TABLE OF CONTENTS

Dedication ................................................................. iii
About the Author ........................................................ xv
Preface ................................................................. xvii
Note about the Administrative Conference of the United States
(1968-1995, 2010- ) ................................................... xxi
List of Acronyms Used in the Text .............................. xxiii

PART I
OVERVIEW OF FEDERAL AGENCY RULEMAKING ................. 1
A. Rulemaking under the Administrative Procedure Act .......... 4
B. Agency Rulemaking and the Courts ............................ 6
C. Agency Rulemaking and the Congress .......................... 12
D. Agency Rulemaking and the President ......................... 18
  1. The Development of Presidential Review .................... 19
  2. Executive Order 12,866 ........................................ 23
  3. Developments in the Bush II Administration ................ 29
  4. Developments in the Obama Administration ................. 31
  5. Developments in the Trump Administration ................. 33
  6. Judicial Reaction to Presidential Review .................... 38
E. Overviews of Rulemaking—Other Views ....................... 39
  1. The Administrative Conference’s Comprehensive Review of the
     “State” of Rulemaking ........................................... 39
  2. The “Blackletter Statement” of the ABA Section of Administrative
     Law and Regulatory Practice ..................................... 40
  3. Other Overviews of Rulemaking ................................ 41
Excerpts from “A Blackletter Statement of Federal Administrative Law” .... 43

PART II
THE STATUTORY FRAMEWORK FOR RULEMAKING ............... 49

Chapter 1
The Administrative Procedure Act’s Rulemaking Provisions .......... 51

A. “Rules” and “Rulemaking” Under the APA ..................... 51
B. Formal Rulemaking under the APA .......................... 58
C. Informal Rulemaking under Section 553 of the APA .......... 60
D. Rules Exempt from All of Section 553’s Requirements
   1. Proprietary Matters: Public Property, Loans, Grants, Benefits, and
      Contracts ............................................. 62
   2. Agency Management or Personnel ........................................... 66
   3. Military or Foreign Affairs ............................................. 67
E. Rules Exempt from Notice and Comment ..................................... 68
   1. Rules of Agency Organization, Procedure, or Practice ............ 69
   2. Interpretive Rules and Policy Statements (also known as
      “Non-Legislative Rules” or “Guidance”) ............................... 74
      a. The agency’s label ............................................. 77
      b. Distinguishing between interpretive rules and legislative rules .... 78
         i. The “legal effect” test ........................................... 79
         ii. The “binding norm” test ....................................... 80
         iii. The modern test: Is the rule truly interpretive or does it effect
              substantive change? ........................................... 84
         iv. Agency modification of prior interpretations of their
              regulations .................................................. 88
      c. Distinguishing between legislative rules and policy statements .... 90
         i. Case law: true policy statements do not establish a binding
            norm .................................................... 91
         ii. Importance of agency practice .................................. 94
         iii. ACUS Recommendations ....................................... 96
         iv. OMB “Good Guidance” Bulletin .................................. 98
         v. Other agency stratagems ......................................... 99
      d. Summary of the law on the guidance exemption ................... 100
      e. The intertwining of procedural claims and finality for the
         purposes of judicial review ..................................... 103
      f. Post-promulgation comment period .................................. 104
   3. “Good Cause” Exemptions .................................................. 105
      a. Emergency health or safety standards ............................ 109
      b. Congressional deadlines .......................................... 110
      c. “Interim-final” rules ............................................. 114
      d. “Direct-final” rulemaking ......................................... 116
      e. Remedies for violations of the good-cause provision .......... 118
      f. Suspension of effective dates and “midnight rules” ............. 119
   4. Exemptions from Delayed Effective Date Requirement ............ 125
F. Publication Requirements of Section 552 of the APA ................ 126

Chapter 2
Use of Rulemaking or Adjudication for the Setting of Policy: A Comparison .... 129
A. Legal Constraints on Choosing Rulemaking or Adjudication ........ 132
   1. Statutory Requirements ............................................. 132
   2. Statutory Authority .................................................. 132
   3. Judicial Constraints .................................................. 136
Contents

B. Practical Considerations in Choosing Rulemaking or Adjudication ..........141
   1. Advantages of Rulemaking ........................................141
   2. Advantages of Adjudication ......................................144
   3. Declaratory Orders ................................................146
   4. Summary ...........................................................146

