Introduction 1

CHAPTER 1
Brady Information 13

A. The Supreme Court Cases 14
1. 

Brady v. Maryland (1963): Evidence Favorable to the Defense and Material to Either Guilt or Punishment Must Be Disclosed 14

2. 

Giglio v. United States (1972): Evidence Affecting Credibility Falls Within the Brady Rule 16

3. 

United States v. Agurs (1976): The Government’s Failure to Disclose Immaterial Information Will Not Lead to Reversal 17

4. 


5. 

Kyles v. Whitley (1995): The Court Refines the Materiality Standard and Applies It in a Fact-Intensive Analysis 22

6. 

Brady in the Supreme Court Since Kyles 25

7. 


B. The Three Elements of a Brady Violation 29
1. Favorable to the Accused 29
a. “Exculpatory” information versus “impeachment” information. 30
b. “Brady material” versus “Brady information.” 31
c. Inadmissible evidence may be producible under Brady. 31

2. Suppression by the Government 33

3. Prejudice to the Defendant: Has Confidence in the Outcome of the Trial Been Undermined? 34
   a. Evidence found to be material. 35
   b. Evidence found not to be material. 37
   c. “Cumulative” evidence. 39

C. Other Considerations Regarding What Must Be Produced 40
   1. Brady Does Not Require Open File Discovery 40
   2. Prosecutors’ Work Product 40
   3. Confidential Informants 42

D. The Brady Rule at the Trial Court Level 42

E. Common Procedural Considerations 45
   1. Timing of Brady Disclosures 45
   2. Form of Brady Disclosures 48
   3. In Camera Review of Potential Brady Information 50
   4. Identifying Material Exculpatory Information Within a Larger Production 51
   5. Disclosing Brady Information Before a Guilty Plea 52

CHAPTER 2
Rule 16 of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure 55

A. Discovery Available from the Government 59
   1. Requests by the Defense 59
      a. Form and specificity of the request. 60
      b. Withdrawing the request. 61
      c. Requests in a multi-defendant case. 62
   2. Rule 16(a)—Defendant’s Statements—Generally 62
      a. Defendant must request the statement. 63
      b. Meaning of “statement.” 63
      c. Method of producing statements. 65
   3. Rule 16(a)(1)(A)—Defendant’s Oral Statements 65
      a. “Oral” statement. 66
      b. “Substance of the statement.” 67
      c. Relevance. 67
      d. Statement made by the defendant. 68
e. Before or after arrest. 69
f. Statement made to a known government agent in response to interrogation. 69
g. Government’s intent to use the statement at trial. 71

4. Rule 16(a)(1)(B)—Defendant’s Written or Recorded Statements 72
   a. Written or recorded statement by the defendant. 74
      i. Relevance 74
      ii. “Written or recorded statement” 75
      iii. Government’s possession, custody, or control 76
      iv. Knowledge or “due diligence” 80
   b. Written record containing the substance of the defendant’s statement in response to interrogation by a known government agent. 81
   c. The defendant’s grand jury testimony. 83

5. Rule 16(a)(1)(C)—Organizational Defendants 84

6. Defendant’s Prior Criminal Record 86

7. Documents and Objects 89
   a. Threshold requirements. 89
      i. Writings or tangible things 89
      ii. Government’s “possession, custody, or control” 91
   b. Categories of discoverable documents and objects. 92
      i. Items “material to preparing the defense” 92
         (a) United States v. Armstrong 92
         (b) Meaning of “material” 94
         (c) Defendant’s request 97
         (d) Burden to show materiality 97
         (e) Material buildings or places 100
      ii. Documents to be used in the government’s case-in-chief 100
         (a) Obligation to specify documents for use at trial 100
         (b) Government’s case-in-chief 103
         (c) Government’s intent 103
         (d) “Use” 104
      iii. Defendant’s documents 106
   c. Inspection and copying. 107

