Contents

Preface xvii
About the Authors xix

CHAPTER 1
Gender Harassment and Retaliation 1
I. Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 1
A. Basic Legal Analysis Under Title VII 1
B. Gender Discrimination and Sexual Harassment Under Title VII 3
C. Employer Liability for Unlawful Harassment by Managers and Supervisors 5
D. Employer Liability for Acts of Coworkers 6
E. Personal Liability for Harassment 7
F. Defenses to Hostile Work Environment Claims 7
G. Types of Claims 11

CHAPTER 2
Workplace Harassment: Policies and Investigations 21
I. Workplace Harassment Prevention Policies 21
II. Model Workplace Harassment Prevention Policy 24
   A. Sexual Harassment Defined 24
   B. [Employer’s name]’s Complaint Procedure 25
   C. Liability for Harassment 26
   D. Retaliation Prohibited 26
III. Investigating Allegations of Harassment 26
    A. Selecting the Investigative Team 27
    B. Identifying, Gathering, and Preserving Evidence 30
    C. Interviewing Witnesses 30
    D. Documentation and Decision-Making 35
    E. Communicating Investigation Results 36
    F. Potential Liability Issues 36
CHAPTER 3
Investigating, Preparing, and Responding to the Administrative Charge and Court Complaint: Plaintiff’s Perspective 47

I. Intake and Screening 47
   A. Preliminary Screening 48
   B. Initial Interview 49

II. Pre-Litigation Investigation and Evaluation 58
   A. Review All Relevant Documents 58
   B. Witness Interviews 64
   C. Evaluation of Company’s Financial Status and Insurance 65
   D. Evaluation of Plaintiff’s Potential Legal Claims and Any Defenses 65
   E. Evaluation of Plaintiff’s Damages 66

III. Retainer Agreements 69

IV. Filing the Sexual Harassment Claim 70
   A. Filing the Charge 70
   B. Drafting the Civil Complaint 71

V. Recent Related Legislation 73
   A. California Legislation (Harassment/Discrimination) 73
   B. Federal Legislation 74

CHAPTER 4
Responding to the Charge and the Complaint 75

I. Responding to the Administrative Charge 76
   A. Evaluating the Charge 76
   B. Conduct the Investigation and Draft the Position Statement 77
   C. Participate in the EEOC Process 78

II. Responding to the Complaint 80
   A. Evaluate the Complaint for Potential Defenses 80
   B. Consider Whether a Motion to Dismiss Is Appropriate 81
   C. Removal 81
   D. Drafting the Answer and Affirmative Defenses 82

III. Conclusion 83

CHAPTER 5
Employment Practices Liability Insurance 85

I. Background 85

II. Coverage 86

III. EPL Policies Are Claims-Made Policies 86
   A. Typical Language 86
   B. Claims-Made Policies Are Enforceable 86
   C. Insurers Generally Do Not Need to Show Prejudice in Order to Enforce Claims-Made Policies 87
D. Litigation Regarding “as Soon as Practical” Clauses 88
E. Threats and Extended Coverage 88

IV. Exclusions 89
   A. General 89
   B. Punitive Damages 89
   C. FLSA Claims 90

V. Applications 90

VI. Immigration Status: Cutting-Edge Coverage Issues 91

CHAPTER 6
Representing and Defending the Alleged Harasser 93

I. Introduction: The Lawyer’s Challenge 93

II. Initial Considerations When Representing the Alleged Harasser 93
   A. Determining Whether Joint Representation Is Appropriate 93
   B. Employer’s Vicarious Liability and Affirmative Defenses 94
   C. Individual Liability of the Alleged Harasser 96

III. Ethical Issues and Rules When Representing the Alleged Harasser 97
   A. The Joint Representation Agreement 97
   B. Addressing Conflict of Interest Issues During Joint Representation 97
   C. Settlement Discussions 99
   D. In-House Counsel 100

IV. Attorney-Client Privilege Issues in Joint Representation 100

V. Protecting the Alleged Harasser from Discovery Abuses 102
   A. Federal Rule of Evidence 415 103
   B. Character or Habit Evidence 104

VI. Presenting a Unified Front at Trial 107

Appendix 6A Sample Joint Representation Agreement 109
Appendix 6B Sample Engagement Letter 114

CHAPTER 7
Arbitration Issues and Considerations 117

I. The Preemptive Force of the Federal Arbitration Act 117

II. Individual Arbitration Agreements 119
   A. Statutory Employment Claims 119
   B. Enforceability of Individual Arbitration Agreements 121
   C. Class Arbitration and Class Action Waivers 127

