Table of Contents

Dedication ................................................................. iii
About the Author ......................................................... xiii
Preface ................................................................. xv
Note About the Administrative Conference of the United States (1968-1995, 2010-) ................................................................. xix
List of Acronyms Used in the Text ........................................... xxii

Part I
OVERVIEW OF FEDERAL AGENCY RULEMAKING .................. 1
A. Rulemaking under the Administrative Procedure Act ............. 4
B. Agency Rulemaking and the Courts .................................. 6
C. Agency Rulemaking and the Congress ............................... 12
D. Agency Rulemaking and the President .............................. 16
   1. The Development of Presidential Review ......................... 17
   2. Executive Order 12,866 ............................................. 21
   3. Developments in the Bush II Administration .................. 26
   4. Developments in the Obama Administration ................... 28
   5. Judicial Reaction to Presidential Review ...................... 30
E. Overviews of Rulemaking—Other Views ............................ 31
   1. The Administrative Conference’s Comprehensive Review of the “State” of Rulemaking ................................. 31
   2. The “Blackletter Statement” of the ABA Section of Administrative Law and Regulatory Practice ................... 32
   3. Other Overviews of Rulemaking ................................. 32
      Excerpts from “A Blackletter Statement of Federal Administrative Law” .... 34

PART II
THE STATUTORY FRAMEWORK FOR RULEMAKING .................. 41

Chapter 1
The Administrative Procedure Act’s Rulemaking Provisions .......... 43
   A. “Rules” and “Rulemaking” under the APA ...................... 43
   B. Formal Rulemaking under the APA ............................. 50
   C. Informal Rulemaking under Section 553 of the APA ............. 52
D. Rules Exempt from Section 553’s Requirements .......................... 52
   1. Rules Exempt from All of Section 553 ................................. 53
      a. Proprietary matters: public property, loans, grants, and contracts ........................................ 53
      b. Agency management or personnel .............................................. 56
      c. Military or foreign affairs .................................................. 56
   2. Rules of Agency Organization, Procedure, or Practice ............. 58
   3. Interpretive Rules and Policy Statements (also known as “Non-Legislative Rules”) ........................................ 63
      a. Substantial impact” ........................................................... 65
      b. The agency’s label ............................................................... 66
      c. Distinguishing between interpretive rules and legislative rules .................................................. 67
      d. Distinguishing between legislative rules and policy statements .............................................. 82
      e. Summary of the law on non-legislative rules ........................................ 90
      f. The intertwining of procedural claims and finality for the purposes of judicial review ................................. 91
      g. Post-promulgation comment period ........................................... 92
   4. “Good Cause” Exemptions .......................................................... 93
      a. Emergency health or safety standards ........................................ 96
      b. Congressional deadlines ......................................................... 97
      c. “Interim-final” rules ............................................................... 101
      d. “Direct-final” rulemaking ........................................................ 103
      e. Remedies for violations of the good-cause provision ............... 105
      f. Suspension of effective dates .................................................... 105
   5. Exemptions from Delayed Effective Date Requirement ............... 109
E. Publication Requirements of Section 552 of the APA ................. 110

Chapter 2
Use of Rulemaking or Adjudication for the Setting of Policy:
A Comparison ................................................................. 113
A. Legal Constraints on Choosing Rulemaking or Adjudication ........ 115
   1. Statutory Requirements .......................................................... 115
   2. Statutory Authority ................................................................. 115
   3. Judicial Constraints ............................................................... 118
B. Practical Considerations in Choosing Rulemaking or Adjudication .... 123
   1. Advantages of Rulemaking ....................................................... 123
   2. Advantages of Adjudication ...................................................... 126
   3. Summary .............................................................................. 128

