

Contents

Preface	xvii
About the Author	xxiii
PART I The Facts and Relationships That Influence Decisions to Settle and Settlement Terms	1
CHAPTER 1 Introduction	3
A. Importance of Patent Settlements	4
B. Advantages of Settlement	5
C. Approach and Tools for Settlement.....	7
1. Economics of Settlement	7
2. Use in Practice	8
3. Data on Patent Litigation	9
4. Legal Issues and Settlement.....	9
D. Uses of the Approach and Tools.....	9
1. Qualitative Analysis	9
2. Quantitative Analysis.....	10
3. Use in Negotiation	10
4. Cooperative, Joint Use of the Approach	11
5. Use in ADR Processes	11
6. Use in Settlement Decisions	12
7. Use in Managing Litigation	12
8. Overcoming the Barriers to Negotiated Settlement.....	13
CHAPTER 2 The Decision to Settle Litigation Based on the Effects of a Judgment on the Patent Owner and the Accused Infringer.....	15
A. Basic Model of Settlement Decisions	15
B. Expected Value and Cost of Litigation	17

C. Impact of Litigation Costs	17
D. Impact of Transaction Costs.....	18
E. Simple Example	19
F. Important Aspects of the Basic Model of Settlement in Patent Actions	23
1. Differences in Probability Estimates Are Highly Likely	23
2. Settlement Prospects Depend on Differences in Probability Estimates and Estimates of the Value and Cost of Judgment, Settlement Payments on Absolute Probabilities and Amounts	24
3. Likelihood of Differences Is Probably Related to Absolute Probabilities	24
4. Efforts to Acquire the Ability to Make and Improve a Probability Estimate Affects the Timing of Settlement	25
5. Confidence in Probability Estimates Should Not Affect the Decision to Settle	27
6. Settlement Occurs before Judgment and Time Is Important.....	28
a. Time Value of Money	28
b. Parties' Cost and Value of Money	29
c. Effect of Infringement and Potential Infringement Liability on the Parties' Businesses	29
7. Importance of Litigation Costs	31
a. When Litigation Costs Should Lead to Settlement	31
b. Effect of Litigation Costs Declines as the Value and Cost of Litigation Increase.....	31
c. Effect of Litigation Costs Declines as the Probabilities of Winning and Losing Increase.....	32
d. Future Litigation Costs Influence Settlement; Past Costs Are Sunk.....	32
e. Some Litigation Costs Change the Probabilities	33
f. Different Incentives to Incur Litigation Costs	33
g. Litigation as a Way to Create Litigation Costs	33
h. Actions Where a Party Pays No Attorneys' Fees	34

G. Impact of Attitudes Toward Risk	35
1. Risk Aversion	36
2. Risk Preference and Loss Aversion	37
3. Identifying Attitudes toward Risk	38
4. Nature of the Risk-Adjusted Value and Cost of Litigation	40
a. Effect of Risk with Both Parties Risk-Averse	43
b. Effect of Risk with Both Parties Preferring Risk	50
c. Effect of Risk with a Risk-Averse Patent Owner and a Risk-Preferring Infringer	51
H. Impact of Increased Damages	51
I. Impact of Attorneys' Fees Awards	55
J. Impact of Counterclaims	58
1. Antitrust Counterclaims	58
2. Actual or Potential Patent Infringement Claims and Counterclaims by Infringers	60
K. Other Aspects of the Basic Model of Settlement in Patent Actions	61
1. More Complex Array of Outcomes	61
2. More Complex Array of Infringers	64
3. More Complex Array of Actions; ITC Proceedings	64
L. Timing of Settlement	65
1. Stages of Patent Litigation: Trial, Summary Judgment, and Claim Construction	65
2. Reexamination Proceedings	66
M. Decision under Alternative Forms of Settlement	67
1. No Injunction, Dismissal without Prejudice, No Release, and No Other Judgment	67
2. No Payment for Past Infringement, Release, Dismissal with Prejudice, and Immunity from Action for Future Infringement	68
3. No License for the Future, Injunction, Payment for Past Infringement, and Release for Past Infringement	68
4. Royalty-Bearing License for the Future, Payment for Past Infringement, and Other Terms	72

