# Contents

Foreword ................................................................. ix

Acknowledgments ......................................................... xiii

Dedication ................................................................. xv

Introduction ............................................................... xvii

**CHAPTER 1**  
Discovery of Electronic Evidence .............. 1

I. The Evolution of E-discovery ...................... 3

II. The Rules of E-discovery .......................... 11

   A. Electronically Stored Information Is Discoverable ........ 12

   B. Parties Must Give Early Attention to E-discovery .......... 16

      1. Initial Disclosures ...................................... 17

      2. Conference of the Parties ............................... 21

      3. Discovery Planning Conference ........................... 23

   C. Two Tiers of Discoverable Information—Data That Is Not Reasonably Accessible ..................... 28

      1. Approaches to Cost Allocation ............................ 37

      2. Another Approach to Cost Allocation ........................ 46

      3. Sampling as a Factor in Cost Allocation .................. 46

      4. Cost Allocation in Practice ............................... 47

   D. Privilege and the Discovery of Electronically Stored Information ........................................... 49

   E. Written Discovery ............................................. 53

      1. Testing and Sampling .................................... 53

      2. Form of Production ....................................... 53

      3. Rule 33(d)—Interrogatories ............................... 56

      4. Subpoenas .................................................. 56

   F. Sanctions and the Spoliation “Safe Harbor” .................. 57

III. The Practical Side of E-discovery .............. 59

   A. Counsel Must Acquire a Working Understanding of Potentially Relevant ESI ............................. 59

      1. Build an E-discovery Team ............................... 61
2. Understand and Improve Information Technology Architecture ........................................ 62
3. Develop a Preservation Process ........................................ 63
4. Developing a Retention Plan ........................................ 73
5. Issuing Instructions to Custodians to Preserve Potentially Relevant Records .................. 75
6. Design and Implement E-discovery Guidelines ........................................ 76
7. Identify a Preferred Vendor Network ........................................ 76
8. Consider Acquiring or Licensing Appropriate Tools ........................................ 77

CHAPTER 2

Spoliation ........................................ 79

I. Overview ........................................ 80
II. The Basics ........................................ 86
   A. When Does the Duty to Preserve Arise? ........................................ 89
   B. Does the Client’s Obligation to Preserve Create Duties for Legal Counsel? .................. 101
   C. What Must Be Retained and Preserved? ........................................ 106
      1. Privileged Materials ........................................ 116
      2. Duration of the Duty to Preserve ........................................ 118
   D. Prejudice to Discovering Party ........................................ 120
III. Is Bad Faith Required? ........................................ 133
IV. Consequences of Spoliation ........................................ 153
   A. Spoliation Is an Implied Admission by Conduct ........................................ 168
   B. Logical Inference Instructions ........................................ 172
   C. The Strange Spoliation Presumption ........................................ 172
   D. Authority for Penalizing Destruction ........................................ 176
V. Burden of Persuasion ........................................ 179
VI. Choice of Law Question ........................................ 180
VII. Proving the Claim of Spoliation—You’re Not Bound By the Rules of Evidence .................. 180
VIII. Evidence of Spoliation—Evidence of One’s Conduct to Prove the Truth of Its Implied Message—Is It Hearsay? ........................................ 181
IX. Spoliation and the Attorney-Client Privilege ........................................ 182
X. Standard of Appellate Review ........................................ 183
XI. Computers and the Internet Expand Every Possibility ........................................ 183
   A. Do Not Delete Records or Destroy Equipment ........................................ 186
   B. Save the Hard Drives ........................................ 188
   C. Don’t Forget Personal Digital Assistants and Jump Drives ........................................ 188
   D. Informal Encouragement to Others to Preserve Data ........................................ 189

CHAPTER 3

Confidentiality and the Attorney-Client Privilege ........................................ 191

I. The Attorney-Client Privilege and Its Elements ........................................ 193
   A. History of the Confidentiality Requirement ........................................ 195
   B. Evolution of the Confidentiality Requirement ........................................ 198
1. Ever-Expanding Circle ......................................... 198
2. Ignoring Confidentiality ......................................... 201
   a. Stolen documents ........................................... 201
   b. Judicially compelled disclosures ............................ 203
   c. The unauthorized agent exception ....................... 206
   d. Inadvertent disclosures—the “oops” rule ............... 207
   e. Disclosures under protective orders or with
      reservations ................................................. 210
3. Confidentiality Must Be Maintained and Documented—
   The Increasing Problem of Outside Agents Functioning
   as Employees .................................................. 215
C. E-mail—An Extension of Existing Services and
   Technology ...................................................... 221
   1. From Face-to-Face Communications to Letters ............ 221
   2. From Letters to Telephones ................................ 221
   3. From Telephones to Computers ............................. 222
D. Employees’ Personal Expectation of Confidentiality in E-mail
   Communications ............................................... 224
E. Data Behind Electronic Evidence—Metadata .................. 234
F. Electronic Presentations ......................................... 236
G. Measures to Preserve Confidentiality? ......................... 239
H. Asserting Attorney-Client Privilege for E-mails: The Practical
   Details, a Growing Concern .................................. 243
   1. Expanding the Role of In-House Counsel—Jeopardizing
      the Applicability of the Privilege ........................ 244
   2. Complicating the Distinction Between Communications
      and Information ............................................ 248
   3. How Is the Document Described in a Privilege Log? ... 252
   4. Are Operating Assumptions About the Purpose of
      Communications Appropriate Based on the Individuals
      to Whom They Have Been Disseminated? ............... 258
      a. When business and legal communications can be
         separated ................................................. 261
      b. When business and legal advice are inextricably
         intertwined ............................................. 264
I. Spoliation and the Crime/Fraud Exception to the Attorney-
   Client Privilege ............................................... 289
J. Work Product Immunity Vis-à-Vis E-evidence .................. 291