Chapter 3
Other Procedural Statutes Affecting Rulemaking .......................... 129
A. The Federal Register Act ........................................................... 129
B. The National Environmental Policy Act ...................................... 130
C. The Regulatory Flexibility Act ................................................... 133
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D. The Paperwork Reduction Act</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The OMB Clearance Requirements</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Clearance Procedure</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. PRA and the Internet</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Standard of Review</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Small Business Paperwork Relief Act</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. The Federal Advisory Committee Act</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. The Negotiated Rulemaking Act</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. The Unfunded Mandates Reform Act</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. The Information Quality Act</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. The E-Government Act of 2002</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Congressional Review of Rules</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Miscellaneous Other Statutes Affecting Rulemaking</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Trade Agreements Act</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The National Technology Transfer and Advancement Act</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assessment of Federal Regulations and Policies on Families</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART II</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Informal Rulemaking in Practice</strong></td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beginning the Process</strong></td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. External Considerations</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Congressional and Judicial Pressure</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Public Petitions for Rulemaking</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Agency Priority Setting</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Other Influences on an Agency’s Decision to Begin Rulemaking</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Litigation Settlements and Consent Decrees</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Procedural Decisions</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Negotiated Rulemaking</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Electronic Rulemaking</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Potential Benefits</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Legal and Technical Issues</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Questions about the informational goal</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Questions concerning the participatory goal</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Impact of E-Rulemaking on the Rulemaking Process</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regulatory Analysis and Review</strong></td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Executive Order 12,866</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Rules Covered by Executive Order 12,866 Review</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Content of the Regulatory Analysis</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. OIRA Review</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. The Paperwork Reduction Act ...................................... 230
  1. Coverage ......................................................... 231
  2. Content of the Analysis ....................................... 231
  3. OIRA Review ................................................... 231
C. The Regulatory Flexibility Act .................................... 232
  1. Coverage ......................................................... 232
  2. Content of the Analysis ....................................... 233
  3. Review by the Small Business Administration .......... 234
D. Unfunded Mandates Reform Act ................................... 234
  1. Coverage ......................................................... 234
  2. Content of the Analysis ....................................... 235
  3. Review of the Analyses ....................................... 236
E. OMB Peer Review Bulletin ........................................ 236
F. Assessment of Federal Regulations and Policies on Families 239
G. Privacy Assessments .............................................. 240
H. Other Executive Orders .......................................... 241
I. Coordination of Analysis Requirements ........................... 246

Chapter 3

The Notice of Proposed Rulemaking ................................. 249
A. Publication Requirements ......................................... 249
B. Contents of the Notice of Proposed Rulemaking ............. 251
C. Federal Register Requirements and Incorporation by Reference 254
D. Adequacy of the Notice .......................................... 257
E. Need for a Second Cycle of Notice and Comment (“Logical Outgrowth” Test) .................... 258
F. Dissents ........................................................... 268

Chapter 4

Public Participation ...................................................... 271
A. Opportunity for Written Comment ............................... 271
  1. Minimum Time ................................................... 272
  2. Agency Disclosure of Important Data or Information .... 274
B. Special Consultation Requirements ............................... 278
C. Oral Hearings in APA Rulemakings .............................. 279
  1. The Administrative Procedure Act .......................... 279
  2. Hearing Requirements in Hybrid Rulemaking Statutes .... 282
  3. The Position of the Administrative Conference on Hearings in Rulemaking .................... 283
  4. Agency Oral Hearing Procedures .............................. 284
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 5
### The Rulemaking Record ......................................................... 287
  A. The Evolution of the “Rulemaking Record” Concept .................. 287
  B. The Importance of the Rulemaking Record in Informal Rulemaking ... 291
      1. The Rulemaking Record as an Aid to Public Participation ....... 291
      2. The Rulemaking Record as the Basis for the Agency’s Rulemaking Decisions .................................................. 292
      3. The Rulemaking Record as the Basis for Judicial Review ....... 293
      4. Treatment of “Confidential” Comments ............................ 300

## Chapter 6
### “Off-the-Record” or “Ex Parte” Communications in Rulemaking .......... 303
  A. Summary of the Law ......................................................... 303
  B. Agency Practices for Handling Ex Parte Communications ............ 306
      1. Policy Considerations .................................................. 306
      2. The Administrative Conference’s Recommendation .......... 307
      3. Agency Practice ....................................................... 307
  C. Executive Branch Communications in Rulemaking ................... 309
      1. The Administrative Conference’s Recommendations .......... 310
      2. The Transparency of OMB’s Review of Agency Rules .......... 311
      3. The Judicial Perspective ............................................. 313
  D. Congressional Communications in Rulemaking ........................ 314
  E. Intra-agency Communications in Rulemaking .......................... 315
  F. Communications with Consultants ........................................ 317