8. Reports of Examinations and Tests 111
   a. Covered examinations, tests, and experiments. 112
   b. “Results or reports.” 113
   c. Conditions for disclosure. 115
   d. Other considerations. 116
9. Expert Witnesses 116
   a. Conditions for disclosure. 117
      i. Defendant’s request 117
      ii. Government’s intent to use during case-in-chief 118
      iii. Expert testimony versus lay or fact testimony 119
   b. The “written summary.” 122
      i. Summary of opinions and their bases and reasons 123
      ii. Statement of the witness’s qualifications 126
      iii. Method of production 127
   c. Reciprocal expert discovery regarding defendant’s mental condition. 128

B. Express Limitations on Discovery from the Government 129
   1. The Work-Product Exception 131
      a. Common law work-product protection in criminal cases. 131
      b. Scope of immunity for “work product” under Rule 16(a)(2). 133
      c. Waiving and overcoming work-product protection. 136
      d. Privileges and redactions. 138
   2. Witness Statements 140
   3. Grand Jury Transcripts 141

C. Discovery Available from the Defendant 142
   1. Constitutional and Fairness Considerations 142
   2. The 1975 Amendments to Rule 16 144
   3. Defendant’s Request for Discovery and Government’s Compliance 146
   4. Timing of Reciprocal Discovery 149
   5. Documents and Objects to Be Used at Trial 150
      a. Documents for use in defendant’s case-in-chief. 151
      b. Documents and tangible things. 152
      c. Defendant’s possession, custody, or control. 153
      d. Defendant’s “intent.” 153
   6. Reports of Examinations and Tests 156
   7. Expert Witnesses 159

D. Express Limitations on Discovery from the Defendant 162
   1. Comparison with Subsection (a)(2) 163
   2. Exception for Scientific and Medical Reports 164
   3. Documents Made by the Defendant or the Defendant’s Agent During the Investigation or Defense 165
   4. Statements to the Defendant or the Defendant’s Agent 167
E. Continuing Duties of Disclosure, and Court Oversight 170
   1. Continuing Duty to Supplement Disclosure 170
   2. The District Court’s Authority to Regulate Discovery 174
      a. Protective and modifying orders. 175
         i. Good cause 176
         ii. Ex parte showings 177
         iii. District court’s discretion under Rule 16(d)(1) 178
      b. Remediing Rule 16 violations. 182
         i. Available remedies 183
         ii. Punitive remedies 186

CHAPTER 3
Witness Statements 189
A. History of the Jencks Act 190
   1. Jencks v. United States 190
   3. Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 26.2 194
B. Disclosures Required Under Rule 26.2 197
   and the Jencks Act 197
   1. Meaning of “Statement” 198
      a. Written statements made and signed, adopted, 198
         or approved by the witness.
      b. Substantially verbatim records contained 203
         in a recording or transcription.
      c. Statements to a grand jury. 204
   2. Additional Limitations on Discoverability of Statements 204
      a. Statement of the witness. 205
      b. Statements that relate to the subject matter 206
         of the witness’s testimony.
      c. Possession of statements. 206
C. Timing of Jencks Disclosures, and Motions to Produce 207
   1. Timing of Disclosures 207
   2. Motions to Produce Statements 210
D. Procedural Considerations 211
   1. Adjudicating Disputes About Whether Material 211
      May Be Discoverable
   2. Producing Portions of Documents 212
E. Sanctions for Failing to Produce a Statement 213
F. Interaction Between Jencks and Brady 215
CHAPTER 4
Subpoenas for Documents  217

A. Standards for Obtaining Documents by Subpoena  219
   1. Bowman Dairy  221
   2. Nixon  223
   3. Applying the Nixon Test  226
      a. Relevancy.  226
      b. Admissibility.  227
         i. Standards for “admissibility”  227
         ii. Contingent admissibility: the problem of impeachment evidence  229
         iii. Other “admissibility” issues  231
      c. Specificity.  232
      d. Burden on the subpoena recipient.  234
      e. Subpoenas returnable pretrial.  235
      f. Other restrictions on Rule 17(c) subpoenas.  238
   4. Limits of the Nixon Test  239
      a. Should the Nixon test apply to third-party subpoenas?  240
      b. Should the Nixon test apply to subpoenas for evidence material to the defense?  241

