WITHDRAWN

AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION

ABA WORKING GROUP TO ADVANCE WELL-BEING IN THE LEGAL PROFESSION
COMMISSION ON LAWYER ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS

REPORT TO THE HOUSE OF DELEGATES

RESOLUTION

1 RESOLVED, That the American Bar Association adopts the *ABA Model Impairment Policy for Legal Employers* (“Model Policy”) dated August 2018; and

2 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the American Bar Association urges legal employers to adopt the Model Policy.
We recognize that well-being is essential to a lawyer’s duty of competence, and that impairment is antithetical to both competence and the quality of service expected by our clients. Unfortunately, it is well documented that the legal profession experiences impairment at disproportionately higher rates due to substance use and other mental health disorders. This Legal Employer\(^1\) is committed to the well-being of its personnel, as well as to the prevention of impairments and to assisting our staff in obtaining treatment when needed. Impairment of an individual, due to substance use or other mental health disorder\(^2\), including a physical illness or condition that would adversely affect cognitive, motor or perceptive skills, adversely affects not only the individual’s well-being, but also the Legal Employer’s ability to serve our clients capably and responsibly.

The goals of this Policy are: (1) early identification of impairment and proper intervention to assist with preventing, mitigating, or treating the impairment; and (2) preventing our professional standards and the quality of our work for our clients from being compromised by any Legal Employer personnel's impairment. This Policy is intended to demonstrate compliance with those professional regulations which require legal employers to establish internal policies and procedures ensuring that all lawyers (including those who are impaired) conform to the jurisdiction’s applicable Rules of Professional Conduct (“RPC”), as well as state or federal rules, regulations or statutes.

I. Implementation

This Policy applies to all legal professionals, including, but not limited to, partners, managing attorneys, owners, shareholders, associates, staff attorneys, paralegals, administrators, and legal assistants, whether full-time, part-time, contract or temporary. This Policy will be publicized in the workplace and placed in the legal employers’ personnel handbook. A contact person, such as a managing partner, human resources director, or other designated person, will be responsible for implementing the Policy, but will not undertake/oversee counseling or treatment. The contact person should notify legal professionals of the availability of lawyer assistance programs which can refer impaired persons for assessment, counseling, treatment and other supportive services.

II. Definition of Impairment

For purposes of this Policy, the Legal Employer considers “impairment” to be a condition that materially and adversely affects a person’s judgment, memory, or reactions, or otherwise interferes with work performance and the rendering of legal

---

\(^1\) The term “legal employer” is not limited to a traditional law firm setting, use of “legal employer” in this instance and throughout the Policy is intended to apply to any organization that employs lawyers, and may be substituted with the appropriate legal employer entity/designation, e.g., a corporate legal department, governmental or municipal agency, etc.

\(^2\) See [https://www.samhsa.gov/disorders](https://www.samhsa.gov/disorders) for descriptions of mental and substance use disorders.
services in a manner consistent with the Legal Employer’s standards and the RPC. The diagnosis of an illness does not equate with impairment for purposes of this Policy. Illness is the existence of a physical or mental disease, while impairment is a functional classification that implies inability (perhaps resulting from a physical or mental disorder) to render services with reasonable skill and safety. Impairment may be caused by, but not limited to, the use of alcohol or drugs (prescribed or non-prescribed), a mental health disorder, or a physical illness or condition that would adversely affect cognitive, motor or perceptive skills. Determinations about impairment will be made carefully by the firm’s Executive Committee or those most qualified to evaluate impairment as designated by the Legal Employer, such as the Legal Employer’s Employee Assistance Program, following a thorough investigation and based on objective information. The privacy rights of all involved will be respected.

III. Professional Conduct Requirements and Illegal Activities

While this Policy emphasizes treatment of impaired personnel, it is not intended to condone or excuse illegal activities and/or unprofessional behavior. The Legal Employer expects all personnel to maintain a high level of competence and professionalism, appropriate to their position. This Policy is in effect during times and at places where personnel are in a position to be regarded or identified as representing the Legal Employer, such as traveling on business or participating in community, organizational, or professional meetings and affairs.

Legal Employer personnel who use, possess, distribute, sell (or attempt to sell), transfer, or purchase any illegal substance or controlled substance for which they do not have a physician’s prescription while at work or while performing in a work-related capacity may be subjected to internal disciplinary action, up to and including termination, and/or civil penalties and criminal penalties if appropriate. In the event of a criminal law or professional liability violation, the Legal Employer, in its sole discretion, may cooperate with courts and disciplinary agencies in the disposition of proceedings by affording treatment to the violator under the impairment procedures of this Policy, or under procedures established by the court or agency.

