# CONTENTS

About the Author ........................................... xiii
Preface ..................................................... xv
Purpose of This Book ................................. xv
Voluminous Litigation .............................. xv
Handling Hague Cases ............................... xvii
Section of Family Law Publications Development Board ..... xix

Chapter 1

## Introducing the Hague Abduction Convention .............. 1

§ 1.01 Introduction .......................................... 1
§ 1.02 A Revolutionary Treaty ............................ 2
§ 1.03 A Fundamental Misconception .................... 3
§ 1.04 Parties to the Convention ......................... 5
§ 1.05 The Hague Conference ............................... 6
§ 1.06 The Pérez-Vera Report ............................. 6
§ 1.07 U.S. Executive Branch Interpretation .......... 7
§ 1.08 The Purpose of the Treaty ......................... 7
§ 1.09 Custody Jurisdiction and the Hague Convention ... 10
§ 1.10 Best Interests and the Hague Convention .......... 11
§ 1.11 Threats to the Central Tenet ....................... 13
§ 1.12 Essence of the Convention ......................... 15
§ 1.13 The Key Terms in the Hague Convention .......... 16
§ 1.14 Overview of the Exceptions ....................... 16
§ 1.15 Uniform Interpretation ............................ 18
§ 1.16 Uniform Trust ....................................... 19
§ 1.17 Step-by-Step Analysis in any Hague Case .......... 20
§ 1.18 Access Claims ....................................... 21
§ 1.19 Relationship of the Convention to the UCCJEA ... 22
§ 1.20 Hague Convention and Criminal Law ............. 26
§ 1.21 What the Hague Convention Is Not ................ 27
Chapter 2
Procedural and Practical Issues ........................................ 29
§ 2.01 Role of Central Authority ........................................ 29
§ 2.02 The International Child Abduction Remedies Act ........ 32
§ 2.03 Concurrent Jurisdiction ........................................ 34
§ 2.04 The Hague Application ........................................ 35
§ 2.05 Initiating The Case ............................................... 36
§ 2.06 Location of Child ............................................... 39
§ 2.07 Service of Process ................................................ 40
§ 2.08 Expeditious Procedures ......................................... 41
§ 2.09 The Initial Appearance ......................................... 44
§ 2.10 Discovery .......................................................... 44
§ 2.11 Stay of Custody Proceedings .................................... 47
§ 2.12 Guardians/Lawyers for Children ............................... 49
§ 2.13 Evidence .......................................................... 50
§ 2.14 Child’s Testimony ............................................... 52
§ 2.15 Use of Foreign Case Law ......................................... 53
§ 2.16 Article 15 Declarations .......................................... 55
§ 2.17 Comity as to Foreign Hague Orders .......................... 56
§ 2.18 Interim Remedies ................................................ 58
§ 2.19 Fugitive Disentitlement Doctrine ............................... 59
§ 2.20 Place of Return ................................................... 60
§ 2.21 Arrangements for Return ........................................ 61
§ 2.22 Undertakings ...................................................... 63
§ 2.23 Legal Fees and Expenses ........................................ 64
§ 2.24 Stays Pending Appeal ............................................ 69