B. Obtaining or Challenging a Subpoena  243
   1. Obtaining a Pretrial Subpoena  244
      a. Motion required.  244
      b. Procedure on motion; ex parte motions.  245
   2. Obtaining a Trial Subpoena  247
      a. No motion required.  247
      b. Rule 17(c)(3).  247
      c. Subpoenas directed to lawyers.  249
   3. Motions to Quash or Modify Subpoenas  250
      a. Standards and procedures for motions to quash or modify.  250
      b. Materials considered; in camera review.  251
      c. “Modifying” a subpoena.  252
      d. Standing to challenge subpoenas.  253

C. Return of Subpoena  254

D. Logistical Matters  256
   1. Form and Service of Subpoenas  256
   2. Subpoena Expenses and Cost-Shifting  259
CHAPTER 5
Other Federal Rules and Statutes Permitting or Requiring Discovery 261

A. Notice of Alibi: Rule 12.1 262
1. Historical Context 262
2. Requirements of Rule 12.1 264
   a. Government request for notice of alibi defense. 264
   b. Defense obligation. 264
   c. Government reciprocal obligation. 265
   d. Continuing duty to disclose new information, and exceptions to the rule. 266
   e. Inadmissibility of notice of alibi defense. 266
3. Exclusion of Witnesses 266
   a. Generally. 266
   b. Exclusion of witnesses for government noncompliance. 267
   c. Exclusion of witnesses for defense noncompliance. 268
   d. Newly discovered witnesses. 269

B. Notice of Insanity Defense: Rule 12.2 269
1. Historical Context 269
2. Requirements of Rule 12.2 270
   a. Defense obligation to notify of insanity defense. 270
   b. Defense obligation to notify of expert evidence of mental condition. 270
   c. Mental examinations. 271
   d. Inadmissibility of mental condition notice and statements during mental examination. 271
3. Sanctions for Noncompliance 274

C. Notice of Public Authority Defense: Rule 12.3 275
1. Historical Context 275
2. Requirements of the Rule 275
   a. Defense obligation. 275
   b. Government obligation. 276
   c. Continuing duty and additional time. 276
   d. Inadmissibility of withdrawn intention. 276
3. Sanctions for Noncompliance 277

D. Notice of Evidence the Government Intends to Use in Its Case-in-Chief: Rule 12(b)(4)(B) 277

E. Depositions: Rule 15 279
1. Unavailability of the Witness 282
2. Materiality of the Testimony 286
3. Other Factors 287
4. Depositions by Consent 289

F. Grand Jury Material: Rule 6(e) 289
1. Scope of Grand Jury Secrecy 290
   a. Matters occurring before the grand jury. 290
   b. Limits of grand jury secrecy. 291
2. Means of Obtaining Material Under Rule 6(e) 292
   a. Rules 16 and 26.2 (Jencks). 292
   b. Disclosure under Rule 6(e)(3)(E). 293
3. “Particularized Need” 293
4. Disclosure “Preliminary to or in Connection with a Judicial Proceeding” 295
5. Disclosure to Support a Claim that the Indictment Should Be Dismissed 297

G. Disclosure Under Evidence Rule 404(B) and Other Federal Rules of Evidence 300
1. Other Crimes, Wrongs, or Acts: Rule 404(b) 300
2. Other Evidence Rules 304
   a. Past sexual behavior: Rule 412. 304
   b. Convictions more than ten years old: Rule 609. 304
   c. Writings used to refresh memory: Rule 612. 305
   d. Residual exception to the hearsay rule: Rule 807. 308
   e. Summary charts: Rule 1006. 308

H. Title III—Electronic Surveillance 310
1. Disclosing the Surveillance “Inventory” 310
2. Disclosing Electronic Surveillance and the Application for and Court Order Approving the Electronic Surveillance 312

I. The Freedom of Information Act 314
1. Exemptions from Disclosure 315
2. Timing 317
3. Using FOIA to Obtain Records 318

CHAPTER 6
Inherent Authority of the Court 321
A. The Basis for Inherent Authority 322
   1. Inherent Authority Generally 322
CONTENTS