IV. Duty to Report

Lawyers shall not practice law or otherwise render legal services while impaired, and staff members of legal employers shall not assist in providing legal services while impaired. Legal Employer personnel shall not help a colleague conceal his or her impairment, including by knowingly assisting an impaired colleague in providing legal services.

A. Legal Employer personnel who:

1. believe they are themselves impaired or at risk of becoming impaired, or
2. reasonably believe that another Legal Employer lawyer or staff member may be impaired, shall report their concerns to at least one of the
following:

a. member of the Executive Committee;
b. General Counsel;
c. Chief Operating Officer;
d. leader of the Practice Group or head of the department in which the
   individual works; or
e. other person designated to receive such reports

B. All Legal Employer personnel shall have the obligation to report any incident
   in which they themselves or any other legal employer personnel has been
   arrested or charged with: driving while under the influence, public
   intoxication, possession or sale of any illegal substance. Such information
   may be reported to any member listed above in Section IV.A.

C. The Legal Employer will provide professional training programs to all
   personnel at regular intervals regarding signs and symptoms of substance
   use and mental health disorders, including cognitive impairment. The lawyer
   assistance program below may be consulted for assistance with this
   programming.

D. Upon learning of a lawyer’s or a staff member’s possible impairment, the
   Legal Employer will investigate the circumstances and undertake reasonable
   measures to assist that person on a confidential basis.

E. Anyone concerned about an impairment issue for themselves or for another
   employee of the Legal Employer are encouraged to also contact their state
   or local lawyer assistance program or the Legal Employer’s Employee
   Assistance Program for confidential assistance.³

F. The duty to report pursuant to this Policy is not intended to and does not
   supersede a lawyer’s reporting obligation in any circumstance that may exist
   under the applicable RPC. [See, e.g., state version of Model Rule 8.3.]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State Lawyers Assistance Program</th>
<th>Phone number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal Employer’s Employee</td>
<td>Phone number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistance Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

³ The Legal Employer should include the name and phone number of the lawyer assistance program (LAP) in each state in which it operates. Most LAPs provide free consultations, assessments, brief counseling and education, peer support, intervention, monitoring and referrals. A directory of LAPs may be found at: https://www.americanbar.org/groups/lawyer_assistance/resources/lap_programs_by_state.html.
V. Confidentiality

The Legal Employer will treat all communications as confidential to the extent consistent with the Legal Employer’s duties to protect clients, as well as to comply with the RPC, state or federal rule, regulation or statute. All protected health information will be handled in accordance with state and federal laws. Communications include those by and between the potentially impaired lawyer and members of the Legal Employer assigned with responsibilities to investigate and assist, as well as any member of the Legal Employer who reports concerns regarding the potential impairment of another.

Please be advised that while the Legal Employer recognizes confidentiality is important for the successful implementation and operation of this Policy, certain matters may not remain confidential (e.g., a threat to harm yourself or others, future criminal conduct, child abuse, or other legal reporting obligations), but reasonable good-faith attempts will be made to keep personal issues confidential.

VI. Prohibition Against Retaliation or Discrimination

A report made in good faith under this Policy, and good-faith participation in the investigation of any report, will not result in adverse action against any reporting or participating person. Any concern about retaliation must be reported immediately to one of the individuals listed above in Section IV.A. The Legal Employer will investigate any report of retaliation and take such action as may be appropriate, including disciplinary action, against anyone found to have retaliated against a person for reporting a possible impairment or participating in the investigation of a report.

VII. Procedures Upon Determination of Impairment

The Legal Employer seeks early identification of impairment issues of its personnel in order to provide the impaired individual with qualified treatment services as soon as possible to facilitate that person’s recovery. At the same time, the Legal Employer will take such steps as may be necessary to protect the interests of its clients and to comply with the RPC and any state or federal rule, regulation or statute.

A. Leave of Absence: The Legal Employer will permit an impaired individual to use accrued paid leave time for treatment, and will provide accommodations upon a return to work as permitted under the Legal Employer’s leave policies and as required under state and federal law.

B. Referral and Treatment: The Legal Employer will make concerted efforts to assist the impaired individual in obtaining appropriate medical care and treatment. The state’s lawyer assistance program may be consulted for assistance with referrals, evaluations and/or monitoring of lawyers.

C. Restriction of Work Duties: The Legal Employer may restrict the impaired individual by removal from client or other work matters, supervision of work
activities, or any other reasonable restriction of activities on client matters deemed necessary to protect client interests and comply with the RPC.

