## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>xxix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>About the Editor</td>
<td>xxxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About the Authors</td>
<td>xxxvii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER I

**First Circuit**

*J. Christopher Collins*

*Byrne J. Decker*

*Joseph M. Hamilton*

*J. Scott Kilpatrick*

*Kyle N. Kirby*

*Mason J. Waring*

#### I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 1
  - A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 1
  - B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 3
  - C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 3
  - D. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 4
  - E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 4
  - F. De Facto Plan Administrators 4
  - G. Cases Addressing Government Plans 5
  - H. Cases Addressing Church Plans 5

#### II. Preemption 6
  - A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 6
    1. Express Preemption 6
    2. Conflict or Complete Preemption 8
  - B. Preemption of State Antisubrogation Laws 9
  - C. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 9
  - D. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 10
  - E. ERISA’s Insurance “Savings Clause” 10
  - F. Preemption of State Law Equitable Claims 11

#### III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 11
  - A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 11
  - B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 12
  - C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 12
## CONTENTS

D. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 13  
E. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 13  
F. Issue Exhaustion 13  

### IV. Standard of Review

A. Plan Language 13  
B. Arbitrary and Capricious 15  
C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 15  
D. Cases Interpreting *MetLife v. Glenn* 16  
E. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 18  
F. Bans on Discretionary Clauses 19  
G. Impact of DOL Regulations 20  

### V. Rules of Plan Interpretation

A. Application of Federal Common Law 20  
B. Application of Contra Proferentem 21  
C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 21  

### VI. Discovery

A. Limitations on Discovery 22  
B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 24  
C. The Fiduciary Exception 25  

### VII. Evidence

A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 26  
B. Evidentiary Value of Social Security or Other Determinations 28  
C. Value of an Independent Medical Exam versus a Medical Record Review 29  
D. Can an Administrator Require Objective Evidence of Disability? 29  
E. Other Evidence Issues 31  

### VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice

A. Appropriate Defendant 31  
B. Methods of Adjudication 32  
C. Reported ERISA Trials 32  
D. Special Procedures for ERISA Benefit Cases 32  

### IX. Remedies

A. Remedies for Benefits Owed 33  
B. Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 33  

### X. Fiduciary Liability Claims

A. Definition of Fiduciary 35  
B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 36  
C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 38  
D. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 38  
E. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 39  

### XI. Attorneys’ Fees

A. Introduction 39  
B. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 39  
C. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 41  
D. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 41  
E. Catalyst Theory 42
Contents

XII. ERISA Regulations 42
XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 51
   A. Contractual Limitations Periods 51
   B. Claim Accrual 52
   C. Equitable Tolling 52
XIV. Subrogation Litigation 52
XV. Miscellaneous 54
   A. Unique Substantive or Procedural Rules for ERISA Cases 54
   B. Unique Approach to Common Policy-Based Defenses 55
   C. Supplementing the Administrative Record on Remand 55
   D. Appealability of Orders for Remand for Further Review 55
   E. Risk of Relapse and Disability Claims 55
   F. Other Miscellaneous Issues 56

CHAPTER 2
Second Circuit
Michael H. Bernstein
Daniel W. Gerber
Ian S. Linker
Matthew P. Mazzola

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 57
   A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 57
   B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 58
   C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 59
   D. De Facto Plan Administrators 60
   E. Government Plans 61
   F. Church Plans 62
II. Preemption 62
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 62
   B. Preemption of State Antisubrogation Laws 65
   C. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 65
   D. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 66
   E. Other Preemption Issues 68
III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 69
   A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 69
   B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 69
   C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 71
IV. Standard of Review 72
   A. Plan Language 72
   B. What Standard of Review Applies? 73
   C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 74
   D. Compliance with ERISA Regulations 75
   E. Delegation of Discretion 75
   F. Discretionary Language Bans 76
V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 77
   A. Application of Federal Common Law 77
CONTENTS

B. Application of Contra Proferentem 77
C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 77
D. Effect of Plan Amendments 78
E. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 78

VI. Discovery
A. Limitations on Discovery 79
B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 79
C. Fiduciary Exception to Privilege 80

VII. Evidence
A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 81
B. Administrator’s Request for Objective Evidence 83
C. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 84
D. Value of an IME versus Paper Review in Psychiatric Disability Claims 84
E. Attendance at an IME 85

VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice
A. Proper Defendants in a Claim for Benefits under ERISA 85
B. Methods of Adjudication 86
C. Reported ERISA Trials 90

IX. Remedies

X. Fiduciary Liability Claims
A. Definition of Fiduciary 97
B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 98
C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 99
D. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 100
E. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 100

XI. Attorneys’ Fees
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 101
B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 104
C. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 105
D. Who May Be Reimbursed for Attorneys’ Fees? 108
E. The Second Circuit Has Adopted the “Catalyst Theory” 108

XII. ERISA Regulations
A. ERISA Regulations Related to Summary Plan Descriptions 110
B. ERISA Regulations Related to Claim and Appeal Procedures 110

XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 113

XIV. Subrogation Litigation 115

XV. Miscellaneous
A. Awarding Prejudgment Interest 118
B. Class Actions 119
C. Relapsing Conditions 119
D. A Court-Ordered Remand Is Not an Appealable Final Order 120
CHAPTER 3
Third Circuit
Heather J. Austin
Joshua Bachrach
Omar Bareentto
Penelope M. Taylor

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 121
   A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 121
   B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 122
   C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 124
   D. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 125
   E. De Facto Plan Administrators 126
   F. Government and Church Plans 127

II. Preemption 129
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 129
   B. Preemption of State Antisubrogation Laws 131
   C. Preemption of Managed Care and Malpractice Claims 131
   D. State Independent Review Statutes 132
   E. Preemption of Equitable Claims and Defenses, Such as Waiver and Estoppel 132

III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 133
   A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 133
   B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 134
   C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 136
   D. Is There a Distinction between Issue and Claim Exhaustion? 136
   E. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 137
   F. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 137

IV. Standard of Review 138
   A. Plan Language 138
   B. What Standard of Review Applies? 140
   C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 141
   D. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 142

V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 143
   A. Application of Federal Common Law 143
   B. Application of Contra Proferentem 143
   C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 144
   D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 145

VI. Discovery 147
   A. Limitations on Discovery 147
   B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 149
   C. Recognition of Fiduciary Exception to Claims of Privilege 152

VII. Evidence 153
   A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 153
   B. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 154
   C. Other Evidence Issues 156
D. Use of an IME Instead of a Paper Review 157
E. What Is the Evidentiary Value of Claim Decisions from Other Insurers? 158
F. When May a Plan Require Objective Evidence? 158

VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 159
A. Methods of Adjudication 159
B. Reported ERISA Trials 159

IX. Remedies 161
A. Remedies Available under § 502(a)(1)(B) 161
B. Remedies Available under § 502(a)(3) 161
C. Reformation, Estoppel, and Surcharge 161
D. Disgorgement of Profits and Equitable Accounting 163
E. Permissibility of Simultaneous Claims under ERISA § 502(a)(1)(B) and § 502(a)(3) 164

X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 165
A. Definition of Fiduciary 165
B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 166
C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 169
D. Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 169
E. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 170
F. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 171

XI. Attorneys’ Fees 171
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 171
B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 174
C. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 174

XII. ERISA Regulations 175
XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 178
XIV. Subrogation Litigation 181
XV. Miscellaneous 183

CHAPTER 4
Fourth Circuit
Bryan D. Bolton
James A. Dean
Ryan H. Niland
E. Ford Stephens
Scott M. Trager

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 185
A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 185
B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 186
C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 187
D. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 188
E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 188
F. Treatment of Individual Business Owners 189
Contents

G. De Facto Plan Administrators 190
H. Government Plans 190
I. Church Plans 191

II. Preemption 192
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 192
   B. ERISA Savings Clause 193
   C. Conflict Preemption 194
   D. Preemption of State Antisubrogation Laws 196
   E. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 196
   F. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 196
   G. Preemption of Independent Review Statutes 197
   H. Other Preemption Issues 197

III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 198
   A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 198
   B. Exhaustion Exceptions 198
   C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 200
   D. New Arguments versus New Evidence 201
   E. Can a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense Be Waived? 201

IV. Standard of Review 201
   A. Plan Language 201
   B. What Standard of Review Applies? 202
   C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 202
   D. Standard of Review for Self-Funded Plans 203
   E. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 203

