Preface .......................................................................................................... xvii
About the Author .........................................................................................xxiii

PART I  The Facts and Relationships That Influence Decisions to Settle
and Settlement Terms ..................................................................................... 1

CHAPTER 1  Introduction ............................................................................... 3
   A. Importance of Patent Settlements .......................................................... 4
   B. Advantages of Settlement ...................................................................... 5
   C. Approach and Tools for Settlement ........................................................ 7
      1. Economics of Settlement .................................................................... 7
      2. Use in Practice ................................................................................... 8
      3. Data on Patent Litigation ................................................................... 9
      4. Legal Issues and Settlement .............................................................. 9
   D. Uses of the Approach and Tools ............................................................. 9
      1. Qualitative Analysis .......................................................................... 9
      2. Quantitative Analysis ..................................................................... 10
      3. Use in Negotiation .......................................................................... 10
      4. Cooperative, Joint Use of the Approach ........................................ 11
      5. Use in ADR Processes .................................................................... 11
      6. Use in Settlement Decisions ........................................................... 12
      7. Use in Managing Litigation ............................................................ 12
      8. Overcoming the Barriers to Negotiated Settlement ....................... 13

CHAPTER 2  The Decision to Settle Litigation Based on the Effects of a
Judgment on the Patent Owner and the Accused Infringer ............................ 15
   A. Basic Model of Settlement Decisions ................................................ 15
   B. Expected Value and Cost of Litigation ............................................... 17
vi Contents

C. Impact of Litigation Costs ................................................................. 17
D. Impact of Transaction Costs ................................................................. 18
E. Simple Example ................................................................................... 19
F. Important Aspects of the Basic Model of Settlement in Patent Actions ...................................................................................... 23
1. Differences in Probability Estimates Are Highly Likely ............. 23
3. Likelihood of Differences Is Probably Related to Absolute Probabilities .................................................................................. 24
4. Efforts to Acquire the Ability to Make and Improve a Probability Estimate Affects the Timing of Settlement .......... 25
5. Confidence in Probability Estimates Should Not Affect the Decision to Settle ................................................................. 27
6. Settlement Occurs before Judgment and Time Is Important .................................................................................... 28
   a. Time Value of Money .................................................................. 28
   b. Parties’ Cost and Value of Money ........................................... 29
   c. Effect of Infringement and Potential Infringement Liability on the Parties’ Businesses ....................................................... 29
7. Importance of Litigation Costs ...................................................... 31
   a. When Litigation Costs Should Lead to Settlement .......... 31
   b. Effect of Litigation Costs Declines as the Value and Cost of Litigation Increase ................................................................. 31
   c. Effect of Litigation Costs Declines as the Probabilities of Winning and Losing Increase ......................................................... 32
   d. Future Litigation Costs Influence Settlement; Past Costs Are Sunk .................................................................................. 32
   e. Some Litigation Costs Change the Probabilities ................. 33
   f. Different Incentives to Incur Litigation Costs ....................... 33
   g. Litigation as a Way to Create Litigation Costs .................... 33
   h. Actions Where a Party Pays No Attorneys’ Fees .............. 34
G. Impact of Attitudes Toward Risk .......................................................... 35
   1. Risk Aversion ................................................................................. 36
   2. Risk Preference and Loss Aversion .............................................. 37
   3. Identifying Attitudes toward Risk ................................................. 38
      a. Effect of Risk with Both Parties Risk-Averse ......................... 43
      b. Effect of Risk with Both Parties Preferring Risk .................... 50
      c. Effect of Risk with a Risk-Averse Patent Owner and 
         a Risk-Preferring Infringer ...................................................... 51
H. Impact of Increased Damages .............................................................. 51
I. Impact of Attorneys’ Fees Awards ....................................................... 55
J. Impact of Counterclaims ..................................................................... 58
   1. Antitrust Counterclaims................................................................. 58
   2. Actual or Potential Patent Infringement Claims 
      and Counterclaims by Infringers ................................................... 60
K. Other Aspects of the Basic Model of Settlement in Patent Actions.... 61
   1. More Complex Array of Outcomes .............................................. 61
   2. More Complex Array of Infringers ............................................... 64
   3. More Complex Array of Actions; ITC Proceedings ..................... 64
L. Timing of Settlement .......................................................................... 65
   1. Stages of Patent Litigation: Trial, Summary Judgment, 
      and Claim Construction ................................................................. 65
   2. Reexamination Proceedings.......................................................... 66
M. Decision under Alternative Forms of Settlement ................................. 67
   1. No Injunction, Dismissal without Prejudice, No Release, 
      and No Other Judgment ................................................................. 67
   2. No Payment for Past Infringement, Release, Dismissal with 
      Prejudice, and Immunity from Action for Future Infringement .... 68
   3. No License for the Future, Injunction, Payment for Past 
      Infringement, and Release for Past Infringement ...................... 68
   4. Royalty-Bearing License for the Future, Payment for Past 
      Infringement, and Other Terms ...................................................... 72
CHAPTER 3  The Decision to License Based on the Effects of a License on the Patent Owner and Potential Licensee ......................... 75