Chapter 3
Other Procedural Statutes Affecting Rulemaking .................................149
A. The Federal Register Act ..............................................149
B. The National Environmental Policy Act ................................151
C. The Regulatory Flexibility Act .......................................153
D. The Paperwork Reduction Act ........................................160
   1. The OMB Clearance Requirements .................................162
   2. Clearance Procedure ..............................................163
   3. PRA and the Internet .............................................167
   4. Standard of Review ..............................................168
   5. The Small Business Paperwork Relief Act ......................169
E. The Federal Advisory Committee Act ................................170
F. The Negotiated Rulemaking Act .....................................173
G. The Unfunded Mandates Reform Act ................................177
H. The Information Quality Act .........................................179
I. The E-Government Act of 2002 ......................................184
J. Congressional Review of Rules ......................................185
K. Miscellaneous Other Statutes Affecting Rulemaking ....................193
   1. The Trade Agreements Act .......................................193
   2. The National Technology Transfer and Advancement Act ....194
   3. Assessment of Federal Regulations and Policies on Families ...194

PART III
INFORMAL RULEMAKING IN PRACTICE .....................................197

Chapter 1
Beginning the Process .........................................................199
A. External Considerations ..............................................200
   1. Congressional and Judicial Pressure ...........................202
   2. Public Petitions for Rulemaking ................................203
   3. Agency Priority Setting ...........................................206
   4. Other Influences on an Agency’s Decision to Begin Rulemaking ...209
   5. Litigation Settlements and Consent Decrees ..................210
B. Procedural Decisions ....................................................215
   1. Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPRM) ...........216
   2. Negotiated Rulemaking ............................................217
Chapter 2

Electronic Rulemaking ................................................. 227
A. Potential Benefits ................................................... 230
B. Legal and Technical Issues ........................................ 231
   1. Questions about the Informational Goal ...................... 234
      a. How should we best integrate existing sources of information? 234
      b. Docketing issues ........................................... 235
   2. Questions Concerning the Participatory Goal .................. 241
      a. How can we best reach the goal of better, more targeted notices? 241
      b. Can we also provide easier, more convenient comment opportunities? 241
      c. What rules should govern rulemaking “chat rooms”? 242
C. The Impact of E-Rulemaking on the Rulemaking Process .......... 243

Chapter 3

Regulatory Analysis and Review ..................................... 251
A. Executive Order 12,866 ............................................ 252
   1. Rules Covered by Executive Order 12,866 Review .......... 253
   2. Content of the Regulatory Analysis ........................... 255
   3. OIRA Review .................................................. 261
B. The Paperwork Reduction Act ..................................... 263
   1. Coverage ..................................................... 263
   2. Content of the Analysis ....................................... 264
   3. OIRA Review .................................................. 264
C. The Regulatory Flexibility Act .................................... 265
   1. Coverage ..................................................... 265
   2. Content of the Analysis ....................................... 265
   3. Review by the Small Business Administration ............... 266
D. Unfunded Mandates Reform Act (UMRA) .......................... 267
   1. Coverage ..................................................... 267
   2. Content of the Analysis ....................................... 267
   3. Review of the Analyses ....................................... 268
E. OMB Peer Review Bulletin .......................................... 269
F. OMB/OSTP Risk Assessment Principles .......................... 272
G. Assessment of Federal Regulations and Policies on Families .... 273
H. Privacy Assessments ............................................... 274
I. Other Executive Orders ............................................ 274
J. Coordination of Analysis Requirements ........................... 279

Chapter 4

The Notice of Proposed Rulemaking .................................. 283
A. Publication Requirements .......................................... 283
B. Contents of the Notice of Proposed Rulemaking ................. 285
C. Federal Register Requirements and Incorporation by Reference 286
Contents

D. Adequacy of the Notice .............................................. 289
E. Need for a Second Cycle of Notice and Comment (“Logical Outgrowth” Test) ............................................ 291
  1. Formulations of the “Logical Outgrowth” Test .................... 292
  2. The Supreme Court Adopts the Test ............................. 295
  3. Examination of the Comments .................................... 296
  4. Importance of the Wording of the NPRM ......................... 298
  5. Voluntary Use of Two Cycles of Notice and Comment .......... 301
F. Dissents .................................................................. 303