CHAPTER 3 The Decision to License Based on the Effects of a License on the Patent Owner and Potential Licensee.....	75
A. Commercial Condition for Licensing	77
1. Owner’s Economic Value of Not Licensing.....	78
2. Expected Payments	81
3. Licensee’s Economic Value with Licensing	81
4. Profits for Purpose of the Decision to License	83
a. Pertinent Costs.....	83
b. Determining the Appropriate Value of Other Fixed Assets	84
c. Identifying Profits at the Appropriate Price and Quantity	84
d. Identifying the Cost of Patents Owned by Others	86
e. Identifying the Value of Inventions and Patents a Patent Owner Does Not Employ in Products	87
5. Effect of Transaction Costs.....	88
6. Effect of Risk.....	88
7. Accounting Approaches to the Economic Value of an Invention	90
B. Litigation Condition for Licensing	91
1. Probability of Litigation	92
2. Licensing and the Value and Cost of Patent Remedies.....	93
3. Licensing and the Value and Cost of an Injunction	93
C. Where Only One Condition Controls Settlement	95
1. Litigation Condition Controls the Past	95
2. Commercial Condition Controls the Future for a Potential Licensee Subject to an Injunction	95
D. Where the Commercial or Litigation Condition Controls Settlement.....	95
1. Commercial or Litigation Factors May Control the Future.....	95
2. Commercial Value Is Greater or Less Than Litigation Value and Cost	96
3. Commercial Value and Litigation Value and Cost Overlap	97
4. Commercial Value Always Includes Litigation Value and Cost, or Litigation Value and Cost Always Include Commercial Value.....	98

E. Decision to Settle and License Where Litigation and Licensing Are Not Alternatives	98
1. Effect of the Law on Both the Decision to License and Royalties with Licensing	99
2. Licensing Unconstrained by <i>Lear</i>	101
3. Licensing Constrained by <i>Lear</i>	102
4. Licensing Constrained by <i>MedImmune</i>	105
F. Existing Licenses May Constrain a Patent Owner’s Decisions on Litigating or Licensing—Licenses to Competitors of the Licensee .	109
G. Agreements to License May Constrain a Patent Owner’s Decisions on Litigating or Licensing	109
CHAPTER 4 The Decision to Settle or License Based on the Added Effects of a Judgment on the Parties’ Relations with Nonparties.....	111
A. The Patent Owner’s Perception of the Effects of a Judgment on Future Actions and Existing and Future Licenses.....	111
1. Value of Successful Litigation in Deterring Infringement by Others, Encouraging Others to License, and Increasing Payments under Existing Licenses	112
2. Cost of Unsuccessful Litigation in Permitting Infringement and Ending Royalty Payments	112
3. Net Future Effect	114
a. Winning Is Not Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Costly	114
b. Winning Is Not Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Very Costly	115
c. Winning Is Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Not Costly	115
d. Winning Is Very Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Not Costly	116
B. Infringer Perceives a Judgment to Be Valuable or Costly for Future Litigation and Licensing	117
1. Potential Cost of Winning to the Infringer	117
2. Potential Value of Winning to the Infringer	118
C. Settlement with Third-Party Effects of a Judgment.....	118

CHAPTER 5 The Decision to Settle or License Based on the Added Effects of an Agreement on the Parties' Relations with Nonparties..... 119