D. Review of Lawyer’s Activity: After determining that a lawyer is, or has been, suffering from an impairment, the Legal Employer will determine if a review of all matters recently handled by the lawyer is warranted in order to take remedial action on client matters. This review may include: review of client files, the lawyer's time and billing records, electronic communications, telephone records, and interviews with others in the Legal Employer with whom the lawyer worked.

E. Remedial Action: The Legal Employer shall immediately take any remedial action on client matters deemed necessary to mitigate any violation, or potential violation, of the RPC or other adverse consequences arising as a result of the individual’s lawyer’s impairment. [See state version of Model Rule 5.1(c).] Disclosure to the client may be required and will be done in compliance with the RPC.

F. Reporting to Disciplinary Authorities: A report will be made to the appropriate professional disciplinary authorities as required by state or federal rule, regulation or statute. [See state version of Model Rule 8.3, ABA Formal Opinion 03-431; ABA Formal Opinion 03-429].

G. Conditional Employment: Continued employment with the Legal Employer, unless otherwise required by the Family and Medical Leave Act or the Americans with Disabilities Act, may be conditioned upon:

1. Taking a leave of absence;
2. Execution of a Return to Work Agreement (see Appendix A);
3. Evaluation by a healthcare professional approved by the Legal Employer;
4. Commitment to a treatment plan, if recommended by the healthcare professional;
5. Periodic alcohol or drug testing resulting in consistent negative results,
6. Ongoing participation in peer support recovery programs;
7. Continuing therapy or medication management;
8. Monitoring by a lawyer assistance program or other professional;
9. Disclosure of evaluation results and verification of participation in appropriate treatment and support programs; and/or
10. Any other condition deemed appropriate by the Legal Employer.

Cooperation in all such matters is required, and failure to cooperate may result in Legal Employer discipline, up to and including possible termination.

H. Termination: Personnel who fail or refuse to avail themselves of the opportunity to seek and follow through on treatment of impairment will be subject to internal discipline, up to and including termination.
VIII. Consequences of Policy Violations

Any person, including any staff or lawyer, who acts contrary to this Policy, or any other Legal Employer policy, or violates any standards hereby established, will be subject to disciplinary action up to and including termination. The Legal Employer may, however, in its discretion, offer personnel the opportunity to participate in a counseling, treatment or rehabilitation program in lieu of such discipline.

IX. Other Laws

This Policy is in no way intended to interfere with the Legal Employer’s obligations to provide reasonable accommodations to those who are disabled under the Americans with Disabilities Act. Please see the Legal Employer’s EEO and Reasonable Accommodation policies for further information.
The American Bar Association has been instrumental in developing recent research examining aspects of impairment among law students and attorneys. This research has quantified an alarming rate of problematic alcohol/substance use and mental health impairments, coupled with deficient help-seeking behaviors in the legal profession. For example, the research indicates that attorneys engage in problematic alcohol use at nearly twice the level of the general population and have higher rates of depression and anxiety throughout their legal careers. Complicating matters, attorneys are reluctant to seek help. They are concerned that available measures are not sufficiently private and confidential, are worried that others will learn of their circumstances, and that any indication of an issue will detrimentally impact their career or position in the legal employer setting.

In 2016, these studies were a catalyst for a coalition of entities within and outside of the ABA to form the National Task Force on Lawyer Well-Being. After analyzing the data and seeking input from numerous sources, the Task Force issued a report in August 2017, which presented a series of recommendations directed at a variety of stakeholders within the justice system, and more importantly, for the purpose of this report, legal employers and lawyers’ professional liability carriers. Both the Conference of U.S. Chief Justices ("CCJ") and the American Bar Association have passed resolutions recommending further consideration of the Task Force recommendations.

To further examine these recommendations, in September 2017, American Bar Association President, Hilarie Bass, sought approval for the creation of the Working Group to Advance Well-Being in the Legal Profession ("the Working Group"), to study certain Task Force recommendations as related to law firms and legal employers, and to develop model policies and guidelines for well-being and impairment in this setting. As part of this effort, on April 25, 2018, law firm stakeholders such as law firm managing partners, Executive Committee members, senior risk managers, other law firm leaders, and the equivalent to Directors or above at insurance brokers, came together for a National Workshop in Washington, D.C. The purpose of the interactive Workshop was to create practical and workable law firm policies to reinforce lawyer well-being as a core

---


3 See CCJ Resolution 6. The Resolution may be viewed using the following link: https://www.americanbar.org/content/dam/aba/administrative/lawyer_assistance/is_colap_conference_of_chief_justices_resolution_6.authcheckdam.pdf.

component of the ethical obligations of competence and diligence as well as professionalism, and to address impairment issues in the law firm setting. Using a collaborative process, participants, including subject matter experts, such as members of lawyer assistance programs, generated ideas, innovations, and tools to develop this national model. Based on all the data and research gathered, the Working Group drafted the Model Impairment Policy for Legal Employers ("the Policy").