Chapter 5

Public Participation ....................................................... 305
A. Opportunity for Written Comment ................................ 305
  1. Minimum Time ...................................................... 306
  2. Agency Disclosure of Important Data or Information ........... 310
  3. Open-mindedness .................................................... 314
B. Special Consultation Requirements ................................ 315
C. Oral Hearings in APA Rulemakings ................................ 316
  1. Formal Rulemaking under the APA .............................. 316
  2. Hearing Requirements in Hybrid Rulemaking Statutes ......... 319
  3. The Position of the Administrative Conference on Hearings in Rulemaking ............................................. 320
  4. Agency Oral Hearing Procedures .................................. 321

Chapter 6

The Rulemaking Record .................................................. 325
A. The Evolution of the “Rulemaking Record” Concept ............ 325
B. The Importance of the Rulemaking Record in Informal Rulemaking .................................................. 329
  1. The Rulemaking Record as an Aid to Public Participation .... 330
  2. The Rulemaking Record as the Basis for the Agency’s Rulemaking Decisions .............................................. 330
  3. The Rulemaking Record as the Basis for Judicial Review ...... 332
  4. Treatment of “Confidential” Comments ........................... 339

Chapter 7

“Off-the-Record” or “Ex Parte” Communications in Rulemaking ...... 343
A. Summary of the Law .................................................... 343
B. Agency Practices for Handling Ex Parte Communications .... 346
  1. Policy Considerations .............................................. 346
  2. The Administrative Conference’s Recommendations ....... 347
  3. Agency Practice ....................................................... 348
C. Executive Branch Communications in Rulemaking ............ 350
  1. The Administrative Conference’s Recommendations ........ 350
2. The Transparency of OMB’s Review of Agency Rules .................352
3. The Judicial Perspective ............................................354
D. Congressional Communications in Rulemaking .......................355
E. Intra-agency Communications in Rulemaking .........................357
F. Communications with Consultants ....................................359

Chapter 8
The Final Rule .........................................................361
A. Issues for Agency Consideration ....................................361
   1. Time Limits for Agency Action ...................................361
   2. Interagency Coordination and Review ..........................363
   3. International Regulatory Cooperation ............................365
   4. The Final Regulatory Analysis and OMB Review ...............368
   5. Legal and Jurisdictional Issues ..................................369
   6. Determining the Effective Date and Compliance Date for the
       Final Rule ................................................................370
       a. APA requirements; OIRA review ............................370
       b. Congressional review—special impact on major rules ....371
       c. Retroactivity concerns .......................................372
   7. Disqualification of Decisionmakers .................................377
B. The Statement of Basis and Purpose ..................................379
   1. Impact of Judicial Review ..........................................380
   2. Discussion of Alternatives ........................................384
   3. Response to Comments ............................................385
C. Publication of the Final Rule ..........................................389
   1. Section 552 Requirements ........................................389
   2. Federal Register Requirements ...................................390
   3. Plain Language Requirements ....................................395
   4. “Issuance” and “Promulgation” of the Final Rule ...............396
   5. Dissents ..................................................................396

Chapter 9
Agency Responsibilities after the Rule Is Issued .........................399
A. Implementation, Guidance, and Enforcement ..........................399
B. Waivers andExceptions ............................................400
C. Periodic Review of Existing Regulations .............................404
   1. White House Efforts at “Lookback” ..............................406
   2. ACUS Recommendations .......................................409
D. Legal Constraints on Rescinding Existing Rules ....................412
PART IV
JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AGENCY RULEMAKING  .........................415