III. Procedural Issues 130
   A. Gateway Issues 130
   B. Standards of Judicial Review: When the Arbitrator Exceeded His or Her Powers 131
   C. Effect on EEOC 132
   D. Vacatur of Award 133
CHAPTER 8
Multi-Plaintiff Litigation and Class Actions: Plaintiff’s Perspective 135

I. Procedural Requirements for All Class Action Litigation 136
   A. Elements of a Class Action 136
   B. Requirements of Rule 23(B) 139
   C. Rule 23(f) 140
   D. Class Action Certification After Wal-Mart 140
   E. Special Considerations 142
   F. Class Actions and Arbitration Agreements 144
II. Multi-Plaintiff (but Not Class) Actions 145
III. The Retainer Agreement 145
IV. Proving the Multi-Plaintiff Case 146
    A. Discrimination Class Actions 146
    B. Sexual Harassment Class Actions 147
V. Settling Class Action/Multi-Plaintiff Cases 150
    A. General Considerations 150
    B. Attorney’s Fees 151
VI. Conclusion 152

CHAPTER 9
Multi-Plaintiff Litigation and Class Actions: A Defense Perspective 153

I. Introduction: Harassment and Retaliation Class Actions—An Oxymoron or the Extension of Established Law? 153
II. Rule 23: The Class Action Requirements 157
    A. The Constitutional Requirement of Standing 158
    B. The Requirements of Rule 23(a): Numerosity, Commonality, Typicality, and Adequacy 160
    C. The Requirements of Rule 23(b) 164
III. Application of Rule 23 Requirements in Harassment and Retaliation Cases 166
    A. Difficulties Class Representatives Face Using Plaintiffs’ Ordinary Tools to Prove Commonality in Harassment Cases 166
    B. Difficulties Class Representatives Face Because of Proof Specific to Harassment Cases 171
    C. Jenson and Its Few Progeny: Hard Cases Make Bad Law 174
    D. Difficulties Class Representatives Face Because of Proof Specific to Retaliation Cases 180
    E. The Role of Damages in Class Certification 181
    F. Tag-Along Harassment or Retaliation Claims 185
IV. Opposing Class Certification in Harassment and Retaliation Cases 186
V. Mitsubishi: The EEOC Representative Action Anomaly 190
VI. Precertification Nuts and Bolts: Discovery and Summary Judgment 194
   A. Discovery 194

CHAPTER 10
Discovery and Deposing the Plaintiff and Plaintiff’s Witnesses: Defense Perspective 197

I. The Overriding Significance of the Plaintiff’s Deposition 197
II. Preparation for the Plaintiff’s Deposition 198
   A. Obtain All Relevant Documents and Electronic Information 198
   B. Use Interrogatories to Obtain “Hard” Information 203
   C. Interview Critical Fact Witnesses 204
III. The Plaintiff’s Deposition 204
   A. Preparation and Content 204
   B. Organization, Technique, Pace, Timing, and Approach 206
IV. Preparation of Defense Witnesses for Their Depositions 209
V. Depositions of Plaintiff’s Doctors and Other Experts 211

CHAPTER 11
Discovery and Deposing the Alleged Harasser and Defense Witnesses: The Plaintiff’s Perspective 213

I. Always Consider the Goal of Discovery in Harassment and/or Retaliation Suits 213
II. Unlawful Harassment and Retaliation Cases: What Facts Does the Plaintiff Need to Explore? 215
   A. Basics About Employer 215
   B. Policy and Procedure of Employer Regarding Harassment Reporting and Prevention 216
   C. Training Undertaken by Employer to Prevent Harassment 217
   D. Complaints 217
   E. Witnesses 217
   F. The Plaintiff’s History 219
   G. Location and Format of Information 219
   H. The Plaintiff’s Damages 219
III. Pre-Suit Discovery 220
IV. Discovery Under Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (and Local Rules) 221
   A. The Rule 26(F) Conference and Case Management Reports 221
   B. Depositions in Relation to Written Discovery 223
   C. Interrogatories and Requests for Production 226
   D. Requests for Admissions 230
   E. Common Discovery Issues for Plaintiffs 231
CHAPTER 15
Voir Dire and Plaintiff’s Opening Statement: Plaintiff’s Perspective

I. Preparing for Voir Dire
   A. Voir Dire—Definition and Purpose
   B. Early Preparation for Jury Selection
   C. Electronic Social Media and Internet Searches
   D. Assign Jury Selection Duties
   E. Seeking Improved or Altered Voir Dire Conditions
   F. Written Questionnaires
   G. Pretrial Conference

