ, Phoenix, AZ; Andrew J  
Trevelise, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP -  
Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Angela M Higgins,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Baker Sterchi Cowden & Rice LLC -  
Kansas City, MO, Kansas City, MO; Brandee J Kowalzyk,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough  
LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Catherine A Faught Pollard,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Quarles & Brady LLP - Milwaukee,  
WI, Milwaukee, WI; Christopher Brian Watt, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Houston, TX, Houston, TX;  
Daniel K Winters, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP -  
New York, NY, New York, NY; David J Cooner, LEAD  
ATTORNEY, [\*\*110] McCarter & English LLP - Newark,  
NJ, Newark, NJ; David W Ledyard, LEAD ATTORNEY,  
Strong Pipkin Bissell & Ledyard - Beaumont, TX, Beaumont,  
TX; David J Walz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields  
Jordan Burt PA - Tampa, FL, Tampa, FL; Debra A Djupman,  
LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Philadelphia, PA,  
Philadelphia, PA; Diana Rabeh, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed  
Smith LLP - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE; Edward W  
Gerecke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt PA



- Tampa, FL, Tampa, FL; Elizabeth S Fenton, LEAD ATTORNEY, Chamberlain Hrdlicka, W Conshohocken, PA; Elizabeth C Helm, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Eric J Buhr, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Gary Robert Tulp, LEAD ATTORNEY, McCarter & English LLP - Newark, NJ, Newark, NJ; James P Catalano, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Nashville, TN, Nashville, TN; James R Condo, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snell & Wilmer LLP - Phoenix, AZ, Phoenix, AZ; James F Rogers, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Columbia, SC, Columbia, SC; Jane T Davis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Charleston, SC, Charleston, SC; Jennifer [\*\*111] Ann Guidea, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - New York, NY, New York, NY; Jennifer J Hageman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Ulmer & Berne LLP - Cincinnati, OH, Cincinnati, OH; John A Camp, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt - Miami, FL, Miami, FL; John Andrew LaBoon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Segal McCambridge Singer & Mahoney Limited - Austin, TX, Austin, TX; John G Mitchell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Secrest Wardle, Troy, MI; Jordan L Chaikin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Parker Waichman LLP - Bonita Springs, FL, Bonita Springs, FL; Kara Trouslot Stubbs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baker Sterchi Cowden & Rice LLC - Kansas City, MO, Kansas City, MO; Kevin M Hara, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - San Francisco, CA 2nd St., San Francisco, CA; Kevin George Lohman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Lyn Peoples Pruitt, LEAD ATTORNEY, Mitchell Williams Selig Gates & Woodyard PLLC, Little Rock, AR; Mark A Sentenac, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - San Francisco, CA 2nd St., San Francisco, CA; Matthew E Brown, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Boston, MA, Boston, MA; Matthew B Lerner, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Melanie M Atha, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*112] Cabaniss Johnston Gardner Dumas & ONeal LLP, Birmingham, AL; Melissa Dorman Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hartline Dacus Dreyer & Kern LLP, Dallas, TX; Michael Kevin Brown, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Neville H Boschert, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jones Walker Waechter Poitevent Carrere & Denegre, Jackson, MS; Patrick T Clendenen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Boston, MA, Boston, MA; Raymond G Mullady, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Washington, DC, Washington, DC; Richard B North, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Ruth A Horvatich, LEAD ATTORNEY, McGrath North Law Firm, Omaha, NE; Sanjay

Ghosh, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Steven James Boranian, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - San Francisco, CA 2nd St., San Francisco, CA; Taylor Tapley Daly, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Thomas Melone, LEAD ATTORNEY, Allco Renewable Energy Limited, New York, NY; Tiffany L Roach Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, MNodrall Sperling Roehl Harris & Sisk PA - Santa Fe, NM, Santa FE, NM; [\*\*113] Vivian M Quinn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nixon Peabody LLP - Buffalo NY, Buffalo, NY.

