

# Contents

Acknowledgments . . . . .	xvii
About the Contributors . . . . .	xix
CHAPTER 1 Commencing the Lawsuit . . . . .	1
I. CASE EVALUATION: “TO TAKE, OR NOT TO TAKE?” . . . . .	2
A. How Strong Is the Plaintiff’s Case? . . . . .	2
B. What Are the Plaintiff’s Damages? . . . . .	6
C. Does the Plaintiff Make a Good, Appealing Witness? . . . . .	9
D. Is the Employer Financially Solvent? . . . . .	11
II. DRAFTING THE COMPLAINT: THE THEME OF THE CASE . . . . .	11
III. VENUE AND FORUM . . . . .	12
IV. RELIEF . . . . .	13
APPENDIXES . . . . .	15
1-A. Employment Discrimination Questionnaire . . . . .	17
1-B. Checklist of Claims . . . . .	24
1-C. Sample Complaints . . . . .	25
CHAPTER 2 Responding to the Lawsuit . . . . .	37
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	38
II. SELECTING AND RETAINING OUTSIDE COUNSEL . . . . .	38
III. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST . . . . .	40
A. Representing Multiple Defendants . . . . .	40
B. Insurance Situations . . . . .	41

IV. EVALUATING LIABILITY . . . . .	42
A. Threshold Issues . . . . .	42
B. Investigation of the Claim . . . . .	45
V. PREPARING THE INITIAL EVALUATION . . . . .	53
VI. PREPARING THE LEGAL RESPONSE . . . . .	53
A. Removal . . . . .	53
B. Motion to Transfer Venue . . . . .	54
C. Motion for Rule 7 Reply . . . . .	54
D. Motion to Dismiss . . . . .	55
E. Compelling Arbitration . . . . .	56
F. The Answer . . . . .	56
G. Offer of Judgment . . . . .	57
H. Corrective Action, Such as Unconditional Offer of Reinstatement . . . . .	57
VII. CONCLUSION . . . . .	58
APPENDIXES . . . . .	59
2-A Sample Individual Defendant Engagement Letter . . . . .	61
2-B Defense Litigation Checklist and Timetable . . . . .	63
CHAPTER 3 Discovery . . . . .	67
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	68
II. RECENT CHANGES TO DISCOVERY RULES . . . . .	69
III. INITIAL DISCOVERY CONFERENCE . . . . .	69
A. Litigation Holds . . . . .	70
B. Format for the Production of Documents . . . . .	72
C. Privilege and Waiver Issues . . . . .	74
D. Metadata . . . . .	76
IV. WITNESS INTERVIEWS . . . . .	77
V. INITIAL DISCLOSURES . . . . .	78
VI. WRITTEN DISCOVERY REQUESTS . . . . .	79
A. Interrogatories . . . . .	79
B. Document Requests . . . . .	80
C. Requests for Admission . . . . .	81
D. Third-Party Discovery . . . . .	81
VII. RESPONDING TO WRITTEN DISCOVERY REQUESTS . . . . .	83
A. Objections . . . . .	83
B. Accurate and Complete Responses . . . . .	84

C. Stipulated Protective Order Concerning Confidential Information . . . . .	85
VIII. DISCOVERY-RELATED MOTIONS . . . . .	86
A. Certification of Good-Faith Effort to Narrow or Resolve Dispute . . . . .	86
B. Motions to Compel . . . . .	87
C. Motions for Protective Order and Motions to Quash . . .	91
D. Sanctions . . . . .	92
IX. DEPOSITION BY ORAL EXAMINATION . . . . .	92
A. Fact Witnesses . . . . .	93
B. Rule 30(b)(6) Depositions . . . . .	93
C. Keeper of the Records Deposition . . . . .	94
D. Expert Witnesses . . . . .	95
E. Video Conferencing and/or Videotaped Depositions . . .	95
APPENDIXES . . . . .	97
3-A Defendant’s First Request for Production of Documents to the Plaintiff . . . . .	99
3-B Defendant’s First Set of Interrogatories to the Plaintiff . . . . .	102
3-C Employee’s Interrogatories to the Employer. . . . .	107
3-D Employee’s Document Requests to the Employer. . .	109
3-E Stipulated Protective Order Respecting Confidential Information. . . . .	111
3-F Discovery Preservation Letter to Employer . . . . .	116
3-G Preservation of Evidence Letter to Client. . . . .	117
CHAPTER 4 Experts . . . . .	119
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	120
II. DO YOU NEED EXPERTS FOR YOUR CASE? . . . . .	121
A. In General . . . . .	121
B. Checklist for Retention of Experts . . . . .	122
III. TRADITIONAL USES FOR EXPERT TESTIMONY IN EMPLOYMENT CASES . . . . .	123
A. Prima Facie Employment Discrimination . . . . .	123
B. Disparate Impact Cases . . . . .	124
C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Cases . . . . .	124
D. Disability Discrimination Cases . . . . .	125

