

# CONTENTS

<b>About the Author</b> .....	<b>xiii</b>
-------------------------------	-------------

<b>Preface</b> .....	<b>xv</b>
Purpose of This Book .....	xv
Voluminous Litigation .....	xv
Handling Hague Cases .....	xvii

<b>Section of Family Law Publications Development Board</b> .....	<b>xix</b>
-------------------------------------------------------------------	------------

## *Chapter 1*

<b>Introducing the Hague Abduction Convention</b> .....	<b>1</b>
§ 1.01 Introduction .....	1
§ 1.02 A Revolutionary Treaty .....	2
§ 1.03 A Fundamental Misconception .....	3
§ 1.04 Parties to the Convention .....	5
§ 1.05 The Hague Conference .....	6
§ 1.06 The Pérez-Vera Report .....	6
§ 1.07 U.S. Executive Branch Interpretation .....	7
§ 1.08 The Purpose of the Treaty .....	7
§ 1.09 Custody Jurisdiction and the Hague Convention .....	10
§ 1.10 Best Interests and the Hague Convention .....	11
§ 1.11 Threats to the Central Tenet .....	13
§ 1.12 Essence of the Convention .....	15
§ 1.13 The Key Terms in the Hague Convention .....	16
§ 1.14 Overview of the Exceptions .....	16
§ 1.15 Uniform Interpretation .....	18
§ 1.16 Uniform Trust .....	19
§ 1.17 Step-by-Step Analysis in any Hague Case .....	20
§ 1.18 Access Claims .....	21
§ 1.19 Relationship of the Convention to the UCCJEA .....	22
§ 1.20 Hague Convention and Criminal Law .....	26
§ 1.21 What the Hague Convention Is Not .....	27

*Chapter 2*

<b>Procedural and Practical Issues</b> .....	<b>29</b>
§ 2.01 Role of Central Authority .....	29
§ 2.02 The International Child Abduction Remedies Act ....	32
§ 2.03 Concurrent Jurisdiction .....	34
§ 2.04 The Hague Application .....	35
§ 2.05 Initiating The Case .....	36
§ 2.06 Location of Child .....	39
§ 2.07 Service of Process .....	40
§ 2.08 Expeditious Procedures .....	41
§ 2.09 The Initial Appearance .....	44
§ 2.10 Discovery .....	44
§ 2.11 Stay of Custody Proceedings .....	47
§ 2.12 Guardians/Lawyers for Children .....	49
§ 2.13 Evidence .....	50
§ 2.14 Child’s Testimony .....	52
§ 2.15 Use of Foreign Case Law .....	53
§ 2.16 Article 15 Declarations .....	55
§ 2.17 Comity as to Foreign Hague Orders .....	56
§ 2.18 Interim Remedies .....	58
§ 2.19 Fugitive Disentitlement Doctrine .....	59
§ 2.20 Place of Return .....	60
§ 2.21 Arrangements for Return .....	61
§ 2.22 Undertakings .....	63
§ 2.23 Legal Fees and Expenses .....	64
§ 2.24 Stays Pending Appeal .....	69

*Chapter 3*

<b>Habitual Residence</b> .....	<b>75</b>
§ 3.01 Introduction .....	75
§ 3.02 “Habitual Residence” and “Home State” .....	77
§ 3.03 “Habitual Residence” and “Domicile” .....	78
§ 3.04 Drafting History .....	78
§ 3.05 Timing of a Wrongful Taking .....	79
§ 3.06 Timing of a Wrongful Retention .....	80
§ 3.07 Overview of the Approaches to Determining Habitual Residence .....	84
§ 3.08 Problems with the Varying Approaches .....	86
§ 3.09 International Authorities .....	86