II. Voir Dire: Practice Tips
   A. Establishing Rapport and Control
   B. Articulating the Case Theme
   C. Use Basic Biographical Information as a Launching Pad
   D. The Process

III. Opening Statements

IV. Anatomy of an Opening Statement
   A. Introduction and Case Theme
   B. Telling the Story
   C. Procedural Considerations
   D. Discussion of Damages
   E. Conclusion

Appendix 15A Sample Form to Record Juror Characteristics at Voir Dire

CHAPTER 16
Voir Dire and Opening Statement: Defense Perspective

I. Introduction

II. Voir Dire and Jury Selection
   A. Before Voir Dire Begins
   B. Jury Questionnaire
   C. Defense Voir Dire Examination
   D. Challenging Plaintiff’s Improper Voir Dire
CHAPTER 17

Evidentiary Issues in Workplace Harassment and Retaliation Litigation

I. Introduction

II. The Parties’ Pasts: What Are the Permissible Evidentiary Parameters?
   A. Evidentiary Rules Typically Used in Motions in Limine
   B. Motions in Limine Regarding Character or Bad Act Evidence

III. Did She Welcome It? The Admissibility of the Plaintiff’s Past Sexual Conduct
   A. Amended FRE 412: An Attempt to Shield the Admissibility of Plaintiff’s Past Sexual Conduct
   B. Cases Involving the Admissibility of Plaintiff’s Past Sexual Conduct

IV. Was It Severe or Pervasive?

V. Has He Ever Done It Before? The Admissibility of the Accused’s Past Conduct and Prior Complaints
   A. Rule 415: Plaintiff’s New Sword?
   B. Common Objections to the Admissibility of the Accused’s Past Sexual Conduct and Prior Complaints
   C. Cases Admitting Evidence of Prior Complaints and the Accused’s Past Sexual Conduct
   D. Cases Admitting Evidence of Past Conduct and Prior Complaints in Other Types of Workplace Harassment Litigation

VI. Evidentiary Issues in Retaliation Claims
   A. When Is an Employment Action Materially Adverse?
   B. Establishing the But-For Causation Standard
   C. Evidence Required to Prove the Employer Knew or Should Have Known

VII. Other Evidentiary Issues
   A. Counsel as the “Investigator”
   B. Self-Critical-Analysis Doctrine
   C. Use of Experts Regarding Sufficiency of Employers’ Harassment Policies
CHAPTER 18
Cross-Examining the Plaintiff in a Workplace Harassment Case

I. Introduction 379
II. Classic Impeachment 380
   A. Areas to Examine for Inconsistencies 380
   B. Methods of Classic Impeachment 381
III. Examination of the Plaintiff’s Other Agendas or Motives for Bringing False or Exaggerated Charges 382
IV. Plaintiff’s Role in the Alleged Harassment 383
V. Plaintiff’s Failure to Follow Company Policy 385
VI. Other Considerations 385

CHAPTER 19
Cross-Examination of the Alleged Harasser and Decision-Maker 387

I. Theme of Litigation 388
II. Preparing for Cross-Examination 388
III. Setting up Cross-Examination 390
IV. Preliminary Questions 391
   A. Definitional Questions 392
V. Isolate the Harasser 393
VI. Retaliation 397
VII. Dealing with the Hostile Witness 398

CHAPTER 20
Damages Issues in Title VII Cases: Plaintiff’s Perspective 401

I. Introduction 401
II. Reinstatement 401
   A. Overview 401
   B. Bumping 403
III. Back and Front Pay Damages 405
   A. Back Pay Damages 405
   B. Front Pay Damages 420
   C. Who Decides Back Pay and Front Pay: The Judge or Jury? 424
   D. Plaintiff’s Duty to Mitigate 426
IV. Compensatory Damages 431
   A. Availability of Compensatory Damages Generally 431
   B. Expert Versus Nonexpert Testimony 432
   C. Constructive Discharge and Its Role in Proving Certain Title VII Claims 437
CHAPTER 21
Damage Issues and Mitigation 451
I. Mitigation Principles Generally 451
   A. The Parties’ Burdens 452
   B. The Types of Damages to Which Mitigation Applies 454
   C. Types of Damages to Which Mitigation Does Not Apply 455
   D. The Role of Prejudgment Interest 455
II. Satisfying the Parties’ Respective Burdens 456
    A. Amounts Paid by the Defendant to the Plaintiff 456
    B. Amounts Paid to the Plaintiff by Nonemployer Third Parties 457
    C. Interim Earnings 458
    D. Amounts the Plaintiff Should Have Earned but for a Failure to Mitigate Damages 461
III. The After-Acquired Evidence Doctrine 472
     A. Expansion of the Doctrine 474
     B. Considerations for the Plaintiff’s Lawyer 474
     C. Considerations for the Defendant’s Lawyer 475
IV. Deductions for Other Events 476
    A. Change in Defendant’s Status 476
    B. Change in Plaintiff’s Status 476
V. Mitigation-Related Discovery and Evidentiary Issues 476
   A. Plaintiff’s Obligations 476
   B. Subpoenas Served on New Employers 477
   C. Disclosure of Immigration Status 477

