

# RATINGS OF ARTICLE III JUDICIAL NOMINEES

## 109<sup>TH</sup> CONGRESS

Last Updated: 1/10/2008

### Key to ABA Rating

WQ = Well Qualified; Q = Qualified; NQ = Not Qualified; sm = substantial majority; m = majority; min = minority  
**Circuit court nominees are printed in bold.**

Unanimous committee ratings appear as a single rating. In other situations, the rating from the majority or substantial majority (constituting ten to thirteen votes) of the committee is recorded first, followed by the rating or ratings of a minority of the committee. The majority rating is the rating of the committee.

### FIRST SESSION

| DATE NOMINATED | NAME OF NOMINEE  | COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED           | ABA RATING   |
|----------------|--|------------------------------------|--|
| 2/14/05        | <b>Boyle, Terrence William (NC)</b><br><small>(Returned 8/3/06, renominated 9/5/06)</small>  | <b>Fourth Circuit</b>              | <sup>+</sup> Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup><br>(1 recusal) |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Haynes, William James II (VA)</b><br><small>(Returned 8/3/06, renominated 9/5/06)</small> | <b>Fourth Circuit</b>              | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Owen, Priscilla Richman (TX)</b>  | <b>Fifth Circuit</b>               | WQ   |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Griffin, Richard A. (MI)</b>  | <b>Sixth Circuit</b>               | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | <b>McKeague, David W. (MI)</b>   | <b>Sixth Circuit</b>               | WQ   |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Neilson, Susan Bieke (MI)</b>   | <b>Sixth Circuit</b>               | WQ   |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Saad, Henry W. (MI)</b>   | <b>Sixth Circuit</b>               | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Myers, William Gerry III (ID)</b><br><small>(Returned 8/3/06, renominated 9/5/06)</small> | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>               | Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Pryor, William Holcombe Jr. (AL)</b>  | <b>Eleventh Circuit</b>            | Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Brown, Janice R. (CA)</b>   | <b>DC Circuit</b>                  | Q <sup>m</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>                              |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Griffith, Thomas Beall (UT)</b>   | <b>DC Circuit</b>                  | Q <sup>m</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>                              |
| 2/14/05        | <b>Kavanaugh, Brett M. (MD)</b><br><small>(Returned 12/21/05, renominated 1/25/06)</small>   | <b>DC Circuit</b>                  | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | Seabright, John Michael  | USDC: District of Hawaii           | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>                             |
| 2/14/05        | Ryan, Daniel Patrick   | USDC: Eastern District of Michigan | **NQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>                           |
| 2/14/05        | Ludington, Thomas Lamson   | USDC: Eastern District of Michigan | WQ   |

\* Previous rating was withdrawn 7/17/06.

\*\* The Committee reevaluated this nominee in 2006 and issued the same rating rendered in 2005.

| DATE NOMINATED | NAME OF NOMINEE                    | COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED                           | ABA RATING                                   |
|----------------|------------------------------------|--|--|
| 2/14/05        | Cox, Sean Francis                  | USDC: Eastern District of Michigan                 | WQ   |
| 2/14/05        | Dever, James C. III                | USDC: Eastern District of North Carolina           | Q  |
| 2/14/05        | Conrad, Robert James Jr.           | USDC: Western District of North Carolina           | Q  |
| 2/14/05        | Sheridan, Peter G.                 | USDC: District of New Jersey                       | Q  |
| 2/14/05        | Crotty, Paul Austin                | USDC: Southern District of New York                | WQ   |
| 3/1/05         | Sandoval, Brian Edward             | USDC: District of Nevada                           | WQ <sup>m</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>            |
| 6/8/05         | Smoak, John Richard                | USDC: Northern District of Florida                 | WQ   |
| 7/28/05        | Burgess, Timothy Mark              | USDC: District of Alaska                           | Q  |
| 7/28/05        | Bianco, Joseph Frank               | USDC: Eastern District of New York                 | WQ (1 abstained)                             |
| 7/28/05        | Mattice, Harry Sandlin Jr.         | USDC: Eastern District of Tennessee                | WQ   |
| 7/29/05        | <b><u>Roberts, John G. Jr.</u></b> | <b><u>Associate Justice:<br/>Supreme Court</u></b> | <b>WQ</b>                                    |
| 9/6/05         | <b><u>Roberts, John G. Jr.</u></b> | <b><u>Chief Justice of the United States</u></b>   | <b>WQ</b>                                    |
| 9/13/05        | Van Tatenhove, Gregory F.          | USDC: Eastern District of Kentucky                 | NQ <sup>m</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>            |
| 9/28/05        | Batten, Timothy C. Sr.             | USDC: Northern District of Georgia                 | Q  |
| 9/28/05        | Dubose, Kristi                     | USDC: Southern District of Alabama                 | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>           |
| 9/28/05        | Johnston, Thomas E.                | USDC: Southern District of West Virginia           | Q  |
| 9/28/05        | Kendall, Virginia Mary             | USDC: Northern District of Illinois                | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>           |
| 9/28/05        | Watkins, W. Keith                  | USDC: Middle District of Alabama                   | Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>           |
| 9/29/05        | <b>Payne, James Hardy (OK)</b>     | <b>Tenth Circuit</b>                               | <b>***Q<sup>sm</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>    |
| 10/6/05        | Vitaliano, Eric Nicholas           | USDC: Eastern District of New York                 | Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>           |
| 10/7/05        | <b><u>Miers, Harriet E.</u></b>    | <b><u>Associate Justice:<br/>Supreme Court</u></b> | <b>Withdrawn:<br/>10/28/05<br/>NO RATING</b> |
| 10/25/05       | Delgado-Colon, Aida M.             | USDC: District of Puerto Rico                      | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>           |
| 11/10/05       | <b><u>Alito, Samuel A. Jr.</u></b> | <b><u>Associate Justice:<br/>Supreme Court</u></b> | <b>WQ<br/>(1 recusal)</b>                    |