V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 204
   A. Application of Federal Common Law 204
   B. Application of Contra Proferentem 205
   C. Deference Afforded to Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 205
   D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 205
   E. Plan Documents Rule 206

VI. Discovery 207
   A. Limitations on Discovery 207
   B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 208
   C. Prima Facie Showing Required to Warrant Discovery 209
   D. Types of Discovery Permitted 210
   E. Fiduciary Exception to Claims of Privilege 211

VII. Evidence 211
   A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 211
      1. Abuse of Discretion Standard 211
      2. De Novo Standard 213
   B. Particular Types of Evidence 214
   C. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 215
   D. IME versus Paper Review 217
   E. Failure to Attend an IME 218
   F. Objective versus Subjective Evidence 219
CONTENTS

G. Disputes Concerning the Administrative Record 219
VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 220
   A. Correct Defendant in an Action for ERISA Benefits 220
   B. Methods of Adjudication 221
   C. Reported ERISA Trials 221
   D. Jury Trials 222
   E. Special Procedures for ERISA Benefit Cases 223
IX. Remedies 223
   A. Award of Benefits and Interest 223
   B. Equitable Relief for Plan Beneficiaries 224
X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 225
   A. Definition of Fiduciary 225
   B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 227
   C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 230
   D. Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 231
   E. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 231
   F. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 232
XI. Attorneys’ Fees 232
   A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 232
   B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 234
   C. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 234
   D. Catalyst Theory 236
XII. ERISA Regulations 237
XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 240
   A. Limitation Periods 240
   B. Contractual Limitation Periods 241
   C. When the Limitation Period Accrues 241
   D. Must Denial/Uphold Letters Address the Limitations Period? 242
   E. Application of Equitable Tolling 242
XIV. Subrogation Litigation 242
XV. Miscellaneous 243
   A. Unique Substantive or Procedural Rules for ERISA Cases 243
   B. Unique Approach to Common Policy-Based Defenses 245
   C. ERISA Class Actions 246
   D. Jurisdictional Removal 247
   E. Remand for Further Review 248

CHAPTER 5
Fifth Circuit
Virginia N. Roddy
Kevin A. Rogers
Kelly D. Simpkins
Andrew F. Macrae
   I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 251
      A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 251
Contents

B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 252
C. Individual Business Owners 253
D. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 253
E. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 254
F. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 255
G. De Facto Plan Administrators 256
H. Government Plans 257
I. Church Plans 258
II. Preemption 259
A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 259
B. Complete versus Ordinary Preemption 260
C. Preemption of Health Care Benefit Claims 261
III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 264
A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 264
B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 264
C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 265
D. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 265
E. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 265
IV. Standard of Review 266
A. Plan Language 266
B. What Standard of Review Applies? 266
C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 268
D. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 270
V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 271
A. Application of Federal Common Law 271
B. Application of Contra Proferentem 273
C. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 274
D. Effect of Plan Amendments on Pending Claims 274
VI. Discovery 275
A. Limitations on Discovery 275
B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 277
VII. Evidence 280
A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 280
B. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 281
C. Other Evidence Issues 283
VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 284
A. Methods of Adjudication 284
B. Reported ERISA Trials 284
IX. Remedies 285
X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 287
A. Definition of Fiduciary 287
B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 288
C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 289
D. Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 289
E. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 290
F. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 290
XI. Attorneys’ Fees 290
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 290
B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 292
C. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 292
XII. ERISA Regulations 292
XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 293
XIV. Subrogation Litigation 297
XV. Miscellaneous 299
A. Procedural Rules 299
B. Common Policy-Based Defenses 300
C. ERISA Class Actions 301
D. Risk of Relapse Cases 302
E. Jurisdiction and Removal 302