Chapter 1
Availability of Judicial Review ..........................................417
A. Is the Agency Action Reviewable? ..................................417
B. Who Has Standing to Obtain Judicial Review? ....................421
   1. Under the APA ....................................................421
   2. Associational or Organizational Standing ..................................423
   3. The Injury-in-Fact Test ..............................................426
      a. Origins .........................................................426
      b. The Lujan cases ................................................427
      c. The pendulum swings back in Akins and Laidlaw ..........................428
      d. Massachusetts v. EPA ..........................................431
      e. Cutting back on “probabilistic injury” .................................432
      f. Special rules for “procedural injuries” or “informational injuries”? ..........436
      g. Proof of injury ..................................................439
   4. Causation (Traceability and Redressability) ......................441
   5. Other Statutory and Constitutional (But not Prudential) Principles Governing Standing .............................................444
      a. Prudential or not prudential? ..................................444
      b. The “zone-of-interests” test .....................................445
C. The Proper Forum for Review: Court of Appeals or District Court? ......451
   1. Statutory Review ..................................................451
   2. Non-statutory Review ..............................................455
D. The Venue (Location) of Review ......................................456
E. The Appropriate Timing for Judicial Review .........................458
   1. Finality ............................................................458
   2. Exhaustion .........................................................466
   3. Ripeness ............................................................470
      a. Ripeness and pre-enforcement review ................................472
         i. No pre-enforcement review statute ..................................473
         ii. Pre-enforcement review statutes and deadlines .......................478
      b. “Reopening” the deadline ........................................483
      c. When is the rule “issued” for time-limits purposes? .................485
      d. Time limits and challenges to non-legislative rules ..................487

Chapter 2
The Scope of Judicial Review .............................................489
A. Scope of Review—General Provisions ................................489
   1. APA Section 706(1): “agency action unlawfully withheld or unreasonably delayed” .................490
A Guide to Federal Agency Rulemaking

2. APA Section 706(2)(A): “arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law” ........................................491
   a. Significant Supreme Court decisions applying the arbitrary and capricious test ..................................................496
   b. The “hard look” doctrine ..........................................................500
   c. Scope of review of agency policy changes ........................................509
   d. Debate over the proper place for politics ........................................514
   e. Summary .................................................................................515

3. APA Section 706(2)(B): “contrary to constitutional right, power, privilege, or immunity” ........................................517

4. APA Section 706(2)(C): “in excess of statutory jurisdiction, authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right” ....................517
   a. The Chevron decision ...............................................................519
   b. Step One of Chevron .................................................................521
   c. Step Two of Chevron .................................................................526
   d. When does Chevron apply? .......................................................530
      i. Informal issuances .................................................................536
      ii. Jurisdictional determinations .................................................543
      iii. “Major questions.” ..............................................................545
      iv. Previously litigated interpretations .......................................547
      v. Does all this matter? ..............................................................549
   e. Rising opposition to Chevron .................................................550
   f. When Chevron does not apply, what does Skidmore deference mean? .................................................................554
   g. Judicial deference to agency interpretations of their own regulations .................................................................556

5. APA Section 706(2)(D): “without observance of procedure required by law” .................................................................564
   a. The APA ...............................................................................566
   b. Other statutes ........................................................................566
   c. The agency’s procedural regulations ........................................567
   d. Procedural requirements imposed by courts ...............................568
   e. Need to decide substantive claims after vacating a rule on procedural grounds ....................................................571

6. APA Section 706(2)(E): “unsupported by substantial evidence in a case subject to sections 556 and 557 of this title or otherwise reviewed on the record of an agency hearing provided by statute” ....571

7. APA Section 706(2)(F): “unwarranted by the facts to the extent that the facts are subject to trial de novo by the reviewing court” ....573

B. Record on Review .................................................................574

C. Judicial Remedies .................................................................575
   1. Stays ......................................................................................575
   2. Remand without Vacatur .......................................................577
## Chapter 3

**Judicial Review of Agency Failure to Act** .................................................. 585

A. General Principles ................................................................. 585
B. Types of Agency Inaction ...................................................... 589
   1. Failure to Initiate a Rulemaking ........................................... 589
   2. Delay in a Rulemaking Proceeding ....................................... 596
   3. Termination of Rulemaking ................................................ 599
C. Summary ................................................................. 601

Appendix A: Selected Federal Statutes ................................................. 603

Appendix B: Executive Order No. 12,866: Regulatory Planning and Review ... 635

Appendix C: Executive Order No. 13,563: Improving Regulation and Regulatory Review ......................................................... 649

Appendix D: Executive Order No. 13,771: Reducing Regulation and Controlling Regulatory Costs ......................................................... 653

Table of Cases ................................................................. 657

Index ................................................................. 703