\*\*\* Previous rating was withdrawn 2/21/06.

| DATE NOMINATED | NAME OF NOMINEE  | COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED             | ABA RATING                         |
|----------------|--|--------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| 11/10/05       | Gordon, Leo Maury  | US Court of International Trade      | WQ                                 |
| 12/14/05       | Schiltz, Patrick Joseph  | USDC: District of Minnesota          | WQ                                 |
| 12/14/05       | Zouhary, Jack  | USDC: Northern District of Ohio      | WQ                                 |
| 12/15/05       | Larson, Stephen G.   | USDC: Central District of California | WQ                                 |
| 12/16/05       | <b>Smith, Norman Randy (ID)</b><br>(Returned 8/3/06, renominated 9/5/06) | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                 | WQ                                 |
| 12/16/05       | Barrett, Michael Ryan  | USDC: Southern District of Ohio      | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup> |

## SECOND SESSION

| DATE NOMINATED | NAME OF NOMINEE   | COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED                 | ABA RATING                              |
|----------------|---|--|---|
| 1/25/06        | <b>Chagares, Michael A. (NJ)</b>  | <b>Third Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ</b>                               |
| 1/25/06        | Bryant, Vanessa L.  | USDC: District of Connecticut            | NQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup> **** |
| 1/25/06        | Bumb, Renee Marie   | USDC: District of New Jersey             | WQ                                      |
| 1/25/06        | Cogan, Brian M.   | USDC: Eastern District of New York       | Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>      |
| 1/25/06        | Golden, Thomas M.   | USDC: Eastern District of Pennsylvania   | WQ                                      |
| 1/25/06        | Guilford, Andrew J.   | USDC: Central District of California     | WQ                                      |
| 1/25/06        | Hillman, Noel Lawrence  | USDC: District of New Jersey             | WQ                                      |
| 1/25/06        | <b>Kavanaugh, Brett M. (MD)</b>   | <b>DC Circuit</b>                        | Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>      |
| 1/25/06        | Miller, Gray Hampton  | USDC: Southern District of Texas         | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>      |
| 1/25/06        | Wigenton, Susan Davis   | USDC: District of New Jersey             | Q <sup>m</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>       |
| 2/8/06         | <b>Ikuta, Sandra Segal (CA)</b>   | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                     | WQ                                      |
| 2/8/06         | <b>Wallace, Michael Brunson (MS)</b><br>(Returned 8/3/06, renominated 9/5/06) | <b>Fifth Circuit</b>                     | NQ                                      |
| 2/14/06        | Holmes, Jerome A.   | USDC: North District of Oklahoma         | Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>      |
| 2/14/06        | <b>Smith, Milan D. Jr. (CA)</b>   | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                     | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>      |
| 2/14/06        | Whitney, Frank D.   | USDC: Western District of North Carolina | Q                                       |

\*\*\*\* Please see the 110<sup>th</sup> Congress Rating Chart for Judge Bryant's current rating.