- A. Patent Owner Perceives Settlement or Licensing to Be Valuable or Costly for Future Actions or Licenses 119
 - 1. Licensing One Company at Some Rate Will Limit the Rate Others Will Pay 119
 - 2. Licensing Some Increases the Likelihood Others Will License 120
 - 3. Licensing Increases the Likelihood of a Future Validity Judgment 121
 - 4. Licensing Reduces the Likelihood of Litigation over Validity and the Costs of an Invalidity Judgment..... 121
 - 5. Settlement or Licensing Increases the Likelihood of Litigation with Others 121
 - 6. Settlement or Licensing with One Reduces Payments It Will Obtain from Others..... 122
 - 7. Settlement or Licensing Agreements in One Action Limit the Payments the Owner Will Accept from Others..... 122
 - 8. Payments for One Action Limit Damages for Others 123
 - 9. Net Effect..... 123
- B. Infringer or Potential Licensee Perceives Settlement or Licensing to Be Valuable or Costly for Future Actions or Licenses 123
 - 1. Infringer or Potential Licensee Believes That Settlement or Licensing Will Provide Other Benefits 123
 - 2. Infringer or Potential Licensee Believes That Settlement or Licensing Will Have Costs 124

PART II Applying the Facts and Relationships to Decisions in a Particular Situation..... 125

CHAPTER 6 Applying the Theory of Settlement to a Patent Action..... 127

- A. Pertinent Time Periods 127
- B. Commercial Condition for Licensing 128
- C. Litigation Condition for Settlement 128

D. Settlement with a License	128
1. Settlement for the Past	129
2. Settlement for the Period after Negotiations Commence and Prior to an Injunction	129
3. Settlement for the Period after an Injunction.....	130
E. Settlement without a License	130
F. Damages Measures	130
1. Measures of Reasonable Royalty Damages.....	131
2. Another Possible “Measure” of Damages	137
3. Correct Way to Measure Reasonable Royalty Damages	137
G. Value and Cost of an Injunction.....	138
CHAPTER 7 Examples of Applying the Theory	139
A. Important Patent Controlling a Large and Highly Profitable Market	139
1. Settlement Prospects Based on Expected Values and Cost (Not Risk-Adjusted Value and Cost).....	142
a. Prospects for a License for the Future	143
b. Settlement for Past Infringement.....	145
c. Litigation Alternative.....	145
d. Prospects for Settlement Including a License	146
e. Prospects for Settlement without a License.....	146
f. Summary of Settlement Prospects Based on Expected Values and Cost.....	147
2. Settlement Prospects Based on Risk-Adjusted Values and Cost (Not Expected Value and Cost).....	148
a. Prospects for a License for the Future	148
b. Settlement for Past Infringement.....	150
c. Litigation Alternative.....	150
d. Prospects for Settlement Including a License	151
e. Prospects for Settlement without a License.....	151
f. Summary of Settlement Prospects in Dollars Based on Risk-Adjusted Expected Values and Cost	151

3. Prospects for Settlement Based on the Effects of a Judgment on Third Parties.....	152
4. Settlement Prospects Given Different Assumptions on the Probabilities of Winning and Losing	154
5. The Results of the Analysis Shown as a Percentage of Sales Revenue, a Dollar Amount per Unit, and a Lump Sum	156
a. Settlement Range as a Percentage of Infringer Sales	157
b. Settlement Range as Dollars per Unit of Infringer Sales	158
c. Lump-Sum Payments	158
6. Settlement with a License When No Action Is Pending	160
B. Important Patent Controlling a Smaller Market.....	162
1. Effect of Large Attorneys' Fees	163
2. Patent Owner Pays No Attorneys' Fees—Owner with Attorneys on Contingent Fees	165
C. Important Patent Controlling a Smaller Market with Potential for Increased Damages and Attorneys' Fees Award.....	166
D. Licensing an Important Patent Controlling a Smaller Market with No Past Infringement—Licensing	169
E. Important Patent Controlling a Large Market with a Patent Owner Unable to Produce or Sell—The Nonproducing Patent Owner	172
F. Less-Important Patent Controlling a Large Market	173
G. Important Patent Controlling an Average Market with No Gains from Licensing	179
PART III The Empirical Data on Patent Litigation and Settlement.....	183
CHAPTER 8 The Number, Time, and Manner of Resolution of Patent Actions.....	185
A. Overview of Empirical Data on Patent Litigation and Settlement.....	185
B. Increase in Patent Litigation	186
C. Use of Trial to Decide Patent Actions	186
D. Frequency of Patent Actions Resolved by Pretrial Motion.....	189
E. Frequency of Patent Actions Resolved by Settlement in the District Courts	191