## Chapter 7
### The Final Rule ................................................................. 319
  A. Issues for Agency Consideration ........................................ 319
      1. Time Limits for Agency Action ....................................... 319
      2. Interagency Coordination and Review .............................. 321
      3. International Regulatory Cooperation ............................. 323
      4. The Final Regulatory Analysis and OMB Review ................ 327
      5. Legal and Jurisdictional Issues ..................................... 328
      6. Determining the Effective Date and Compliance Date for the Final Rule ........................................................... 329
         a. APA requirements; OIRA review .................................. 329
         b. Congressional review—special impact on major rules ...... 330
         c. Retroactivity concerns ............................................. 331
      7. Disqualification of Decisionmakers ................................ 334
  B. The Statement of Basis and Purpose ..................................... 337
      1. Impact of Judicial Review ............................................ 337
      2. Discussion of Alternatives .......................................... 341
      3. Response to Comments ................................................. 342
Chapter 8  
Review of Existing Rules ........................................ 355

Part IV  
JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AGENCY RULEMAKING .................... 363

Chapter 1  
Availability of Judicial Review ................................. 365

A. Is the Agency Action Reviewable? ............................ 365
B. Who Has Standing to Obtain Judicial Review? ............. 369
   1. Under the APA ........................................... 369
   2. Organizational Standing ................................ 371
   3. The Injury-in-Fact Test ................................ 372
   4. Causation (Traceability and Redressability) ............ 384
   5. Prudential Principles Governing Standing ............... 386
      a. Avoiding abstract and generalized questions ....... 386
      b. The “zone-of-interests” test ........................ 387
C. The Proper Forum for Review: Court of Appeals or District Court? .... 391
   1. Statutory Review ........................................ 391
   2. Non-statutory Review ................................... 394
D. The Venue (Location) of Review .............................. 395
E. The Appropriate Timing for Judicial Review ................. 397
   1. Finality ................................................ 398
   2. Exhaustion .............................................. 403
   3. Ripeness ............................................... 405
      a. Ripeness and pre-enforcement review ............... 407
      b. When is the rule “issued” for time-limits purposes? .... 417
      c. Time limits and challenges to non-legislative rules .... 419
      d. Ripeness (and finality) issues in challenges to agency
         inaction or delay in rulemaking ....................... 420

Chapter 2  
The Scope of Judicial Review ..................................... 423

A. Scope of Review—General Provisions ....................... 423
   1. APA Section 706(1): “agency action unlawfully withheld or
      unreasonably delayed” .................................... 424
2. APA Section 706(2)(A): “arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of
discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law” ..........425
   a. Significant Supreme Court decisions applying the arbitrary
      and capricious test .............................................429
   b. The “hard look” doctrine .....................................433
   c. Scope of review of agency policy changes .................441
3. APA Section 706(2)(B): “contrary to constitutional right, power,
   privilege, or immunity” ...........................................446
4. APA Section 706(2)(C): “in excess of statutory jurisdiction,
   authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right” ..........446
   a. The *Chevron* decision ......................................448
   b. Step One of *Chevron* .....................................449
   c. Step Two of *Chevron* .....................................453
   d. When does *Chevron* apply? ...............................457
   e. When *Chevron* does not apply, what does *Skidmore*
deference mean? ..................................................471
   f. Judicial deference to agency interpretations of their own
      regulations .....................................................473
5. APA Section 706(2)(D): “without observance of procedure
   required by law” .................................................476
   a. The APA .........................................................477
   b. Other statutes .................................................478
   c. The agency’s procedural regulations ........................478
   d. Procedural requirements imposed by courts ...............479
   e. Need to decide substantive claims after vacating a rule
      on procedural grounds ......................................482
6. APA Section 706(2)(E): “unsupported by substantial evidence in
   a case subject to sections 556 and 557 of this title or otherwise
   reviewed on the record of an agency hearing provided
   by statute” .........................................................482
7. APA Section 706(2)(F): “unwarranted by the facts to the extent
   that the facts are subject to trial de novo by the reviewing court” ..484

B. Record on Review .................................................484
C. Judicial Remedies .................................................485

Chapter 3
Judicial Review of Agency Failure to Act .........................491
   A. General Principles .............................................491
   B. Types of Agency Inaction ....................................494
      1. Failure to Initiate a Rulemaking ..........................494
      2. Delay in a Rulemaking Proceeding .......................497
      3. Termination of Rulemaking .................................501
   C. Summary .......................................................502