- E. Emotional Distress Claims . . . . . 125
- F. Economic Damages Claims . . . . . 127
- G. Issues Regarding Plaintiff’s Inability  
to Be Employed . . . . . 128
- IV. EXPERT DISCOVERY . . . . . 128
  - A. Initial Disclosures . . . . . 129
  - B. Classes of Experts . . . . . 129
  - C. Work Product and Attorney-Client Privilege . . . . . 131
  - D. Discovery Considerations . . . . . 133
- V. NEW TRENDS IN THE USE OF EXPERT TESTIMONY . 134
  - A. Hostile Environment in Sexual Harassment Litigation 135
  - B. Stereotyping . . . . . 137
  - C. Plaintiff’s Failure to Complain . . . . . 138
  - D. The Employer’s Antidiscrimination Policies  
and Procedures . . . . . 139
  - E. Retaliation . . . . . 140
- VI. EXPERT TRIAL PREPARATION ASSISTANCE . . . . . 140
  - A. Jury Consultants . . . . . 140
  - B. Graphic Arts Specialists . . . . . 141
- VII. CONCLUSION . . . . . 141
- CHAPTER 5 Summary Judgment . . . . . 143
  - I. INTRODUCTION . . . . . 144
  - II. SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND THE DISCOVERY  
PROCESS . . . . . 144
  - III. LEGAL PRINCIPLES . . . . . 145
    - A. The Respective Burdens of Proof Imposed  
by Rule 56 . . . . . 145
    - B. The Supreme Court’s Guidance . . . . . 146
    - C. What Constitutes a “Genuine” Issue  
of “Material Fact”? . . . . . 148
    - D. Different Federal Courts of Appeal and States  
Apply Summary Judgment Differently . . . . . 148
  - IV. INTEGRATING THE SUMMARY JUDGMENT  
STANDARD WITH THE BURDEN OF PROOF  
IN DISCRIMINATION CASES . . . . . 148
    - A. Issues Related to Intent and Motive . . . . . 149
    - B. Demonstrating a Genuine Issue of Material Fact . . . . 151

C. Issues Related to Direct Evidence of Discrimination . . . . .	157
V. DRAFTING A MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT . . . . .	158
A. The First Step—Prima Facie Case . . . . .	158
B. The Second Step—The Employer’s Legitimate Reason for the Personnel Decision . . . . .	160
C. The Third Step—Pretext . . . . .	161
D. The Ultimate Question—Intent . . . . .	161
E. The Mixed-Motive Case . . . . .	163
F. Secondary Considerations . . . . .	164
G. The Drafter’s Art . . . . .	164
VI. OPPOSING THE MOTION . . . . .	165
VII. WHEN SHOULD A PLAINTIFF CROSS-MOVE FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT? . . . . .	167
VIII. CONCLUSION . . . . .	168
CHAPTER 6 Pretrial Motions . . . . .	169
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	170
II. MOTIONS IN LIMINE . . . . .	170
A. Motions in Limine in Employment Litigation . . . . .	171
B. How to Bring a Motion in Limine . . . . .	176
C. How to Handle a Motion in Limine at Trial . . . . .	177
D. Available Sanctions for Violation of a Motion in Limine . . . . .	178
III. MOTIONS TO SEVER AND MOTIONS TO BIFURCATE . . . . .	179
A. Deciding Whether to Sever the Trial . . . . .	179
B. Deciding Whether to Bifurcate the Trial . . . . .	180
C. How to Sever or to Bifurcate Trials . . . . .	180
D. Opposing Motions to Sever or to Bifurcate . . . . .	181
IV. CONCLUSION . . . . .	181
APPENDIXES . . . . .	183
6-A. Pretrial Motions Checklist . . . . .	185
6-B. Motion to Bifurcate Trial . . . . .	186
6-C. Motion in Limine. . . . .	187
6-D. Motion to Sever . . . . .	188