Chapter 3
Habitual Residence ......................................................... 75
§ 3.01 Introduction ........................................................ 75
§ 3.02 “Habitual Residence” and “Home State” ..................... 77
§ 3.03 “Habitual Residence” and “Domicile” ......................... 78
§ 3.04 Drafting History .................................................. 78
§ 3.05 Timing of a Wrongful Taking ................................... 79
§ 3.06 Timing of a Wrongful Retention ............................... 80
§ 3.07 Overview of the Approaches to Determining Habitual Residence ........................................ 84
§ 3.08 Problems with the Varying Approaches ..................... 86
§ 3.09 International Authorities ........................................ 86
§ 3.10 The First U.S. Approach: Parental Intent Preeminent . . 92
§ 3.11 No Habitual Residence ................................. 93
  § 3.11.1 Determining Parental Intention: The
        Ruling on Mozes ............................... 94
  § 3.11.2 The Ruling in Gitter: An Overview .......... 95
  § 3.11.3 The Ruling in Gitter: Establishing
        Last-Shared Parental Intent .................... 96
  § 3.11.4 Post-Gitter Cases as to Parental
        Intention ................................. 97
  § 3.11.5 Post-Gitter Cases as to Acclimatization . 98
  § 3.11.6 Abandonment ................................. 100
§ 3.12 The Second Approach: The Objective
        Circumstances Test ............................ 101
§ 3.13 The Third Approach: The Blended Test .......... 104
§ 3.14 Policy Considerations .............................. 107
  § 3.14.1 Policy Considerations in Favor of
        Parental Intent ............................ 107
  § 3.14.2 Policy Considerations in Favor of
        Child Focus .............................. 108
§ 3.15 “Acclimatization” and Habitual Residence ...... 110
§ 3.16 Parental Uncertainty ............................... 112
§ 3.17 Conditional Moves ................................. 113
§ 3.18 Implied or Inferred Conditions .................. 115
§ 3.19 Sabbaticals and Time-limited Overseas Postings ... 117
§ 3.20 Habitual Residence of Infants ...................... 119
§ 3.21 Useful Evidence ................................. 121

Chapter 4
Rights of Custody ................................. 125
  § 4.01 Convention Provisions as to “Rights of Custody” . 125
  § 4.02 Step-by-Step Analysis ............................ 126
  § 4.03 Proof of Foreign Law ............................. 128
  § 4.04 Agreements Concerning Custody .................. 130
  § 4.05 Ne Exeat Clause ................................. 131
  § 4.06 Rights of Custody Attributed to an Institution ... 132
  § 4.07 Exercise of Rights of Custody ................... 132
Chapter 5
Consent and Acquiescence ......................... 135
§ 5.01 Convention Provisions as to Consent and Acquiescence ......................... 135
§ 5.02 Consent ..................................... 136
  § 5.02.1 Meaning of the Term .................. 136
  § 5.02.2 Relevant Evidence ...................... 137
  § 5.02.3 Temporary or Permanent Consent ... 140
  § 5.02.4 Retraction of Consent ................. 141
§ 5.03 Acquiescence ............................. 142
§ 5.04 Consent, Acquiescence, and Parallel Litigation ..................... 144
§ 5.05 Discretion ............................... 146

Chapter 6
One Year and Settled .............................. 147
§ 6.01 Introduction ............................... 147
§ 6.02 Purpose of the Exception .................. 148
§ 6.03 When the One-Year Period Commences .... 149
§ 6.04 When Proceedings Commence ............... 150
§ 6.05 No Tolling of the One-Year Period ....... 151
§ 6.06 The “Settled” Requirement ................. 151
§ 6.07 General Principles ......................... 153
§ 6.08 Burden Of Proof .......................... 155
§ 6.09 Age .................................... 155
§ 6.10 Stability of Residence ...................... 156
§ 6.11 Presence of Relatives ...................... 158
§ 6.12 Employment of the Parent ................. 159
§ 6.13 Concealment .............................. 160
§ 6.14 Immigration Status ........................ 161
§ 6.15 Social Lives of the Children ............... 164
§ 6.16 Expert Testimony .......................... 165
§ 6.17 Discretion ............................... 166