CHAPTER 6
Sixth Circuit
Robert D. Anderle
Michelle Thurber Czapski
Caroline Gentry
James A. King
I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 303
A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 303
B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 304
C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 306
D. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 307
E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 307
F. Treatment of a Merger Agreement between Employers 308
G. Recognition of De Facto Plan Administrators 308
H. Government Plans 308
I. Church Plans 309
II. Preemption 309
A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 309
B. Preemption of Malpractice and Managed Care Claims 313
C. State Rules Prohibiting Discretionary Clauses Not Preempted 314
D. Other Preemption Issues 314
III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 315
A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 315
B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 316
C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 316
D. Issue Exhaustion versus Claim Exhaustion 317
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense?</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Failure to Utilize and Exhaust Administrative Remedies Cannot Be Used to Revive a Time-Barred Claim</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Standard of Review</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Plan Language</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. What Standard of Review Applies?</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. State Rules Prohibiting Discretionary Clauses</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Rules of Plan Interpretation</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Application of Federal Common Law</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Application of Contra Proferentem</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Defe nce Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretion of a Plan</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Discovery</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Limitations on Discovery</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Must a Plaintiff Make a Prima Facie Showing in Order to Get Discovery?</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. What Types of Discovery Are Permitted?</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Does the Sixth Circuit Recognize the Fiduciary Exception to Claims of Attorney-Client Privilege?</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Evidence</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Evidentiary Value and Burden of Production of Social Security Determinations</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Value of an Independent Medical Examination versus Paper Review</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Under What Circumstances May an Administrator Require Objective Evidence?</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Who Is the Correct Defendant in an Action for ERISA Benefits?</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Methods of Adjudication</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Reported ERISA Trials/Jury Trials</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Special Procedures for ERISA Benefit Cases</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Remedies</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Cases Addressing Reformation, Estoppel, and Surcharge</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Cases Addressing Disgorgement of Profits and Equitable Accounting</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

E. Cases Addressing Whether a Claimant Seeking Benefits Can Prosecute Both § 1132(a)(1)(B) and § 1132(a)(3) Claims 338

X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 339
A. Definition of Fiduciary 339
B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 340
C. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 342
D. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 342

XI. Attorneys’ Fees 343
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 343
B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 344
C. Fees Awarded When Plaintiffs Lack Standing 344
D. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 345
E. Catalyst Theory 345

XII. ERISA Regulations 345
XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 352
XIV. Subrogation Litigation 354
XV. Miscellaneous 356
A. Class Actions 356
B. Stress/Relapse 356
C. Remand Not Final Order 356

CHAPTER 7
Seventh Circuit
Mark D. Debofsky
Daniel K. Ryan
Mark E. Schmidtke

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 357
A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 357
B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 358
C. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 359
D. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 359
E. Governmental Plans and Church Plans 360

II. Preemption 360
A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 360
B. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 361
C. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 362
D. Other Preemption Issues 362

III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 363
A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 363
B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 363
C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 364
D. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 365
E. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 365
Contents

F. Issue Exhaustion versus Claim Exhaustion 365
G. Is Exhaustion Required before Asserting a Counterclaim? 365

IV. Standard of Review 365
  A. Plan Language 365
  B. What Standard of Review Applies? 366
  C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 367
  D. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 368
  E. Delegation of Discretionary Authority 369
  F. Effect of State Bans on Discretionary Clauses 369

V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 370
  A. Application of Federal Common Law 370
  B. Application of Contra Proferentem 370
  C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 371
  D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 371

VI. Discovery 372
  A. Limitations on Discovery 372

VII. Evidence 374
  A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 374
  B. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 375
  C. Independent Medical Examination versus Paper Review 376
  D. Objective Evidence Requirement 376

VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 377
  A. Proper Defendants 377
  B. Methods of Adjudication 377
  C. Reported ERISA Trials 378
  D. Forum Selection Clauses 378
  E. Jury Trials 378

IX. Remedies 378

X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 380
  A. Definition of Fiduciary 380
  B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 380
  C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 381
  D. Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 381
  E. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 382
  F. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 382

XI. Attorneys’ Fees 382
  A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 382
  B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 384
  C. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 384

XII. ERISA Regulations 385

XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 386

XIV. Subrogation Litigation 386

XV. Miscellaneous 388
CHAPTER 8

Eighth Circuit

Molly R. Hamilton Cawley
Clark H. Cole
Wilbur L. Tomlinson
Terrance J. Wagener

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan?
   A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 391
   B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 392
   C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 392
   D. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 392
   E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 392
   F. Treatment of Individual Business Owners 393
   G. De Facto Plan Administrators 393
   H. Government Plans 393
   I. Church Plans 394

II. Preemption 394
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 394
      1. State Law Claims 394
      2. Savings Clause 395
   B. Conflict Preemption 395
   C. Preemption of Antisubrogation Laws 395
   D. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 396
   E. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 396
   F. State Independent Review Statutes 396
   G. Preemption of Equitable Claims and Defenses, Such as Waiver and Estoppel 396