CHAPTER 7	Special Evidentiary Concerns . . . . .	189
I.	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	190
II.	STRAY REMARKS OR DIRECT EVIDENCE . . . . .	191
III.	EVIDENCE OF DISCRIMINATION (OR LACK THEREOF) AGAINST OTHER EMPLOYEES . . . . .	192
A.	General Admissibility Standard . . . . .	193
B.	Circumstantial Evidence of Intent through Similar Treatment of Comparators . . . . .	194
C.	Circumstantial Evidence through Pattern and Practice through Other Supervisor's Conduct . . . . .	197
D.	Circumstantial Evidence of Intent through Statistics . . .	198
E.	Evidence Regarding Imputing Liability . . . . .	200
IV.	ADMISSIBILITY OF ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCY FINDINGS . . . . .	201
A.	In General . . . . .	201
B.	Federal Rule of Evidence 803(8), Public Records and Reports . . . . .	201
C.	Federal Rule of Evidence 403, Probative Value versus Prejudice . . . . .	201
D.	Case Law on Admissibility . . . . .	202
V.	ADMISSIBILITY OF PLAINTIFF'S PRIOR CONDUCT AND LAWSUITS, INCLUDING SEXUAL BEHAVIOR . . . . .	203
A.	In General . . . . .	203
B.	Defendant's Perspective . . . . .	204
C.	Plaintiff's Perspective . . . . .	204
VI.	ADMISSIBILITY OF ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE . . . . .	205
A.	Relevance of ESI under Federal Rule of Evidence 401 . . . . .	205
B.	Authenticity of ESI under Federal Rules of Evidence 901–902 . . . . .	206
C.	ESI as Hearsay under Federal Rules of Evidence 801–807 . . . . .	207
D.	ESI and the Original Writing Rules . . . . .	209
E.	Balancing Probative Value against the Danger of Unfair Prejudice under Federal Rule of Evidence 403 . . . . .	209
VII.	AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE . . . . .	210

VIII. DAMAGES .....	213
A. Emotional Injury .....	213
IX. EVIDENCE FOR REDUCTION OF BACK PAY AND FRONT PAY .....	215
A. Evidence Regarding a Failure to Mitigate .....	215
B. Punitive Damages .....	216
X. SPOILIATION .....	217
XI. CONCLUSION .....	220
 CHAPTER 8 Trial Preparation .....	 221
I. INTRODUCTION .....	222
II. OVERRIDING STRATEGY CONSIDERATIONS .....	222
A. Plaintiff’s Perspective .....	222
B. Defendant’s Perspective .....	226
III. SELECTION AND PREPARATION OF WITNESSES .....	228
A. Plaintiff’s Perspective .....	228
B. Defendant’s Perspective .....	229
IV. SELECTION AND PREPARATION OF EXHIBITS .....	236
A. Plaintiff’s Perspective .....	236
B. Defendant’s Perspective .....	237
V. PREPARING FOR CROSS-EXAMINATION .....	239
A. Plaintiff’s Perspective .....	239
B. Defendant’s Perspective .....	239
 APPENDIXES .....	 243
8-A. Plaintiff’s Checklist .....	245
8-B. Defendant’s Checklist .....	246
8-C. Witness Preparation Checklist .....	248
8-D. Sample Trial Outline .....	249
 CHAPTER 9 Juries .....	 251
I. INTRODUCTION .....	252
II. JURY CONSULTANTS .....	253
A. What Is Jury Consulting? .....	253
B. What Do Jury Consultants Do? .....	254
C. Advantages and Disadvantages of Using Jury Consultants .....	256
D. What to Look for When Choosing a Consultant .....	258