For Bard Peripheral Vascular Incorporated, Defendant: Aaron A Clark, LEAD ATTORNEY, McGrath North Law Firm, Omaha, NE; Alex Cameron Walker, LEAD ATTORNEY, Modrall Sperling Roehl Harris & Sisk PA, Albuquerque, NM; Amanda Christine Sheridan, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snell & Wilmer LLP - Phoenix, AZ, Phoenix, AZ; Andrew J Trevelise, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Angela M Higgins, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baker Sterchi Cowden & Rice LLC - Kansas City, MO, Kansas City, MO; Brandee J Kowalzyk, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Catherine A Faught Pollard, LEAD ATTORNEY, Quarles & Brady LLP - Milwaukee, WI, Milwaukee, WI; Christopher Brian Watt, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Houston, TX, Houston, TX; Daniel K Winters, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - New York, NY, New York, NY; David J Cooner, LEAD ATTORNEY, McCarter & English LLP - Newark, NJ, Newark, NJ; David W Ledyard, LEAD ATTORNEY, Strong Pipkin Bissell & Ledyard - Beaumont, TX, Beaumont, TX; David J Walz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt PA - Tampa, FL, Tampa, FL; Debra A Djupman, LEAD [\*\*114] ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Philadelphia, PA, Philadelphia, PA; Diana Rabeh, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE; Edward W Gerecke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt PA - Tampa, FL, Tampa, FL; Elizabeth S Fenton, LEAD ATTORNEY, Chamberlain Hrdlicka, W Conshohocken, PA; Elizabeth C Helm, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Eric J Buhr, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Gary Robert Tulp, LEAD ATTORNEY, McCarter & English LLP - Newark, NJ, Newark, NJ; James P Catalano, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Nashville, TN, Nashville, TN; James R Condo, LEAD ATTORNEY, Snell & Wilmer LLP - Phoenix, AZ, Phoenix, AZ; James F Rogers, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Columbia, SC, Columbia, SC; Jane T Davis, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP -

Charleston, SC, Charleston, SC; Jennifer Ann Guidea, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - New York, NY, New York, NY; Jennifer J Hageman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Ulmer & Berne LLP - Cincinnati, OH, Cincinnati, OH; John A Camp, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt - Miami, FL, Miami, FL; John [\*\*115] Andrew LaBoon, LEAD ATTORNEY, Segal McCambridge Singer & Mahoney Limited - Austin, TX, Austin, TX; John G Mitchell, LEAD ATTORNEY, Secrest Wardle, Troy, MI; Kara Trouslot Stubbs, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baker Sterchi Cowden & Rice LLC - Kansas City, MO, Kansas City, MO; Kevin M Hara, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - San Francisco, CA 2nd St., San Francisco, CA; Kevin George Lohman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Lyn Peeples Pruitt, LEAD ATTORNEY, Mitchell Williams Selig Gates & Woodyard PLLC, Little Rock, AR; Mark A Sentenac, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - San Francisco, CA 2nd St., San Francisco, CA; Matthew E Brown, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Boston, MA, Boston, MA; Matthew B Lerner, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Melanie M Atha, LEAD ATTORNEY, Cabaniss Johnston Gardner Dumas & ONeal LLP, Birmingham, AL; Melissa Dorman Matthews, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hartline Dacus Dreyer & Kern LLP, Dallas, TX; Michael Kevin Brown, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - Los Angeles, CA, Los Angeles, CA; Neville H Boschert, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jones WalkerWaechter Poitevent Carrere & Denegre, Jackson, MS; Patrick [\*\*116] T Clendenen, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Boston, MA, Boston, MA; Raymond G Mullady, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP - Washington, DC, Washington, DC; Richard B North, LEAD ATTORNEY, Jr, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Ruth A Horvatich, LEAD ATTORNEY, McGrath North Law Firm, Omaha, NE; Sanjay Ghosh, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Steven James Boranian, LEAD ATTORNEY, Reed Smith LLP - San Francisco, CA 2nd St., San Francisco, CA; Taylor Tapley Daly, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA; Thomas Melone, LEAD ATTORNEY, Allco Renewable Energy Limited, New York, NY; Tiffany L Roach Martin, LEAD ATTORNEY, MNodrall Sperling Roehl Harris & Sisk PA - Santa Fe, NM, Santa FE, NM; Vivian M Quinn, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nixon Peabody LLP - Buffalo NY, Buffalo, NY.

For Christian Mottas (MD FL - 3:15cv1086) an individual, Defendant: David J Walz, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt PA - Tampa, FL, Tampa, FL; Edward W

Gerecke, LEAD ATTORNEY, Carlton Fields Jordan Burt PA - Tampa, FL, Tampa, FL; Matthew B Lerner, LEAD ATTORNEY, [\*\*117] Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLC - Atlanta, GA, Atlanta, GA.