The foundation of this Policy is the recognition that well-being is essential to an attorney’s duty of competence, and that impairment is antithetical to both the competence and quality service expected by the clients of the legal employer. To support this duty, legal employers need to demonstrate a commitment to the well-being of their personnel, to the prevention of impairments, and to assisting their employees in obtaining treatment when needed. Impairment of a legal employee, due to substance use or other mental health disorder, including cognitive impairment or dementia, adversely affects not only the individual’s well-being, but also the legal employer’s ability to serve clients capably and responsibly. This Policy deals directly with the impairment of a legal employee. Impairment is a subset of the overall well-being of a legal employee, and this Policy is not meant to encompass the panoply of all well-being initiatives that can be employed in the legal employer setting.

Recognizing that law firms, or legal entities that employ multiple practicing attorneys and other staff, are a broad and sizeable group with considerable diversity, this Policy applies fairly universally. However, the policy may need to be tailored to address the realities particular to each legal employer setting. We also recognize that the ABA adopted a Model Law Firm/Legal Department Personnel Impairment Policy and Guidelines. See 1990AM118. The current Policy reinforces, but does not duplicate, the 1990 policy. The 1990 policy primarily focused on “substance use/abuse and dependence,” terminology that is antiquated and no longer used. In fact, in the 2013 edition of the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM-5), the American Psychiatric Association updated the clinical diagnoses to “alcohol use disorder” and “substance use disorder” which may be described as mild, moderate, or severe. The prior clinical diagnoses of “substance abuse” and “substance dependence” were eliminated. Further, the 1990 Policy did not incorporate the current rates of mental health issues seen in the legal profession, and is not reflective of the current resources available to legal professionals in the treatment of problematic substance use and/or mental health disorders. The over-arching goals of the Policy are: (1) early identification of impairment and proper intervention to assist with preventing, mitigating, or treating the impairment; and (2) preventing professional standards and the quality of the work for clients from being compromised by the impairment of any legal personnel. The Policy is intended to demonstrate compliance with those professional regulations which require legal employers to establish internal policies and procedures ensuring that all lawyers (including those impaired) conform to the jurisdiction’s applicable Rules of Professional Conduct (“RPC”), as well as state or federal rules, regulations or statutes.

See https://www.samhsa.gov/disorders for descriptions of mental and substance use disorders.
Conclusion

Abraham Lincoln advised that “the best way to predict the future is to create it.” Right now, the leaders of our legal profession stand at a crossroads and must take action. To maintain the status quo is not an option. We can create our future. Too many in our profession are too exhausted, too impaired, or too disengaged to develop into their best selves. Many find themselves in a profession drained of civility and compassion and plagued by chronic stress, poor self-care, and high rates of depression and alcohol problems. The result is that the legal profession is not living up to its full potential as an institution in which attorneys can thrive, best serve their clients, and contribute to a better society. The research demonstrates the need, and the National Task Force on Lawyer Well-Being and key legal employer stakeholders have identified the solutions, one of which is a Model Impairment Policy for Legal Employers. We respectfully ask that the ABA adopt this Model Impairment Policy for Legal Employers, advance the path to lawyers’ well-being, and assure a legal system that deserves the public’s confidence.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Harrell
Chair, The ABA Working Group to Advance Well-Being in the Legal Profession
August 2018
GENERAL INFORMATION FORM

Submitting Entity: The Working Group to Advance Well-Being in the Legal Profession

Submitted By: Terry Harrell

1. Summary of Resolution(s). The Resolution seeks to have the American Bar Association adopt the ABA Model Impairment Policy for Legal Employers (“Model Policy”) dated August 2018, and that the American Bar Association urges legal employers to adopt the Model Policy.


3. Has this or a similar resolution been submitted to the House or Board previously? Yes, see below.

4. What existing Association policies are relevant to this Resolution and how would they be affected by its adoption?

At the 1990 Annual Meeting, the House of Delegates passed the Model Law Firm/Legal Department Personnel Impairment Policy and Guidelines, which remains active policy. See 1990AM118. However, that 1990 policy primarily focused on “substance use and dependence,” terminology that is antiquated and no longer used, it did not incorporate the current rates of mental health issues seen in the legal profession, and is not reflective of the current resources available to legal professionals in the treatment of problematic substance use and/or mental health disorders.