|         |  |  |  |
|---------|--|--|--|
| 4/24/06 | Jordan, Daniel Porter III              | USDC: Southern District of Mississippi   | Q (1 recusal)                          |
| 4/24/06 | Gutierrez, Philip S.                   | USDC: Central District of California     | WQ                                     |
| 4/24/06 | Gelpi, Gustavo A.                      | USDC: District of Puerto Rico            | Q                                      |
| 4/25/06 | Tydingco-Gatewood, Frances Marie       | District of Guam                         | Q (1 recusal)                          |
| 5/4/06  | <b>Holmes, Jerome A. (OK)</b>          | <b>Tenth Circuit</b>                     | Q                                      |
| 5/4/06  | Baker, Valerie L.                      | USDC: Central District of California     | WQ                                     |
| 5/10/06 | <b>Gorsuch, Neil M. (CO)</b>           | <b>Tenth Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ</b>                              |
| 5/16/06 | Besosa, Francisco Augusto              | USDC: District of Puerto Rico            | WQ                                     |
| 5/18/06 | <b>Shepherd, Bobby E. (AR)</b>         | <b>Eighth Circuit</b>                    | <b>WQ</b>                              |
| 5/18/06 | <b>Moore, Kimberly Ann (VA)</b>        | <b>Federal Circuit</b>                   | <b>Q</b>                               |
| 6/6/06  | Howard, Marcia Morales                 | USDC: Middle District of Florida         | Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>     |
| 6/6/06  | Southwick, Leslie                      | USDC: Southern District of Mississippi   | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>     |
| 6/7/06  | Frizzell, Gregory Kent                 | USDC: Northern District of Oklahoma      | WQ                                     |
| 6/12/06 | Wood, Lisa Godbey                      | USDC: Southern District of Georgia       | WQ                                     |
| 6/28/06 | <b>Livingston, Debra Ann (NY)</b>      | <b>Second Circuit</b>                    | <b>WQ</b>                              |
| 6/28/06 | <b>Jordan, Kent A. (DE)</b>            | <b>Third Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ</b>                              |
| 6/28/06 | <b>Kethledge, Raymond M. (MI)</b>      | <b>Sixth Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b> |
| 6/28/06 | <b>Murphy, Stephen Joseph III (MI)</b> | <b>Sixth Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b> |
| 6/28/06 | Bailey, John Preston                   | USDC: Northern District of West Virginia | Q                                      |
| 6/28/06 | Donohue, Mary O'Connor                 | USDC: Northern District of New York      | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>     |
| 6/28/06 | Jarvey, John Alfred                    | USDC: Southern District of Iowa          | WQ                                     |
| 6/28/06 | Jonker, Robert James                   | USDC: Western District of Michigan       | WQ                                     |
| 6/28/06 | Maloney, Paul Lewis                    | USDC: Western District of Michigan       | WQ                                     |
| 6/28/06 | Neff, Janet T.                         | USDC: Western District of Michigan       | Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>     |
| 6/29/06 | <b>Keisler, Peter D. (MD)</b>          | <b>DC Circuit</b>                        | <b>WQ</b>                              |
| 7/13/06 | Lioi, Sara Elizabeth                   | USDC: Northern District of Ohio          | WQ                                     |
| 7/13/06 | Fischer, Nora Barry                    | USDC: Western District of Pennsylvania   | WQ                                     |
| 8/2/06  | Mauskopf, Roslynn Renee                | USDC: Eastern District of New York       | Q                                      |

|          |                                      |  |  |
|----------|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| 8/2/06   | O'Grady, Liam                        | USDC: Eastern District of Virginia       | WQ                                     |
| 8/2/06   | O'Neill, Lawrence Joseph             | USDC: Eastern District of California     | WQ                                     |
| 9/5/06   | <b>Boyle, Terrence William (NC)</b>  | <b>Fourth Circuit</b>                    | <b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/WQ<sup>min</sup></b> |
| 9/5/06   | <b>Haynes, William James II (VA)</b> | <b>Fourth Circuit</b>                    |  |
| 9/5/06   | <b>Myers, William Gerry III (ID)</b> | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                     |  |
| 9/5/06   | <b>Smith, Norman Randy (ID)</b>      | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ</b>                              |
| 9/5/06   | <b>Wallace, Michael Brunson (MS)</b> | <b>Fifth Circuit</b>                     | <b>NQ</b>                              |
| 9/5/06   | Ozerden, Halil Suleyman              | USDC: Southern District of Mississippi   | Q                                      |
| 9/5/06   | Wright, Otis D. II                   | USDC: Central District of California     | Q                                      |
| 9/5/06   | Wu, George H.                        | USDC: Central District of California     | WQ                                     |
| 9/13/06  | <b>Hardiman, Thomas R. (PA)</b>      | <b>Third Circuit</b>                     | <b>WQ<br/>(1 abstention)</b>           |
| 9/29/06  | Osteen, William Lindsey Jr.          | USDC: Middle District of North Carolina  | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>     |
| 9/29/06  | Reidinger, Martin Karl               | USDC: Western District of North Carolina | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>     |
| 9/29/06  | Schroeder, Thomas D.                 | USDC: Middle District of North Carolina  | WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>     |
| 11/15/06 | <b>Boyle, Terrence William (NC)</b>  | <b>Fourth Circuit</b>                    |  |
| 11/15/06 | <b>Haynes, William James II (VA)</b> | <b>Fourth Circuit</b>                    |  |
| 11/15/06 | <b>Myers, William Gerry III (ID)</b> | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                     |  |
| 11/15/06 | <b>Smith, Norman Randy (ID)</b>      | <b>Ninth Circuit</b>                     |  |
| 11/15/06 | <b>Keisler, Peter D. (MD)</b>        | <b>DC Circuit</b>                        |  |
| 11/15/06 | <b>Wallace, Michael Brunson (MS)</b> | <b>Fifth Circuit</b>                     |  |
| 11/15/06 | Rogan, James Edward                  | USDC: Central District of California     |  |
| 11/15/06 | Settle, Benjamin Hale                | USDC: Western District of Washington     |  |
| 12/5/06  | Kapala, Frederick J.                 | USDC: Northern District of Illinois      |  |
| 12/7/06  | Farr, Thomas Alvin                   | USDC: Eastern District of North Carolina |  |

Last Updated: 1/10/2008