For Christiana Care Health Services Incorporated, DE - 1:15cv968; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv336, Defendant: Christine Kane, LEAD ATTORNEY, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE; John D Balaguer, LEAD ATTORNEY, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE.

For Christiana Care Health Systems Incorporated, DE - 1:15cv968; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv336, Defendant: Christine Kane, LEAD ATTORNEY, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE; John D Balaguer, LEAD ATTORNEY, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE.

For Thomas Bauer, Defendant: M.D. (DE - 1:15cv968; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv336) Christine Kane, LEAD ATTORNEY, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE; John D Balaguer, LEAD ATTORNEY, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE.

For Cynthia Heldt, Defendant: M.D. (DE - 1:15cv968; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv336) John D Balaguer, White & Williams - Wilmington, DE, Wilmington, DE.

For ND CA - 4:15cv5189; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv344, Defendant: Hilary E Youngblood, LEAD ATTORNEY, Davidovitz & Bennett, San Francisco, CA; Robert Diemer, LEAD ATTORNEY, Davidovitz & Bennett, San Francisco, [\*\*118] CA.

For Christy Van Brocklin, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv523, Defendant: Troy Alexander Brenes, LEAD ATTORNEY, Brenes Law Group, Aliso Viejo, CA.

For Lawrence L Schmetterer, Defendant: M.D., ND OH - 4:16cv579; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv786 Michael Ockerman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Hanna Campbell & Powell, Akron, OH.

For Shane Tice, NJ - 3:15cv8669; AZ Member Case - 2:16cv-832, Defendant: Sherri L Plotkin, LEAD ATTORNEY, Rheingold Valet Rheingold McCartney & Giuffra LLP, New York, NY.

For Georgia Ann Alexander, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv967, Defendant: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez

McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Tami Sheets, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1088, Defendant: Willard J Moody, Jr., LEAD ATTORNEY, Moody Law Firm Inc, Portsmouth, VA.

For Anthony C Docimo, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1095, Defendant: Matthew Ramon Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP - Newport Beach, CA, Newport Beach, CA; Ramon Rossi Lopez, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lopez McHugh LLP, Newport Beach, CA.

For Phyllis Young, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1151, Defendant: Michael Brandon Smith, LEAD ATTORNEY, Childers Schlueter & Smith LLC, Atlanta, GA.

For Andrea **[\*\*119]** Bunker, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1257, Defendant: Yvonne M Flaherty, LEAD ATTORNEY, Lockridge Grindel Nauen PLLP - Minneapolis, MN, Minneapolis, MN.

For James Borck, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1295, Defendant: Annesley H DeGaris, LEAD ATTORNEY, DeGaris Law Group LLC, Birmingham, AL.

For Anthony Williams, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv1361, Defendant: Laura J Baughman, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX; Russell W Budd, LEAD ATTORNEY, Baron & Budd PC, Dallas, TX.

For Matt Chance, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv2255, Defendant: Joseph R Johnson, LEAD ATTORNEY, Babbitt & Johnson PA, W Palm Beach, FL.

For Irene Moore White, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv2580, Defendant: Howard L Nations, LEAD ATTORNEY, Nations Law Firm - Houston, TX, Houston, TX.

For Rita Dempsey, AZ Member Case - 2:16cv3150, Defendant: Joseph N Williams, LEAD ATTORNEY.

**Judges:** David G. Campbell, United States District Judge.

**Opinion by:** David G. Campbell

## Opinion

**[\*563] WO**

### ORDER

The Court held a fifth case management conference with the parties on August 23, 2016. In preparation for the conference,

the parties provided a joint status report that identified a number of issues for discussion. Doc. 3102. The report noted that the parties disagree on the discoverability of certain electronically **[\*\*120]** stored information ("ESI") generated by foreign entities (subsidiaries or divisions of Defendant C.R. Bard) that sell IVC filters abroad. Plaintiffs seek discovery of communications between the foreign entities and foreign regulatory bodies regarding the IVC filters at issue in this case. Doc. 3264 at 2. The Court discussed this topic at some length during the status conference on August 23, 2016, and directed the parties to provide focused briefing. Each side has now filed a memorandum addressing this issue. Docs. 3309, 3326. For the reasons set forth below, the Court will deny Plaintiffs' request for this discovery.