§ 3.10	The First U.S. Approach: Parental Intent Preeminent . . .	92
§ 3.11	No Habitual Residence . . . . .	93
§ 3.11.1	Determining Parental Intention: The Ruling on <i>Mozes</i> . . . . .	94
§ 3.11.2	The Ruling in <i>Gitter</i> : An Overview . . . . .	95
§ 3.11.3	The Ruling in <i>Gitter</i> : Establishing Last-Shared Parental Intent . . . . .	96
§ 3.11.4	Post- <i>Gitter</i> Cases as to Parental Intention . . . . .	97
§ 3.11.5	Post- <i>Gitter</i> Cases as to Acclimatization . . .	98
§ 3.11.6	Abandonment . . . . .	100
§ 3.12	The Second Approach: The Objective Circumstances Test . . . . .	101
§ 3.13	The Third Approach: The Blended Test . . . . .	104
§ 3.14	Policy Considerations . . . . .	107
§ 3.14.1	Policy Considerations in Favor of Parental Intent . . . . .	107
§ 3.14.2	Policy Considerations in Favor of Child Focus . . . . .	108
§ 3.15	“Acclimatization” and Habitual Residence . . . . .	110
§ 3.16	Parental Uncertainty . . . . .	112
§ 3.17	Conditional Moves . . . . .	113
§ 3.18	Implied or Inferred Conditions . . . . .	115
§ 3.19	Sabbaticals and Time-limited Overseas Postings . . . . .	117
§ 3.20	Habitual Residence of Infants . . . . .	119
§ 3.21	Useful Evidence . . . . .	121

*Chapter 4*

<b>Rights of Custody</b> . . . . .	<b>125</b>	
§ 4.01	Convention Provisions as to “Rights of Custody” . . .	125
§ 4.02	Step-by-Step Analysis . . . . .	126
§ 4.03	Proof of Foreign Law . . . . .	128
§ 4.04	Agreements Concerning Custody . . . . .	130
§ 4.05	Ne Exeat Clause . . . . .	131
§ 4.06	Rights of Custody Attributed to an Institution . . . . .	132
§ 4.07	Exercise of Rights of Custody . . . . .	132

*Chapter 5*

<b>Consent and Acquiescence</b> .....	<b>135</b>
§ 5.01 Convention Provisions as to Consent and Acquiescence .....	135
§ 5.02 Consent .....	136
§ 5.02.1 Meaning of the Term .....	136
§ 5.02.2 Relevant Evidence .....	137
§ 5.02.3 Temporary or Permanent Consent .....	140
§ 5.02.4 Retraction of Consent .....	141
§ 5.03 Acquiescence .....	142
§ 5.04 Consent, Acquiescence, and Parallel Litigation .....	144
§ 5.05 Discretion .....	146

*Chapter 6*

<b>One Year and Settled</b> .....	<b>147</b>
§ 6.01 Introduction .....	147
§ 6.02 Purpose of the Exception .....	148
§ 6.03 When the One-Year Period Commences .....	149
§ 6.04 When Proceedings Commence .....	150
§ 6.05 No Tolling of the One-Year Period .....	151
§ 6.06 The “Settled” Requirement .....	151
§ 6.07 General Principles .....	153
§ 6.08 Burden Of Proof .....	155
§ 6.09 Age .....	155
§ 6.10 Stability of Residence .....	156
§ 6.11 Presence of Relatives .....	158
§ 6.12 Employment of the Parent .....	159
§ 6.13 Concealment .....	160
§ 6.14 Immigration Status .....	161
§ 6.15 Social Lives of the Children .....	164
§ 6.16 Expert Testimony .....	165
§ 6.17 Discretion .....	166

*Chapter 7*

<b>The Child’s Objections</b> .....	<b>171</b>
§ 7.01 Introduction .....	171
§ 7.02 Burden of Proof .....	173
§ 7.03 Similar Cases, Different Results .....	176

§ 7.04	Age and Maturity .....	178
	§ 7.04.1 Age of the Child .....	178
	§ 7.04.2 Maturity .....	179
§ 7.05	Expert Evidence .....	181
§ 7.06	Guardian Ad Litem .....	182
§ 7.07	Clarity and Strength of Opinion .....	183
§ 7.08	Undue Influence .....	185
§ 7.09	Discretion .....	190