2. Inherent Authority as Applied to Criminal Discovery 323
3. Scope and Limits of Inherent Authority 326
B. Witness Lists 331
   1. Witness Lists Under the Federal Rules 332
   2. Inherent Authority to Order Disclosure of Witnesses 334
      a. Court may apply a balancing test. 334
      b. List limited to case-in-chief witnesses. 336
      c. Government requests for defense witness lists. 336
C. Confidential Informants 338
   1. Roviaro v. United States 338
   2. Applying Roviaro’s Balancing Test 340
      a. Degree to which the confidential informant was involved in the alleged conduct giving rise to the indictment. 341
      b. Whether the informant has information that supports the defense. 342
      c. Government’s interest in withholding the informant’s identity. 342
   3. Making the Informant Available to the Defense 343
D. Physical Identifying Evidence of the Defendant: Handwriting Exemplars, Voiceprints, and Fingerprints 345

CHAPTER 7
Discovery Obligations Under Ethical Rules 349
A. Rule 3.8(d) Applies to Federal Prosecutors Practicing in States That Have Adopted It 350
B. Information Favorable to the Defense: ABA’s Model Rule of Professional Conduct 3.8(d) 351
C. Rule 3.8(d) in the States 355

CHAPTER 8
Department of Justice Criminal Discovery Policies 359
A. U.S. Attorneys’ Manual 360
   1. What Must Be Disclosed 360
   2. Where to Look 361
   3. Timing 363
   4. Enforcement 364
B. Department of Justice’s 2010 Discovery Guidance 364
   1. Gathering and Reviewing Discoverable Information 366
      a. Where to look. 366
      b. What to review. 367
   2. Conducting the Review 368
   3. Making the Disclosure 368
   4. Making the Record 369

CHAPTER 9
Special Considerations: Witness Safety and National Security 371

A. Witness Safety 371
   1. Rule 16(d)(1) Protective Orders 371
   2. Confidential Informants 372

B. National Security: The Classified Information Procedures Act 373
   1. Purpose of CIPA 373
   2. What Information Is Confidential 374
   3. Pretrial Conferences 374
   4. Procedure for Protective Orders 375
   5. Standard for Restricting Discovery of Classified Material 375
   6. Defendant’s Notice of Intent to Use Classified Information 379
   7. Use of Classified Information at Trial or Pretrial Hearing 380
   8. Interlocutory Appeal 383

CHAPTER 10
Enforcement and Sanctions 385

A. Remedies Governed by Rule or Statute 386
   1. Rule 16 386
   2. Jencks 387
   3. Remedies Beyond What the Rules Provide 387

B. Brady, Due Process, and Supervisory Powers 388
   1. Brady 388
   2. Due Process and Supervisory Powers 391
      a. Government misconduct that “shocks the conscience.” 391
b. Government misconduct and supervisory powers. 392
c. Sanctioning the defendant. 392

C. Methods of Enforcement and Sanctions 394
   1. Remedial Orders 394
   2. Punitive Sanctions 397
      a. Striking or excluding evidence. 398
      b. Punitive jury instruction. 399
      c. Dismissal. 400

D. Contempt 403

CHAPTER 11
Local Practice in U.S. District Courts 405
   A. Brady Information 407
   B. Criminal Rule 16 Material 411
   C. Witness Statements 413
   D. Notices of Defenses 414
      1. Insanity 415
      2. Alibi 415
      3. Public Authority 415
   E. Rule 404(b) Evidence 415
   F. Discovery for Pretrial Suppression Litigation 416
   G. Witness Lists 417
   H. Exhibit Lists 417
   I. Recordkeeping 418
   J. Sentencing Discovery 418
   K. Protective Orders 419
   L. Preservation of Notes and Other Materials 419
   M. Duty to Supplement 419
   N. Sanctions 420
   O. Other Noteworthy Procedures 420

CHAPTER 12
Reform Proposals 423
   A. Pretrial Disclosure of All Exculpatory Information 424
   B. Open-File Discovery 428
   C. Expanded Third-Party Discovery 431
   D. Jencks Act Timing 432
APPENDIX A
Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure Addressing Discovery 435

APPENDIX B
18 U.S.C. § 3500 The Jencks Act 453

APPENDIX C
Websites for Local Rules or District-Wide Standing Orders Governing Criminal Discovery 455

Table of Cases 459
Index 487
Acknowledgments 497
About the Authors 499