The current Policy reinforces, but does not duplicate, the current policy.

5. If this is a late report, what urgency exists which requires action at this meeting of the House? N/A

6. Status of Legislation. (If applicable) N/A

7. Brief explanation regarding plans for implementation of the policy, if adopted by the House of Delegates. The Working Group to Advance Well-Being in the Legal Profession was established by President Bass to, in part, advance the recommendations of the National Task Force on Lawyer Well-Being and to develop model policies on well-being and impairment in the legal employer setting. Therefore, efforts to implement this policy will come from ABA leadership and be advanced in collaboration with the participating entities that comprise the National Task Force.
8. Cost to the Association. (Both direct and indirect costs) None

9. Disclosure of Interest. (If applicable) N/A

10. Referrals. Prior to filing, the proposed resolution has been circulated to:
Commission on Lawyer Assistance Programs
National Organization of Bar Counsel

11. Contact Name and Address Information. (Prior to the meeting. Please include name, address, telephone number and e-mail address)

   Terry L. Harrell  
   Executive Director  
   Indiana Judges and Lawyers Assistance Program  
   320 North Meridian Street, Suite 606  
   Indianapolis, Indiana 46204  
   317/833.0370  
   terry.harrell@courts.in.gov

   Tracy L. Kepler  
   Director  
   ABA Center for Professional Responsibility  
   321 N. Clark St  
   Chicago, IL 60654  
   312/988.5294  
   tracy.kepler@americanbar.org

12. Contact Name and Address Information. (Who will present the Resolution with Report to the House? Please include best contact information to use when on-site at the meeting. Be aware that this information will be available to anyone who views the House of Delegates agenda online.)

   Terry L. Harrell  
   Executive Director  
   Indiana Judges and Lawyers Assistance Program  
   320 North Meridian Street, Suite 606  
   Indianapolis, Indiana 46204  
   317/833.0370  
   terry.harrell@courts.in.gov
John T. Berry  
The Florida Bar  
651 E. Jefferson Street  
Tallahassee, FL  32399  
850/561.5774  
jberry@floridabar.org 

Larry C. Hunter  
Moffatt Thomas et al  
P.O. Box 829  
Boise, ID 83701  
Office: 208/385.5310  
Cell: 208/859.2616  
larry.hunter46@yahoo.com 

Lynda Shely  
The Shely Firm P.C.  
6501 E. Greenway Pkwy, Ste 103-406  
Scottsdale, AZ  85254  
480/905.7237  
lynda@shelylaw.com
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Summary of the Resolution

The Resolution seeks to have the American Bar Association adopt the ABA Model Impairment Policy for Legal Employers (“Model Policy”) dated August 2018, and that the American Bar Association urges legal employers to adopt the Model Policy.

2. Summary of the Issue that the Resolution Addresses

The resolution addresses the crisis of lawyer well-being that has been documented by research conducted and data compiled by the ABA Commission on Lawyer Assistance Programs and the ABA Working Group to Advance Well-Being in the Legal Profession. The research demonstrates that alcohol use, substance use and mental health disorders among lawyers far exceed other professions and populations. These circumstances undermine the ability of the legal profession to assure the public that the system of American justice is competent, fair and just.

The foundation of this Policy is the recognition that well-being is essential to an attorney’s duty of competence, and that impairment is antithetical to both competence and quality service expected for the clients of legal employers. To support this duty, legal employers need to demonstrate a commitment to the well-being of their personnel, to the prevention of impairments, and to assisting their employees in obtaining treatment when needed. Impairment of a legal employee, due to substance use or other mental health disorder, including cognitive impairment or dementia, adversely affects not only the individual’s well-being, but also the legal employer’s ability to serve clients capably and responsibly.

3. Please Explain How the Proposed Policy Position Will Address the Issue

Implementation of the Policy will provide a mechanism within the legal employer setting to identify impairment and craft proper intervention to assist with preventing, mitigating, or treating the impairment; and (2) prevent professional standards and the quality of the work for clients from being compromised by any legal employer personnel’s impairment. The Policy is intended to demonstrate compliance with those professional regulations which require legal employers to establish internal policies and procedures ensuring that all lawyers (including those impaired) conform to the jurisdiction’s applicable Rules of Professional Conduct (“RPC”), as well as state or federal rules, regulations or statutes.

4. Summary of Minority Views or Opposition Internal and/or External to the ABA Which Have Been Identified

None.