### I. New Legal Standards Governing the Scope of Discovery.

*Rule 26(b)(1) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure* was amended on December 1, 2015. The new rule defines the scope of permissible discovery as follows:

Parties may obtain discovery regarding any non-privileged matter that is relevant to any party's claim or defense and proportional to the needs of the case, considering the importance of the issues at stake in the action, the amount in controversy, the party's access to relevant information, the party's resources, the importance of the discovery in resolving the issues, and whether the burden and expense of the proposed **[\*\*121]** discovery outweighs its likely benefit.

*Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(1).*

#### A. Relevancy.

To be discoverable under the first part of this test, information must be "relevant to any party's claim or defense." *Id.* This language has not changed from the previous version of *Rule 26(b)(1)*.

Before the 2015 amendments, *Rule 26(b)(1)* also provided that inadmissible evidence was discoverable if it "appears reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence." Some courts — and many lawyers — used this language to define the scope of discovery. *See, e.g., Survivor Media, Inc. v. Survivor Prods., 406 F.3d 625, 635 (9th Cir. 2005)* ("Relevant information for purposes of discovery is information 'reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence.'") (quoting *Brown Bag Software v. Symantec Corp., 960 F.2d 1465, 1470 (9th Cir. 1992)*).

This phrase was eliminated by the 2015 amendments and replaced with a more direct declaration of the phrase's original intent: "Information within this scope of discovery need not be admissible in evidence to be discoverable." *Fed. R. Civ. P.*

26(b)(1). The Advisory Committee on the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure provided this explanation for the deletion:

The former provision for discovery of relevant but inadmissible information that appears "reasonably calculated to lead to the [\*564] discovery of admissible evidence" is also deleted. The phrase has been used by some, [\*\*122] incorrectly, to define the scope of discovery. As the Committee Note to the 2000 amendments observed, use of the "reasonably calculated" phrase to define the scope of discovery "might swallow any other limitation on the scope of discovery." The 2000 amendments sought to prevent such misuse by adding the word "relevant" at the beginning of the sentence, making clear that "relevant" means within the scope of discovery as defined in this subdivision . . . ." The "reasonably calculated" phrase has continued to create problems, however, and is removed by these amendments.

Rule 26, Advis. Comm. Notes for 2015 Amends.

The 2015 amendments thus eliminated the "reasonably calculated" phrase as a definition for the scope of permissible discovery. Despite this clear change, many courts continue to use the phrase. Old habits die hard.<sup>1</sup> In this circuit, courts cite two Ninth Circuit cases — Survivor Media, Inc. v. Survivor Prods., 406 F.3d 625, 635 (9th Cir. 2005), and Brown Bag

Software v. Symantec Corp., 960 F.2d 1465, 1470 (9th Cir. 1992) — for the proposition that information is relevant for purposes of Rule 26(b)(1) if it is "reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence."<sup>2</sup> But these cases, and others like them, simply applied the earlier version of Rule 26(b)(1).

Amended Rule 26(b)(1) was adopted pursuant to the Rules Enabling Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2072, et. seq. That statute provides that "[a]ll laws in conflict with such rules shall be of no further force or effect after such rules have taken effect." *Id.*, § 2072(b). Thus, just as a statute could effectively overrule cases applying a former legal standard, the 2015 amendment effectively abrogated cases applying a prior version of Rule 26(b)(1). The test going forward is whether evidence is "relevant to any party's claim or defense," not whether it is "reasonably calculated to lead to admissible evidence." [\*\*124]

## B. Proportionality.

The 2015 amendments also added proportionality as a requirement for permissible discovery. Relevancy alone is no longer sufficient — discovery must also be proportional to the needs of the case. The Advisory Committee Note makes clear, however, that the amendment does not place the burden of proving proportionality on the party seeking discovery. The amendment "does not change the existing responsibilities of the court and the parties to consider proportionality, and the change does not place on the party seeking discovery the burden addressing all proportionality considerations." Rule 26, Advis. Comm. Notes for 2015 Amends. Rather, "[t]he parties and the court have a collective responsibility to consider the proportionality of all discovery and consider it in resolving discovery disputes." *Id.*