III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 396
   A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 396
   B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 397
      1. Futility Exception 397
      2. Denial of Meaningful Access to Procedures 397
      3. Rapid and Life-Threatening Illness 397
   C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 397
   D. Issue versus Claim Exhaustion 397
   E. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 398
   F. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 398

IV. Standard of Review 398
   A. Plan Language 398
Contents

B. What Standard of Review Applies? 399
   1. Abuse of Discretion 399
   2. De Novo 399
   3. Sliding Scale 400
C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 400
   1. Conflict of Interest 400
   2. Procedural Irregularity 401
D. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 401
E. State Insurance Laws Banning Discretionary Clauses 402

V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 402
   A. Application of Federal Common Law 402
   B. Application of Contra Proferentem 402
   C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 402
   D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 403
      1. Ordinary Meaning 403
      2. Vesting of Benefits 403
      3. Proper Beneficiary Designation 404

VI. Discovery 404
   A. Limitations on Discovery 404
      1. Abuse of Discretion Standard of Review 404
      2. De Novo Standard of Review 405
      3. Fiduciary Exception 405
   B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 405

VII. Evidence 406
   A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 406
   B. Dispute over the Administrative Record 407
   C. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 407
   D. Evidentiary Value of an IME versus Paper Review 407
   E. Objective Evidence 408
   F. Failure to Attend an IME 408

VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 408
   A. Proper Defendants in an ERISA Case 408
   B. Methods of Adjudication 409
   C. Reported ERISA Trials 409
   D. Special Procedures for ERISA Benefit Cases 410

IX. Remedies 410

X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 410
   A. Definition of Fiduciary 410
   B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 411
   C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 412
   D. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 412
   E. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 413

XI. Attorneys’ Fees 413
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 413
B. Fees When Remedy Is Remand for Further Review 414
C. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 414
D. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 414
E. Catalyst Theory of Attorneys’ Fees 414

XII. ERISA Regulations 415

XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 415
A. General Rules 415
B. Contractual Limitations Periods 416
C. Limitations Period Accrual 417
D. Equitable Tolling 417

XIV. Subrogation Litigation 417

XV. Miscellaneous 418
A. Unique Substantive or Procedural Rules for ERISA Benefit Cases 418
B. Unique Approach to Common Policy-Based Defenses 418
1. Mental/Nervous Limitation 418
2. Total Disability versus Residual Disability 418
3. Preexisting-Condition Exclusion 418
4. Burden of Proof 418
5. Prejudgment Interest 419
C. Other Miscellaneous Issues 419
1. ERISA Class Actions 419
2. Appealability of Remand for Further Review 419

Chapter 9

NINTH CIRCUIT
Russell S. Buhite
Horace W. Green
Linda M. Lawson

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 421
A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 421
B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 422
C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 422
D. “List Bill” Exceptions for Individual Policies 423
E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 423
F. Treatment of Individual Business Owners 423
G. Recognition of De Facto Plan Administrators 424
H. Government Plan Exception 424
I. Church Plan Exception 425

II. Preemption 426
A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 426
1. Express Preemption 427
2. Interpretation of the “Savings Clause” Pursuant to Miller 430
Contents

B. Conflict or Complete Preemption 433
C. Preemption of State Antisubrogation Laws 437
D. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 439
E. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 441
F. State Independent Review Statutes 443
G. Equitable Claims and Defenses 444

III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 446
A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 446
B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 447
C. Consequences of Failure to Exhaust 447
D. Issue Exhaustion versus Claim Exhaustion 447
E. How Many Levels of Review Are Required? 448
F. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 448

IV. Standard of Review 448
A. Plan Language 448
B. What Standard of Review Applies? 448
C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 450
D. Application of Glenn to Self-Funded Plans and TPAs 452
E. Evidence Required to Establish a Conflict of Interest 452
F. Other Factors Affecting the Standard of Review 452
1. Timeliness 452
2. Discretionary Clause Bans 453
3. Impact of Compliance with ERISA Regulations on the Standard of Review 454

V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 454
A. Application of Federal Common Law 454
B. Application of Contra Proferentem 455
C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 455
D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 455
E. Effect of Plan Amendment on Pending Claims 455