- E. The Bottom Line—When to Use Jury Consultants . . . 259
- III. JURY SELECTION—POINTERS . . . . . 259
  - A. Be the Master of the Jury Pool . . . . . 260
  - B. Consider Use of a Jury Consultant . . . . . 260
  - C. Know Your Jury Pool . . . . . 260
  - D. Managing Information during Voir Dire . . . . . 261
  - E. Counsel’s Introduction to the Jury . . . . . 261
  - F. Think before Choosing . . . . . 262
- IV. CHALLENGES . . . . . 262
- V. JURY INSTRUCTIONS . . . . . 266
- VI. SPECIAL VERDICTS AND INTERROGATORIES . . . . . 266
  - A. Special Verdicts . . . . . 266
  - B. General Verdict Accompanied by Answer to Interrogatories . . . . . 267
  - C. Discretion of the Court . . . . . 268
  - D. Form and Sufficiency of the Special Verdict . . . . . 269
- APPENDIXES . . . . . 271
  - 9-A Jury Questionnaire/Voir Dire—*Weeks v. Baker & Mckenzie, et al.* [As Modified]. . . . . 273
  - 9-B Jury Instructions [Partial]—*Weeks v. Baker & Mckenzie, et al.* . . . . . 293
  - 9-C Special Verdict—*Weeks v. Baker & Mckenzie, et al.* 299
  - 9-D Juror Profile Sheet . . . . . 302
- CHAPTER 10 The Trial . . . . . 305
  - I. INTRODUCTION . . . . . 306
  - II. PRELIMINARY MATTERS . . . . . 307
  - III. OPENING STATEMENTS . . . . . 307
    - A. Presentation Style . . . . . 308
    - B. Persuasive Content . . . . . 309
    - C. Visual Aids . . . . . 311
    - D. Timing . . . . . 311
    - E. Plaintiff’s Opening . . . . . 312
    - F. Defendant’s Opening . . . . . 314
    - G. Objections . . . . . 316
    - H. Nonsuit . . . . . 317



IV. DIRECT AND CROSS-EXAMINATION . . . . .	317
A. Direct Examination . . . . .	317
B. Cross-Examination . . . . .	322
V. CLOSING ARGUMENT . . . . .	325
A. Presentation Style . . . . .	325
B. Persuasive Content . . . . .	326
C. Plaintiff’s Closing . . . . .	328
D. Defendant’s Closing . . . . .	329
E. Objections . . . . .	331
VI. CLOSING NOTE . . . . .	332
VII. TECHNOLOGY IN THE COURTROOM . . . . .	333
A. Courtroom Technology . . . . .	333
B. Forms of Technology Attorneys Can Use at Trial . . . . .	335
C. The Effect of Technology . . . . .	340
VIII. COURTROOM TECHNOLOGY CONCLUSION . . . . .	344
APPENDIX 10-A Trial Checklist . . . . .	345
CHAPTER 11 Post-Trial Motions . . . . .	349
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	350
II. POST-VERDICT MOTION FOR JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW . . . . .	350
A. In General . . . . .	350
B. The Standard . . . . .	352
III. MOTIONS FOR NEW TRIAL . . . . .	354
A. In General . . . . .	354
B. The Standard . . . . .	355
IV. PETITION FOR ATTORNEYS’ FEES AND OTHER COSTS . . . . .	356
A. Attorneys’ Fees . . . . .	356
B. Costs . . . . .	361
V. MOTION FOR REMITTITUR (OR ADDITUR) . . . . .	362
APPENDIXES . . . . .	363
11-A Post-Verdict Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law Checklist . . . . .	365
11-B Motion for a New Trial Checklist . . . . .	366