Chapter 7
The Child’s Objections ............................ 171
§ 7.01 Introduction ............................... 171
§ 7.02 Burden of Proof ........................... 173
§ 7.03 Similar Cases, Different Results ........... 176
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.04</td>
<td>Age and Maturity</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.04.1</td>
<td>Age of the Child</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.04.2</td>
<td>Maturity</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.05</td>
<td>Expert Evidence</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.06</td>
<td>Guardian Ad Litem</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.07</td>
<td>Clarity and Strength of Opinion</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.08</td>
<td>Undue Influence</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.09</td>
<td>Discretion</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 8
Grave Risk of Harm ........................................... 195
§ 8.01  Introduction ........................................ 195
§ 8.02  The Pérez-Vera Report ............................ 196
§ 8.03  State Department Analysis ....................... 197
§ 8.04  Burden of Proof .................................... 198
§ 8.05  The Distinction Between Hague Cases and Custody Cases: Avoiding a “Best Interests” Analysis ........ 199
§ 8.06  Evidence ............................................ 201
§ 8.07  Expert Testimony .................................. 203
§ 8.08  Narrow Interpretation .............................. 205
§ 8.09  Broader Interpretation ............................. 206
§ 8.10  Grave Risk in General; What Constitutes a “Grave Risk”? ........................................ 208
§ 8.11  Adjustment Problems Insufficient ................. 211
§ 8.12  Separation from Primary Care Provider .......... 212
§ 8.13  Separation from Siblings .......................... 216
§ 8.14  Relative Happiness or Living Conditions Insufficient ........................................ 217
§ 8.15  Financial Hardship Insufficient .................. 221
§ 8.16  Poor Parenting Insufficient ........................ 222
§ 8.17  Must Prior Harm Be Established? .................. 223
§ 8.18  Must the Risk of Harm Be Imminent? ............... 224
§ 8.19  Extent of Harm ....................................... 225
§ 8.20  Isolated or Sporadic Abuse ........................ 226
§ 8.21  Grave Physical Risks: Terrorism and Zones of War | 227 |
§ 8.22  Spousal Abuse ........................................ 229
§ 8.23  Post-traumatic Stress Disorder .................... 232
§ 8.24  Sexual Abuse ......................................... 233
§ 8.25 Need for Medical Treatment .................................. 234
§ 8.26 Intolerable Situation ............................................. 236
§ 8.27 Whether Respondent Must Prove Lack of
Protection in Habitual Residence ................................. 237
  § 8.27.1 Such Proof Is Required ................................. 238
  § 8.27.2 Such Proof Is Not Required ........................... 239
  § 8.27.3 Sufficiency of Such Proof .............................. 240
§ 8.28 Undertakings: Authority to Require Undertakings ........ 242
§ 8.29 Appropriateness of Undertakings ......................... 243
§ 8.30 Opposing Undertakings ...................................... 247
§ 8.31 Types of Undertakings ...................................... 248
§ 8.33 Judicial Discretion .......................................... 249

Chapter 9
Human Rights Exception .............................................. 251
  § 9.01 In General ................................................ 251
  § 9.02 Applicability in Specific Cases .......................... 252

Chapter 10
Rights of Access .................................................. 255
  § 10.1 Introduction ............................................. 255
  § 10.2 Convention Provisions Concerning Access ............. 255
  § 10.3 ICARA Provisions Concerning Access ................. 257
  § 10.4 ICAPRA Provisions Concerning Access ICAPRA .... 257
  § 10.5 Federal Right of Action Concerning Access .......... 258
  § 10.6 International Approaches to Access Provisions ...... 259
  § 10.7 Applicability of Access Provisions .................... 259

Chapter 11
The Hague Convention and International
  Relocation and Travel ........................................... 261
  § 11.1 Introduction ............................................. 261
  § 11.2 International Child Relocation ........................... 261
  § 11.3 International Child Travel ............................... 264
  § 11.4 Provisions of Visitation Order .......................... 269

Appendix 1: Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of
  International Child Abduction ................................. 271
Appendix 2: Explanatory Report Drawn Up by
    Ms. E. Pérez-Vera ......................................... 285
Appendix 3: International Child Abduction Remedies Act .......................... 337
Appendix 4: State Department Legal Analysis ..................................... 345
Appendix 5: Application Under the Hague Convention on the
    Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction ....................... 383
Appendix 6: Hague Convention—General Instructions ......................... 389
Appendix 7: Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and
    Enforcement Act ............................................. 397
Appendix 8: Sean and David Goldman International Child
    Abduction Prevention and Return Act of 2014 ....................... 421
Appendix 9: Uniform Child Abduction Prevention Act ....................... 439
Index ................................................................. 467