The inquiry to be conducted under the proportionality requirement, therefore, requires input from both sides. As the Advisory Committee explained:

[\*565] A party claiming undue burden or expense ordinarily has far better information — perhaps the only information — with respect to that part of the determination. A party claiming that a request is important to resolve the issues should be able to [\*\*125] explain the ways in which the underlying information bears on the issues as that party understands them. The court's responsibility, using all the information provided by the parties, is to consider these and all the other

---

<sup>1</sup>Last month alone, seven cases relied on the "reasonably calculated" language to define [\*\*123] the scope of permissible discovery. See FastVDO LLC v. AT&T Mobility LLC, No. 16-CV-385-H (WVG), 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 117695, 2016 WL 4542747, at \*2 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 31, 2016); Sierra Club v. BNSF Ry. Co., No. C13-0967-JCC, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 116716, 2016 WL 4528452, at \*1 (W.D. Wash. Aug. 30, 2016); Shell v. Ohio Family Rights, No. 1:15-CV-1757, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 115537, 2016 WL 4523830, at \*2 (N.D. Ohio Aug. 29, 2016); Arrow Enter. Computing Sols., Inc. v. BlueAlly, LLC, No. 5:15-CV-00037-FL, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 107930, 2016 WL 4287929, at \*1 (E.D.N.C. Aug. 15, 2016); Ecomission Sols., LLC v. CTS Holdings, Inc., No. MISC. 16-1793 (EGS), 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 114919, 2016 WL 4506974, at \*1 (D.D.C. Aug. 26, 2016); Clouser v. Golden Gate Nat'l Senior Care, LLC, No. CV 3:15-33, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 104566, 2016 WL 4223755, at \*4 (W.D. Pa. Aug. 9, 2016); Scott Hutchinson Enters. v. Cranberry Pipeline Corp., No. 3:15-CV-13415, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 104773, 2016 WL 4203555, at \*2 (S.D.W. Va. Aug. 9, 2016). Several other cases cited the language as though it were still part of Rule 26(b)(1). See Fairley v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., No. CV 15-462, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 110647, 2016 WL 4418799, at \*2 (E.D. La. Aug. 19, 2016); Kuczak v. City of Trotwood, Ohio, No. 3:13-CV-101, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 115573, 2016 WL 4500715, at \*1 (S.D. Ohio Aug. 26, 2016); Kubik v. Cent. Michigan Univ. Bd. of Trustees, No. 15-CV-12055, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 111318, 2016 WL 4425174, at \*2 (E.D. Mich. Aug. 22, 2016).

---

<sup>2</sup>See FastVDO LLC, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 117695, 2016 WL 4542747, at \*2 (quoting Survivor Media, 406 F.3d at 635); Sierra Club, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 116716, 2016 WL 4528452, at \*1 (quoting Brown Bag, 960 F.2d at 1470).

factors in reaching a case-specific determination of the appropriate scope of discovery.

*Id.* The Court therefore will look to evidence and arguments from both sides in deciding whether discovery from the Bard foreign entities is permitted under Rule 26.

## II. Analysis.

### A. Relevancy.

From the information provided by the parties, it appears that most of Defendants' regulatory communications, including communications with foreign regulators, are generated by Defendants' United States operations, which have been and continue to be subject to extensive discovery. Robert Carr, the key Bard witness on this issue, explained that the relevant Bard division within the United States "handles the regulatory burden" for a particular product. Doc. 3311-1 at 4. The division supplies "all the required documentation" to foreign Bard entities, and the foreign entities then share that information with foreign regulators. *Id.* Some foreign entities have their own regulatory staff, but Bard's United States operations "supply all the pertinent information, answer all the questions. They provide the documentation and translations back and forth." *Id.* at 11.

Carr further explained that there are regulatory persons on every Bard product development team, and that "they determine the potential regulatory pathway for a product being developed early on." *Id.* at 13. "[T]hroughout the project, they identify the required standards that need to be met in countries that we know we're going to go to, because testing requirements are different in different countries." *Id.* at 14. "And then at the end of the project they would put together the supporting documentation to allow themselves to file in America and . . . the other international regulatory groups to file in their particular countries using our data. And they would liaise with them throughout that approval process globally." *Id.* at 14.