VI. Discovery 456
A. Limitations on Discovery Based on the Standard of Review 456
B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 456
C. Must the Plaintiff Make a Prima Facie Showing in Order to Get Discovery? 457
D. What Type of Discovery Is Permitted? 457
E. Fiduciary Exception to Claims of Privilege 457

VII. Evidence 458
A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 458
B. Evidence Permitted under De Novo Review 458
C. Dispute over Administrative Record 458
D. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 459
CONTENTS

E. Who Bears the Burden of Obtaining Social Security Information? 459
F. Independent Medical Examination versus Paper Review 460
G. Objective Evidence Requirement 460

VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 461
A. Who Is the Correct Defendant in an ERISA Benefits Case? 461
B. Methods of Adjudication
   1. Are ERISA Cases Typically Resolved on Summary Judgment? 461
   2. Does the Circuit Recognize Motions for Judgment on a Stipulated Record? 461
C. Are ERISA Trials Appropriate? Under What Circumstances? 462
D. Are Jury Trials Permitted under Any Circumstances? 462
E. Has the Ninth Circuit Developed Any Special Procedures for ERISA Benefits Cases? 462

IX. Remedies 462
A. Remedies under ERISA § 502(a)(1)(B) 462
B. Remedies under ERISA § 502(a)(3) 463
C. Cases Addressing Reformation, Estoppel, and Surcharge 463
D. Cases Addressing Disgorgement of Profits and Equitable Accounting
   1. Disgorgement of Profits 467
   2. Equitable Accounting 469
E. Cases Addressing Seeking Benefits under Both § 1132(a)(1)(B) and § 1132(a)(3) 470

X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 473
A. Definition of Fiduciary 473
B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties 473
C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims 473
D. Can a Claimant Prosecute Both § 1132(a)(1)(B) and § 1132(a)(3) Claims? 474
E. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 474
F. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries 474

XI. Attorneys’ Fees 474
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 474
B. Fees Awarded Where Remedy Is a Remand 478
C. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 482
D. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 484
E. The “Catalyst Theory” 488

XII. ERISA Regulations 489

XIII. Other Regulations 492

XIV. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 494
A. Contractual Limitations Provisions 495
B. Cases Addressing Heimeshoff 496
C. Accrual of Statute of Limitations 498
D. Administrator’s Letters Addressing Limitation Periods 503
E. Equitable Tolling of the Statute of Limitations 504

XV. Subrogation Litigation 507
XVI. Miscellaneous 509

Chapter 10
Tenth Circuit
Michael S. Beaver
Gillian Dale
David N. Kelley
Scott M. Petersen

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 513
   A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 513
   B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 514
   C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 515
   D. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 515
   E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 515
   F. Treatment of Individual Business Owners 515
   G. Recognition of De Facto Plan Administrators 516
   H. Treatment of Government and Church Plans 517

II. Preemption 518
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 518
   B. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 519
   C. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 519
   D. Other Preemption Issues 519
      1. Bad-Faith Breach of Insurance Contract 519
      2. State Claims Handling Statutes 520
      3. State Laws Construing Insurance Contracts 520
      4. Other State Law Claims by Participants 520
      5. Claims by Health Care Providers Based upon Precertification 521
      6. Claims by Employers against Insurers and Service Providers 522

III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 522
    A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 522
    B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 523
    C. Consequences of Failing to Make a Timely Request for an Administrative Review 523
    D. Issue and Claim Exhaustion 524
    E. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 524
    F. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 524