CHAPTER 4    Best Evidence/Original Writing Rule ............ 297
I. The Basics ..................................................... 298
II. E-Evidence and the Original Writing Rule ..................... 303
III. The Added Complexity of Summaries of Voluminous Materials ... 307
    A. The Hearsay Dimensions of Summaries ................. 308
1. Non-hearsay Argument ........................................309
2. Residual Exception Solution .................................310
B. Insurmountable Hearsay Problems Created by Summaries of
Voluminous Materials from the Internet ..................311
C. The Evidentiary Status of Summaries under the Voluminous
Writings Exception to the Original Writing Rule ........312

Chapter 5  Presumptions ...........................................315
I. The Basics ......................................................317
II. Common Law Presumptions That Can Be Relevant to
Authenticating E-commerce and E-mail ....................323
A. Receipt of Mailed Letters ..................................323
B. Authority to Transact Business .........................325
C. Authority to Use an Instrumentality ..................325
D. Responsibility for Damage or Loss ......................326
III. Authentication of E-commerce—Problems with Presumptions
under the Federal Rules of Evidence ..................326

Chapter 6  Authentication ...........................................333
I. The Basics ......................................................335
II. Methods of Authentication ..................................339
A. Self-identification ...........................................348
   1. Self-identification by the Sender: Establishing That a
      Letter Was Actually Written by the Person Named as
      Author ..................................................348
   2. Self-identification by the Recipient: Establishing That a
      Message Was Received by the Fact That It Was Sent to
      That Individual’s Address and He Responded to It ....350
B. Content .......................................................352
C. Extrinsic Circumstances ...................................354
III. Authenticating Digital Photographs .......................357
A. The Key Is the Chain of Custody .........................360
B. Desirable Enhancement Versus Unacceptable Manipulation .362
C. Authenticate the Computer Program Too ..............367
D. The Internet Complication .................................367
E. A Spoliation Problem .....................................368
IV. Authentication of Web Page Postings from the Internet ...369
A. Relaxation of Authentication Requirements ..............374
B. Self-authentication and the Internet .....................376
   1. Public Document Under Seal ............................381
   2. Business Solicitations and Postings .................382
   3. Government Postings ..................................384
   4. Newspapers and Periodicals .........................385
   5. Limits of Self-authentication .........................385
C. Authenticating with Technology ........................... 386
   1. Data Trails ........................................... 386
   2. Electronic Signatures ................................. 387
   3. Public Key Infrastructure ............................ 390
   4. Biometric Authentication ......................... 391
V. Authentication of Computer Animations, Models, and Simulations .......... 391
VI. Authentication of Authenticating Technology .......................... 393
VII. Other Issues Relating to Authentication of E-evidence ............... 395
   A. Chain of Custody .................................. 395
   B. Expanded Pretrial Discovery May Justify a Lesser Foundation ................. 399
   C. Admissibility and Weight: Two Bites at the Same Apple .... 400
   D. A Reality Check .................................. 400

CHAPTER 7  Hearsay .............................................. 401
I. The Basics ........................................... 403
   A. Two Truths of Hearsay ............................... 404
II. Hearsay Admissible Through Exceptions .......................... 409
   A. Multiple Levels of Hearsay ......................... 410
   B. Writings Are Like Another Person Speaking, Repeating the Out-of-Court Declarations of the Author .......... 412
III. Why Is It Relevant? .................................. 414
IV. Mechanically Produced Statements Are Not Hearsay ................. 415
V. Evidence from the Internet ................................ 417
   A. Nonhearsay from the Internet ...................... 417
   B. Hearsay from the Internet .......................... 421
   C. Admissible Hearsay under Applicable Exceptions .......... 422
VI. A Reality Check on Hearsay ................................ 430
   A. The Internet as Part of Business or Government Records ...... 430
   B. Web Pages Are Not Business Records of the Internet Service Provider (ISP) ................. 433
   C. Government Records and Reports ..................... 433
VII. Constitutional Dimensions of Hearsay ............................ 435
   A. The Accused’s Right of Confrontation .................. 436
      1. Two-Prong Ohio v. Roberts Test .................. 438
      2. The “Testimonial” Standard of Crawford v. Washington .... 439
      3. Why “Testimonial”? ................................. 441
      4. Does the “Testimonial” Label Give an Absolute Right? .......... 443
   B. Due Process ....................................... 446
      1. Due Process Before Crawford ....................... 446
         a. Excluding hearsay offered by an accused ........ 446
         b. Excluding hearsay offered by the government ..... 447
      2. Due Process After Crawford ....................... 448
   C. Constitutional Wild Card .............................. 449