Documents submitted by the parties support Bard's assertion that regulatory communications are largely controlled from within the United States. For example, Exhibit F to Defendants' memorandum is an email chain showing Bard employees within the United States compiling information to respond to inquiries made by a regulator in Great Britain. Doc. 3313-7. [\*\*127]

It also appears, however, that employees in foreign entities sometimes engage in their own communications with foreign regulators. Mr. Carr provided this testimony about when Bard's foreign personnel could have communications with foreign regulators that are different from the communications

prepared in the United States:

Q. There's not a single place where they would be different?

A. If the indication for use, which is a regulatory term, defines how and where a product can be used, how a filter can be used, if it happens to have a different indication for use in a different country, then that's possible. And so they would be able to change that information. Japan is a common example of that.

Q. Okay.

A. They will change wording and things like that, that's based on the Japanese regulatory approval, not necessarily marketing effort.

Q. Sure. They have to get a change in an IFU approved by BPV or C.R. Bard before they can do it?

A. No, they approve it at their level.

Doc. 3266 at 10-11.

This exchange suggests that employees in foreign Bard entities at least sometimes communicate with foreign regulators on their own. This fact is confirmed by Exhibit 4 to Plaintiffs' memorandum. It is a communication [\*\*128] from David Marshall, an employee of Bard in Great Britain, recounting communications he had with British regulators regarding Bard filters. Doc. 3266 at 13.

[\*566] For purposes of this discovery dispute, the Court concludes that most of the communications with foreign regulators originate in the United States and thus will be captured by the ESI searches currently underway. There do appear, however, to be some communications that originate abroad and may not be captured in the current searches.

The Court also finds, however, that the relevancy of these communications is uncertain for at least two reasons. First, there are no Plaintiffs in this MDL from foreign countries. All plaintiffs received their Bard filters and allegedly were injured in the United States. Second, Plaintiffs seek communications with foreign regulators for a narrow purpose — to determine if any of those communications have been inconsistent with Defendants' communications with American regulators. It is inconsistency that Plaintiff's seek to discover.

Courts generally recognize that relevancy for purposes of discovery is broader than relevancy for purposes of trial. Even still, the Court concludes that the discovery sought [\*\*129] by Plaintiffs is only marginally relevant. With no foreign-based Plaintiffs, and mere conjecture that communications between foreign entities and foreign regulators might be inconsistent with Defendants' communications with American regulators, the discovery appears to be only potentially relevant — more hope than likelihood.

### B. Proportionality.

Rule 26(b)(1) identifies several factors to be considered in addressing proportionality. Plaintiffs have addressed some of those factors in the evidence cited above. The "importance of the discovery in resolving the issues," as the Court has explained, appears marginal. The parties "relative access to relevant information" favors Plaintiffs, but only in Defendants' possession of possibly relevant information.

Defendants argue that the burden or expense of the proposed discovery outweighs its likely benefit, and they provide some specifics. They note that Bard has entities in Canada, Korea, Australia, India, Singapore, Malaysia, Italy, Ireland, the United Kingdom, Denmark, the Netherlands, Sweden, Norway, Finland, Mexico, Chile, Brazil, and China. Doc. 3309 at 6 n.6. Plaintiffs seek discovery of all communications these entities have had with foreign regulatory [\*\*130] authorities involving all Bard IVC filters since 2003. *Id.* To comply with Plaintiffs' requests, Defendants assert that they would be required to identify the applicable custodians from these foreign entities for the last 13 years, collect ESI from these custodians, and search for and identify communications with foreign regulators. The Court is persuaded by these specifics that the burden of this foreign discovery would be substantial.

Plaintiffs are engaging in substantial discovery with respect to Defendants' communications with American regulators, including extensive ESI searches and depositions of relevant witnesses. This discovery should capture communications with foreign regulators that originate in the United States, as most appear to. The Court concludes that the burden and expense of searching ESI from 18 foreign entities over a 13-year period outweighs the benefit of the proposed discovery — a mere possibility of finding a foreign communications inconsistent with United States communication.

Because the proposed discovery is not proportional to the needs of the case considering the factors set forth in Rule 26(b)(1), the Court concludes that Defendants need not search the ESI of foreign [\*\*131] Bard entities for communications with foreign regulators.

Dated this 16th day of September, 2016.

/s/ David G. Campbell

David G. Campbell

United States District Judge