CHAPTER 22
Using Psychiatric and Psychological Experts at Trial: Defense Perspective 479
I. Introduction 479
II. The Differences Between Psychologists and Psychiatrists 480
    A. Psychiatrists 480
    B. Psychologists 480
III. Understanding the Differences Between Clinical and Forensic Evaluations 481
   A. Clinical Evaluation 481
   B. Forensic Evaluation 482
   C. Ethical Issues When the Plaintiff’s Treating Psychologist or Psychiatrist Testifies at Trial 483
   D. Legal Bases for Challenging the Trial Testimony of Plaintiff’s Treating Psychologist or Psychiatrist 483
IV. The Framework Used by Clinicians and Forensic Evaluators 483
V. The Legal Framework for Admitting and Excluding Psychiatric/Psychological Expert Testimony 484
   A. Procedural Issues Regarding Admissibility of Expert Testimony 485
   B. Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals 485
   C. Kumho Tire Co., Ltd. v. Carmichael 489
   D. Applying Daubert to Determine What Opinions Can Be Offered at Trial by a Psychiatric or Psychological Expert 489
VI. Establishing the Groundwork for a Challenge to the Plaintiff’s Psychiatric or Psychological Expert 492
   A. Qualifications 492
   B. Methodology 493
   C. Expert’s Role in the Plaintiff’s Case 493
   D. Expert’s Knowledge of Facts About the Plaintiff 493
   E. Expert’s Diagnosis and Treatment of Plaintiff 494
   F. Deposition of the Plaintiff’s Expert Witness 495
VII. Coping with Plaintiff’s Psychiatric or Psychological Expert at Trial 495
VIII. Retaining a Psychiatric/Psychological Expert for the Defense 496
   A. When the Defense Needs Its Own Psychiatric or Psychological Expert 496
   B. Selecting an Expert 497
   C. Providing Defendant’s Expert with All the Necessary Information 498
   D. Performing a Rule 35 Independent Medical Examination 499
IX. Conclusion 507
Bibliography 509

CHAPTER 23
Closing Argument and Jury Instructions: Plaintiff’s Perspective 511
I. Introduction 511
II. Jury Instructions 511
   A. Timing 512
   B. Pattern Instructions 513
   C. Nonstandard Instructions 515
   D. Objections to Jury Instructions 518
   E. Interim and Limiting Instructions 521
   F. Curative Instructions 522
   G. Readbacks, Jury Questions, and Supplemental Instructions 523
   H. Verdict Forms 524
III. Closing Argument 525
   A. Scope and Strategy 526
   B. Objections to Closing Arguments 527
IV. Conclusion 538

CHAPTER 24
Closing Argument and Jury Instructions: Defense Perspective 541

I. The Role of the Closing Argument 541
II. Best Practices for Presenting an Effective Closing Argument 541
   A. Plan the Closing Argument Throughout the Representation 541
   B. Offer a Theory of the Case 542
   C. Convey a Theme of the Case 542
   D. Acknowledge Weaknesses 542
   E. Concentrate on the Strengths 542
   F. Organize the Closing Argument Logically 542
   G. Keep the Closing Argument Concise 543
   H. Present an Argument, Not a Summation 543
   I. Refer Back to Opening 543
   J. Use Good Common Sense 543
   K. Ask and Answer Rhetorical Questions 543
   L. Use Analogies 544
   M. Use Selective Visual Aids 544
   N. Refer to Jury Instructions and Verdict Forms 544
   O. Stay Within the Boundaries of Proper Argument 544
   P. Start Strong and Finish Strong 545
   Q. Use an Authentic Style of Delivery 545
   R. Do Not Rely on Notes 545
III. Characteristics of an Ineffective Closing Argument 545
IV. Practice Tips for Effective Closing Arguments 546
V. Special Considerations in Harassment Cases 548
VI. Jury Instructions 549

Appendix 24A Model Jury Instructions 551
Appendix 24B Ninth Circuit Model Civil Jury Instructions 565

Case Index 573
Subject Index 611