Contents

Introduction vii
About the Authors ix

Chapter 1
General Approach to Preservation Rules 1
A. Object or Request Specifically and Timely 1
B. Get a Definitive Ruling or Object to the Failure to Rule 2
C. Give the Trial Judge a Chance to Correct the Mistake 3
D. Strategic Issues 4
  1. Whether to Help the Judge Make His Ruling Harder to Challenge on Appeal (Whether Saying Less Is Better) 4
  2. Hiding behind the Proverbial Log: Pros and Cons 4
E. Exceptions to Preservation Requirements 4
  1. Subject Matter Jurisdiction 5
  2. Plain Error or Fundamental Error 8
  3. Exceptional Circumstances 12
  4. Purely Legal Issues 13
  5. Examples of Discretionary Exceptions to Preservation Requirements 14
  6. The Futility Exception 17
  7. Inherent Issue on Appeal 19

Chapter 2
Pretrial Preservation Issues 21
A. Pleadings 21
  1. General Requirements 21
  2. Amending Pleadings 22
  3. Defenses 23
  4. Amendments of Pleadings during Trial 25
B. The Decision Maker 26
   1. Jury or Nonjury 26
   2. Challenge to the Judge 30
C. Forum Issues, Including Personal Jurisdiction 37
   1. Personal Jurisdiction 38
   2. Venue 40
   3. Forum Non Conveniens 41
D. Service of Process 42
E. Joinder of Parties 44
F. Motions for Summary Judgment 46
   1. Denied Motions for Summary Judgment 46
   2. Preserving Issues Arising Out of Summary
      Judgment Proceedings 49
G. Discovery Issues 54
H. Notice of Foreign Law 56
I. Notice of Challenge to Constitutionality of Statute 58
J. The Pretrial Order 58
K. Deposition Designations 69
L. Motions in Limine 73
M. Separate Trials or Consolidation 76
N. Motions to Exclude 77

Chapter 3
Trial Preservation Issues 81
A. Jury Selection 81
B. Presentation of Evidence 86
   1. Requirement of Contemporaneous Objections 86
   2. Offers of Proof 88
   3. Examples of Cases Dealing with Evidentiary Issues
      on Appeal 89
   4. Witness Sequestration 93
C. Ensuring a Proper Appellate Record 94
D. Trial Motions for Judgment as a Matter of Law 94
E. Motions for Mistrial 102
F. Jury Instructions and Verdict Forms 109
   1. Exceptions to the Requirement of Objecting
      to the Charge 112
Contents

2. Requesting Additions to the Court’s Charge 129
3. Presenting Objections to the Court’s Charge 135
4. Consequences of Not Preserving a Charge Complaint in the Trial Court 145
G. Jury Deliberations and Verdict 147
   1. Communications with the Jury 148
   2. Inconsistent Verdicts 150
   3. Partial Verdicts 155

Chapter 4
Post-Trial Preservation Issues 157
A. Motion Practice in General 157
B. Motion to Enter Judgment 161
C. Renewed Motions for Judgment as a Matter of Law 162
D. Motions for New Trial 167
E. Remittitur 172
F. Motions to Alter or Amend Judgments 173
G. Motion for Relief from Judgment 174
H. Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law 177
   1. The Procedures for Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law at the End of a Bench Trial 177
   2. Granting Judgment during a Bench Trial under Rule 52(c) 178
   3. Motions to Amend Findings of Fact 181
I. Motions to Tax Costs and Legal Fees 184

Chapter 5
Objections to a Magistrate’s Ruling or Recommendation 187
A. Possible Waiver of Appellate Review by Not Objecting to a Report and Recommendations; Potential Exceptions 188
B. Objecting to a Magistrate’s Rulings or Proposed Rulings 189
   1. Magistrate Judge Rulings on Nondispositive Motions 189
   2. Magistrate Judge Reports and Recommendations on Dispositive Motions 189
   3. Cases Assigned to a Magistrate Judge by Consent 190
C. Time for Filing Objections 191
D. Specificity of Objections 191
E. Lack of Consistency on Waiver Issues 192
F. Objections to Report of Special Master 193

Appendix
Checklist for Preservation of Complaints and Aids to Further Research on Preservation Issues 195