11-C Motion for Attorneys' Fees and Costs Checklist . . . . .	367
CHAPTER 12 Appeals . . . . .	369
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	370
II. APPEALABILITY . . . . .	370
A. Final Decision Rule . . . . .	370
B. Separate Document Rule . . . . .	375
C. Review by Mandamus . . . . .	376
D. Appeal of Magistrate Rulings . . . . .	376
III. NOTICE OF APPEAL . . . . .	377
IV. EFFECT ON PROCEEDINGS IN THE TRIAL COURT . . .	378
A. Transfer of Jurisdiction . . . . .	378
B. Stays . . . . .	378
V. RECORD ON APPEAL . . . . .	379
VI. BRIEFS . . . . .	380
A. Technical Rules . . . . .	380
B. Effective Brief Writing . . . . .	381
VII. ORAL ARGUMENT . . . . .	382
APPENDIXES . . . . .	385
12-A Appeals Checklist . . . . .	387
12-B Sample Notice of Appeal . . . . .	389
12-C Sample Corporate Disclosure Statement. . . . .	390
12-D Statement of Jurisdiction . . . . .	391
CHAPTER 13 Professionalism and Ethics . . . . .	393
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	394
II. PLAINTIFF'S COUNSEL'S RESPONSIBILITIES IN REPRESENTING CURRENT AND FORMER EMPLOYEES AS CLIENTS . . . . .	395
A. Analysis of Claims Includes Other Responsibilities . .	395
B. Conflicts . . . . .	396
C. Confirmation of Appointment and Parameters of Consultation . . . . .	397
D. The First Meeting . . . . .	397
E. Preliminary Investigation . . . . .	398
F. Fee Agreements . . . . .	398

G. Time Limits . . . . .	399
H. Settlement . . . . .	400
I. Listening to the Client . . . . .	400
III. DEFENSE RESPONSIBILITIES . . . . .	400
IV. OTHER RESPONSIBILITIES FOR REPRESENTING ENTITIES (CORPORATIONS, UNIONS, AND ASSOCIATIONS) . . . . .	401
V. SUBSTANTIVE TOPICS . . . . .	402
A. Abusive Discovery . . . . .	402
B. Attorney-Client Privilege . . . . .	403
C. Inadvertent Disclosure . . . . .	403
D. Class Actions . . . . .	404
E. Conflicts of Interest . . . . .	405
F. Electronic Discovery (“e-Discovery”) . . . . .	406
G. Discoverability of Metadata . . . . .	407
H. Insurance . . . . .	409
I. Internal Investigations/“Critical Self-Analysis” Privilege . . . . .	409
J. Joint Defense Agreements . . . . .	410
K. Joint Representation . . . . .	411
L. Negotiating Settlements . . . . .	411
M. Payment of Fees by Non-Client . . . . .	412
N. Publicity . . . . .	412
O. Rule 11 . . . . .	413
P. Soliciting . . . . .	413
Q. Threatening Criminal Charges . . . . .	413
R. Witness Interviews/Ex Parte Contacts . . . . .	414
S. Work Product Doctrine . . . . .	417
APPENDIXES . . . . .	419
13-A Professionalism and Ethics Checklist . . . . .	421
13-B Potential Client Cover Sheet (for Telephone Inquiry) . . . . .	423
13-C Initial Consultation Confirmation Letter . . . . .	426
13-D Consultation Follow-up Letter with Fee Agreement . . . . .	427
13-E Disclosure Statement . . . . .	428
13-F Contingency Fee Agreement . . . . .	430

13-G Hourly Rate Fee Agreement . . . . .	434
13-H Defense Counsel Engagement Letter . . . . .	436
13-I Joint Defense Agreement . . . . .	438
CHAPTER 14 Arbitration and Mediation . . . . .	443
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	444
II. ARBITRATION . . . . .	444
A. What Is Arbitration? . . . . .	444
B. The Difference between Labor Arbitration and Non-Labor Arbitration . . . . .	445
C. When Must a Party Arbitrate? . . . . .	448
D. Pros & Cons of Arbitration . . . . .	463
III. MEDIATION . . . . .	470
A. What Is Mediation? . . . . .	470
B. When Should a Party Choose to Mediate a Claim? . . .	470
C. How Should Attorneys Prepare for Mediation? . . . . .	471
D. What Happens at Mediation? . . . . .	471
E. Enforcement of Agreements Reached in Mediation . . .	471
CHAPTER 15 Settlement in Employment Litigation . . . . .	473
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	473
II. DEFINING THE PARTIES . . . . .	474
III. RELEASING THE CLAIMS . . . . .	479
IV. OTHER EMPLOYEE COMMITMENTS . . . . .	488
V. PAYMENT ISSUES . . . . .	491
VI. OTHER EMPLOYER COMMITMENTS . . . . .	496
VII. OTHER ISSUES . . . . .	500
VIII. STRATEGIC TOOLS . . . . .	502
IX. SETTLEMENT IN LITIGATION . . . . .	506
X. CONCLUSION . . . . .	508