IV. Standard of Review 525
    A. Plan Language 525
    B. What Standard of Review Applies? 526
CONTENTS

1. “Abuse of Discretion” or “Arbitrary and Capricious” Standard 526
2. De Novo Standard 528
C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 528
D. Other Factors Affecting the Standard of Review 529
V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 530
A. Application of Federal Common Law 530
B. Application of Contra Proferentem 531
C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 531
D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 532
E. Effect of Substantive and Procedural Plan Amendments on Pending Claims 532
VI. Discovery 533
A. Limitations on Discovery 533
B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 534
VII. Evidence 534
A. Scope of Evidence under Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of Review 534
B. Scope of Evidence under De Novo Standard of Review 536
C. Looking beyond the Administrative Record 537
D. Disputes over Composition of Administrative Record 537
E. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 537
F. Burden of Obtaining Social Security Information 539
G. Value of an Independent Medical Examination versus Paper Review 539
H. Value of Other Insurer’s or Administrator’s Determination 539
I. Objective Evidence Requirement 540
J. Claimant’s Refusal to Appear for an Independent Medical Examination 541
VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 542
A. Correct Defendant in an Action for ERISA Benefits 542
B. Methods of Adjudication 542
C. Reported ERISA Trials 543
D. Special Procedures for ERISA Benefit Cases 544
IX. Remedies 544
A. Remedies under § 502(a)(1)(B) 544
B. Remedies under § 502(a)(3) 545
C. Availability of Prejudgment Interest 545
D. Cases Addressing Reformation, Estoppel, and Surcharge 546
E. Cases Addressing Disgorgement of Profits and Equitable Accounting 546
F. May Claimant Prosecute Both § 502(a)(1)(B) and § 502(a)(3) Claims for Benefits? 546
X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 547
## Contents

### A. Definition of Fiduciary
- Definition of Fiduciary Duties
- Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health and Disability Claims
- Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries
- ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries

### XI. Attorneys’ Fees
- Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees
- Awarding Fees for Remand
- Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries
- Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees
- Adoption of the “Catalyst Theory”

### XII. ERISA Regulations
- Interpretation of ERISA Regulations on Claims Procedure
- Impact of Procedural Violations on Substantive Determinations

### XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation
- Contractual Limitations Provisions
- Cases Addressing *Heimeshoff v. Hartford Life*
- When the Limitations Period Accrues
- Must Denial/Uphold Letters Address the Limitations Period?
- Equitable Tolling of the Limitations Period

### XIV. Subrogation Litigation

### XV. Miscellaneous
- Burden of Proof on Insurer for Exclusionary Clauses
- Risk of Relapse as Basis for Disability Claim
- Whether Remand for Further Review Is a Final Appealable Order

## CHAPTER 11

### ELEVENTH CIRCUIT

**J.S. Christie, Jr.**

**Kenton J. Coppage**

**Aaron E. Pohlmann**

**Irma Solares**

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan?
- Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan
- Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes
- Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation
- Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan
- Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements
- De Facto Plan Administrators
- Government Plans
H. Church Plans 567
II. Preemption 568
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 568
   B. Preemption of Managed Care Claims 569
   C. Preemption of Malpractice Claims 570
   D. Preemption of Equitable Claims and Defenses 570
      1. Promissory Estoppel Claims 570
      2. Equitable Estoppel Claims 571
      3. Waiver Claims 572
   E. Other Preemption Issues 572
III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 574
   A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 574
   B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 574
   C. Consequences of Failure to Timely Seek an Administrative Review 576
   D. Application to Claims for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 577
   E. Issue versus Claim Exhaustion 578
   F. Levels of Administrative Review Required 578
   G. Waiver 579
IV. Standard of Review 579
V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 582
   A. Application of Federal Common Law 582
   B. Application of Contra Proferentem 583
   C. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 583
VI. Discovery 584
   A. Limitations on Discovery 584
   B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 585
   C. Discovery Regarding Other Issues 588
   D. Fiduciary Exception to Privilege 589
VII. Evidence 589
   A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 589
      1. De Novo Standard of Review 590
      2. Arbitrary and Capricious Standard of Review 590
VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 593
   A. Methods of Adjudication 593
   B. No Right to a Jury Trial 595
   C. Admissibility of Evidence 595
   D. Ambiguous Plan Language and Extrinsic Evidence 597
   E. Social Security Determinations 598
   F. Reported Trials 598
   G. ERISA Class Actions 599
   H. Proper Party Defendant 600
IX. Remedies 600
X. Fiduciary Liability Claims 604
   A. Definition of Fiduciary 604
Contents

1. Employers 604
2. Corporate Officers 605
3. Insurers 605
4. Third-Party Plan Administrators 606
5. Banks 606
6. Legal Counsel 607
7. Investment Advisors 607
8. Plan Participants 607

B. Fiduciary Duties Defined 608
C. Fiduciary Liability in the Health and Disability Context 610
D. Contribution and Indemnity 612
E. Liability of Nonfiduciaries 612