*Chapter 8*

<b>Grave Risk of Harm .....</b>	<b>195</b>	
§ 8.01	Introduction .....	195
§ 8.02	The Pérez-Vera Report .....	196
§ 8.03	State Department Analysis .....	197
§ 8.04	Burden of Proof .....	198
§ 8.05	The Distinction Between Hague Cases and Custody Cases: Avoiding a “Best Interests” Analysis .....	199
§ 8.06	Evidence .....	201
§ 8.07	Expert Testimony .....	203
§ 8.08	Narrow Interpretation .....	205
§ 8.09	Broader Interpretation .....	206
§ 8.10	Grave Risk in General; What Constitutes a “Grave Risk”? .....	208
§ 8.11	Adjustment Problems Insufficient .....	211
§ 8.12	Separation from Primary Care Provider .....	212
§ 8.13	Separation from Siblings .....	216
§ 8.14	Relative Happiness or Living Conditions Insufficient .....	217
§ 8.15	Financial Hardship Insufficient .....	221
§ 8.16	Poor Parenting Insufficient .....	222
§ 8.17	Must Prior Harm Be Established? .....	223
§ 8.18	Must the Risk of Harm Be Imminent? .....	224
§ 8.19	Extent of Harm .....	225
§ 8.20	Isolated or Sporadic Abuse .....	226
§ 8.21	Grave Physical Risks: Terrorism and Zones of War .	227
§ 8.22	Spousal Abuse .....	229
§ 8.23	Post-traumatic Stress Disorder .....	232
§ 8.24	Sexual Abuse .....	233

§ 8.25	Need for Medical Treatment .....	234
§ 8.26	Intolerable Situation .....	236
§ 8.27	Whether Respondent Must Prove Lack of Protection in Habitual Residence .....	237
	§ 8.27.1 Such Proof Is Required .....	238
	§ 8.27.2 Such Proof Is Not Required .....	239
	§ 8.27.3 Sufficiency of Such Proof .....	240
§ 8.28	Undertakings: Authority to Require Undertakings ..	242
§ 8.29	Appropriateness of Undertakings .....	243
§ 8.30	Opposing Undertakings .....	247
§ 8.31	Types of Undertakings .....	248
§ 8.33	Judicial Discretion .....	249

*Chapter 9*

<b>Human Rights Exception .....</b>	<b>251</b>
§ 9.01 In General .....	251
§ 9.02 Applicability in Specific Cases .....	252

*Chapter 10*

<b>Rights of Access .....</b>	<b>255</b>
§ 10.1 Introduction .....	255
§ 10.2 Convention Provisions Concerning Access .....	255
§ 10.3 ICARA Provisions Concerning Access .....	257
§ 10.4 ICAPRA Provisions Concerning Access ICAPRA ..	257
§ 10.5 Federal Right of Action Concerning Access .....	258
§ 10.6 International Approaches to Access Provisions .....	259
§ 10.7 Applicability of Access Provisions .....	259

*Chapter 11*

<b>The Hague Convention and International Relocation and Travel .....</b>	<b>261</b>
§ 11.1 Introduction .....	261
§ 11.2 International Child Relocation .....	261
§ 11.3 International Child Travel .....	264
§ 11.4 Provisions of Visitation Order .....	269

<b>Appendix 1: Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction .....</b>	<b>271</b>
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------

**Appendix 2: Explanatory Report Drawn Up by  
Ms. E. Pérez-Vera ..... 285**

**Appendix 3: International Child Abduction Remedies Act ... 337**

**Appendix 4: State Department Legal Analysis ..... 345**

**Appendix 5: Application Under the Hague Convention on the  
Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction ..... 383**

**Appendix 6: Hague Convention—General Instructions ..... 389**

**Appendix 7: Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and  
Enforcement Act ..... 397**

**Appendix 8: Sean and David Goldman International Child  
Abduction Prevention and Return Act of 2014 ..... 421**

**Appendix 9: Uniform Child Abduction Prevention Act ..... 439**

**Index ..... 467**