F. Uniformity in Method of Disposition Over Time	194
G. Settlement after Judgment and Prior to Appeal	197
H. Settlement during Appeal.....	197
I. Time from Filing to Disposition by Trial, Pretrial Motion, and Settlement.....	199
1. Median Time to Termination	199
2. Average or Mean Time to Termination.....	200
3. Relative Time-wise Efficiency of Different Methods	200
4. Year-to-Year Variance	204
J. Procedural Stage and Time of Settlement of Infringement Actions	208
CHAPTER 9 The Outcome of Patent Actions	211
A. Patent Owner Win Rates in the District Courts.....	211
1. Total Judgments	211
2. Trial.....	212
3. Pretrial Motion.....	213
4. Trial and Pretrial Motion	213
5. Weighted Average Win Rates.....	213
6. Historical Win Rates	214
7. Judge and Jury Trial.....	216
B. Patent Owner Win Rates in the Federal Circuit	217
1. The Dunner Study.....	217
2. The Moore Study	219
3. The Allison and Lemley Study	219
4. Janicke and Ren Study.....	219
5. Overall Effect.....	220
C. Observations on Patent Owner Win Rates	220
1. Appeal.....	221
2. Declaratory Judgments	221
3. Systematic Differences in Predictions	221
4. Third-Party Effects	222

5. Differences in the Value of Winning and Cost of Losing	224
6. What Is Winning?	225
7. Other Influences.....	226
D. Patent Owner Win Rates on Particular Issues	226
1. Dunner Study	226
2. Allison and Lemley Study	226
3. Moore Study	229
4. Summary.....	230
E. Patent Injunctions.....	230
F. Patent Damages.....	231
1. Damages Data and Adjustments	231
2. Average or Mean Awards.....	232
3. Damages and the Profitability of Litigation	233
4. Litigation When Not Justified by Expected Damages.....	236
5. Highly Skewed Distribution of Damages Awards	237
6. Awards Other Than after Trial	242
7. Total Awards at Trial	243
G. Increased Damages	244
H. Attorneys' Fees Awards	244

PART IV Laws That Influence Decisions to Settle and License 245

CHAPTER 10 Settlement and the Law 247

A. Substantive Patent Law	247
B. Settlement of Patent Disputes before Litigation	248
1. Background.....	248
2. Licensee Estoppel	249
3. Eviction	250
4. <i>Lear</i> Eliminated Licensee Estoppel.....	251
5. <i>Lear</i> Is Read (Incorrectly) to Prevent Enforcement of Agreements Not to Contest Validity	251

C. Settlement of Patent Disputes during Litigation	252
1. License Entered as Part of Settlement	252
2. Settlement Agreement and Order.....	253
3. Settlement Agreement.....	254
4. Consent Judgment.....	256
5. Dismissal With or Without Prejudice.....	259
6. Injunction and Contempt	262
7. Other Issues	265
D. Declaratory Judgment Actions and Jurisdiction	265
1. Declaratory Judgment Actions by Licensees	266
2. What Licensees Should Do after <i>Lear</i> and <i>MedImmune</i>	273
3. What Patent Owners Should Do after <i>Lear</i> and <i>MedImmune</i>	275
4. Declaratory Judgment Actions by Potential Infringers-Licensees	284
E. Antitrust Law and Settlement	289
1. Enforcement of Patents	290
2. Agreements to Settle Patent Actions.....	292
3. Agreements among Patent Owners about Licensing	294
4. Agreements among Infringers or Potential Licensees about Licensing.....	295
5. Settlement with Payments by Patent Owner to Infringer— Reverse Payments	296
6. Agreements Not to Contest Validity	302
F. Patent Misuse and Settlement	303
G. Agreements to License on FRAND and RAND Terms	305
H. Legislation to Change the Laws That Interfere with Licensing and Settlement.....	310
Index	317