XI. Attorneys’ Fees 613
A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees 613
B. Post-Remand Fee Petitions 616
C. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries 617
D. Settling Parties and Fees 617
E. Pre-Litigation Fees 617
F. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees 618
G. Class Action Fees 618

XII. ERISA Regulations 618

XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation 621
A. Claims for Benefits 621
B. Contractual Limitations Period 622
C. Breach of Fiduciary Duty Claims 623

XIV. Subrogation Litigation 624

XV. Miscellaneous 629
A. How Does the Eleventh Circuit Award and Calculate Prejudgment Interest? 629
B. ERISA Class Actions 631

CHAPTER 12
D.C. CIRCUIT
Michael P. Cunningham
Irma Reboso Solares

I. What Constitutes an ERISA Plan? 633
A. Determining the Existence of an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 633
B. Definition of “Employee” for ERISA Purposes 634
C. Interpretation of the Safe Harbor Regulation 635
D. Amount of Employer Involvement Required to Sustain an Employee Welfare Benefit Plan 635
E. Treatment of Multiple Employer Trusts and Welfare Agreements 636
F. Treatment of Individual Business Owners 636
CONTENTS

G. De Facto Plan Administrators 636
H. Government Plans 636
I. Church Plans 637
II. Preemption 638
   A. Scope of ERISA Preemption 638
   B. Preemption of Managed Care and Malpractice Claims 641
   C. Other Preemption Issues 641
III. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 643
   A. Is Exhaustion an Absolute Requirement? 643
   B. Exceptions to the Exhaustion Requirement 644
   C. Consequences of Failure to Make a Timely Request for an Administrative Review 645
   D. Issue versus Claim Exhaustion 646
   E. Minimum Number of Levels of Administrative Review 646
   F. Can a Defendant Waive a Failure-to-Exhaust Defense? 646
IV. Standard of Review 646
   A. Plan Language 646
   B. What Standard of Review Applies? 649
   C. Effect of Conflict of Interest or Procedural Irregularity 650
   D. Other Factors Affecting Standard of Review 652
   E. Ban on Discretionary Clauses 653
V. Rules of Plan Interpretation 653
   A. Application of Federal Common Law 653
   B. Application of Contra Proferentem 654
   C. Deference Afforded to an Administrator’s Interpretation of a Plan 655
   D. Other Rules of Plan or Contract Interpretation 656
VI. Discovery 657
   A. Limitations on Discovery 657
   B. Discovery and Conflict of Interest 660
VII. Evidence 660
   A. Scope of Evidence under Standards of Review 660
   B. Evidentiary Value of Social Security Determinations 661
   C. Other Evidentiary Issues 662
      1. Denial Notices 662
      2. Federal Common Law: Remedies 662
      3. Objective Medical Evidence 663
      4. Independent Medical Examination versus Paper Review 663
   D. Claimants’ Refusal to Appear for an Independent Medical Examination 663
VIII. Procedural Aspects of ERISA Practice 663
   A. Methods of Adjudication 663
   B. Reported ERISA Trials 665
   C. Special Procedures for ERISA Benefit Cases 665
IX. Remedies 665
Contents

A. Claims for Benefits ........................................ 665
B. Breach of Fiduciary Duty .................................. 665
C. Prosecution of Both Benefit and Breach of Fiduciary
  Duty Claims ........................................... 667
X. Fiduciary Liability Claims ................................. 667
   A. Definition of Fiduciary ................................ 667
   B. Definition of Fiduciary Duties ...................... 668
   C. Fiduciary Liability in the Context of Health
      and Disability Claims ............................... 669
   D. Contribution and Indemnity Claims among Fiduciaries 670
   E. ERISA Claims against Nonfiduciaries .............. 670
XI. Attorneys’ Fees ........................................... 671
    A. Criteria for Awarding Attorneys’ Fees ............ 671
    B. Fees Awarded to Plan Fiduciaries ................. 672
    C. Calculation of Attorneys’ Fees .................... 672
    D. The Catalyst Theory ................................ 672
XII. ERISA Regulations ....................................... 673
XIII. Cases Interpreting ERISA Statutes of Limitation .... 676
XIV. Subrogation Litigation .................................. 679
    A. Post-Knudson and Sereboff ........................ 679
    B. Cases Addressing Montanile v. Board of Trustees 680
XV. Miscellaneous ............................................ 680