A. Commercial Condition for Licensing .................................................. 77
   1. Owner’s Economic Value of Not Licensing .................................. 78
   2. Expected Payments ..................................................................... 81
   3. Licensee’s Economic Value with Licensing ................................. 81
   4. Profits for Purpose of the Decision to License ............................... 83
      a. Pertinent Costs ...................................................................... 83
      b. Determining the Appropriate Value of Other Fixed Assets ....... 84
      c. Identifying Profits at the Appropriate Price and Quantity ...... 84
      d. Identifying the Cost of Patents Owned by Others ................. 86
      e. Identifying the Value of Inventions and Patents a Patent Owner Does Not Employ in Products .............................. 87
   5. Effect of Transaction Costs .......................................................... 88
   6. Effect of Risk ............................................................................. 88
   7. Accounting Approaches to the Economic Value of an Invention .......................................................... 90

B. Litigation Condition for Licensing ...................................................... 91
   1. Probability of Litigation .............................................................. 92
   2. Licensing and the Value and Cost of Patent Remedies .............. 93
   3. Licensing and the Value and Cost of an Injunction .................... 93

C. Where Only One Condition Controls Settlement ................................. 95
   1. Litigation Condition Controls the Past ....................................... 95
   2. Commercial Condition Controls the Future for a Potential Licensee Subject to an Injunction ................................. 95

D. Where the Commercial or Litigation Condition Controls Settlement .............................................................................. 95
   1. Commercial or Litigation Factors May Control the Future ........ 95
   2. Commercial Value Is Greater or Less Than Litigation Value and Cost .............................................................................................................. 96
   3. Commercial Value and Litigation Value and Cost Overlap ....... 97
   4. Commercial Value Always Includes Litigation Value and Cost, or Litigation Value and Cost Always Include Commercial Value..... 98
E. Decision to Settle and License Where Litigation and Licensing Are Not Alternatives ................................................................. 98
   1. Effect of the Law on Both the Decision to License and Royalties with Licensing ............................................................... 99
   2. Licensing Unconstrained by Lear ........................................... 101
   3. Licensing Constrained by Lear ............................................. 102
   4. Licensing Constrained by MedImmune ................................. 105
F. Existing Licenses May Constrain a Patent Owner’s Decisions on Litigating or Licensing—Licenses to Competitors of the Licensee ... 109
G. Agreements to License May Constrain a Patent Owner’s Decisions on Litigating or Licensing ............................................... 109

CHAPTER 4 The Decision to Settle or License Based on the Added Effects of a Judgment on the Parties’ Relations with Nonparties ................................................. 111
A. The Patent Owner’s Perception of the Effects of a Judgment on Future Actions and Existing and Future Licenses .................... 111
   1. Value of Successful Litigation in Deterring Infringement by Others, Encouraging Others to License, and Increasing Payments under Existing Licenses ........................................... 112
   2. Cost of Unsuccessful Litigation in Permitting Infringement and Ending Royalty Payments ............................................. 112
   3. Net Future Effect .................................................................. 114
      a. Winning Is Not Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Costly ................................................................. 114
      b. Winning Is Not Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Very Costly .......................................................... 115
      c. Winning Is Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Not Costly .............................................................. 115
      d. Winning Is Very Valuable for the Future, and Losing Is Not Costly .......................................................... 116
B. Infringer Perceives a Judgment to Be Valuable or Costly for Future Litigation and Licensing .................................................. 117
   1. Potential Cost of Winning to the Infringer ............................ 117
   2. Potential Value of Winning to the Infringer ......................... 118
C. Settlement with Third-Party Effects of a Judgment .................... 118
CHAPTER 5 The Decision to Settle or License Based on the Added Effects of an Agreement on the Parties’ Relations with Nonparties

A. Patent Owner Perceives Settlement or Licensing to Be Valuable or Costly for Future Actions or Licenses
   1. Licensing One Company at Some Rate Will Limit the Rate Others Will Pay
   2. Licensing Some Increases the Likelihood Others Will License
   3. Licensing Increases the Likelihood of a Future Validity Judgment
   4. Licensing Reduces the Likelihood of Litigation over Validity and the Costs of an Invalidity Judgment
   5. Settlement or Licensing Increases the Likelihood of Litigation with Others
   6. Settlement or Licensing with One Reduces Payments It Will Obtain from Others
   7. Settlement or Licensing Agreements in One Action Limit the Payments the Owner Will Accept from Others
   8. Payments for One Action Limit Damages for Others
   9. Net Effect

B. Infringer or Potential Licensee Perceives Settlement or Licensing to Be Valuable or Costly for Future Actions or Licenses
   1. Infringer or Potential Licensee Believes That Settlement or Licensing Will Provide Other Benefits
   2. Infringer or Potential Licensee Believes That Settlement or Licensing Will Have Costs

PART II Applying the Facts and Relationships to Decisions in a Particular Situation

CHAPTER 6 Applying the Theory of Settlement to a Patent Action

A. Pertinent Time Periods
B. Commercial Condition for Licensing
C. Litigation Condition for Settlement
D. Settlement with a License .......................................................... 128
   1. Settlement for the Past .......................................................... 129
   2. Settlement for the Period after Negotiations Commence and Prior to an Injunction ............................................................ 129
   3. Settlement for the Period after an Injunction ............................... 130
E. Settlement without a License ............................................................. 130
F. Damages Measures ................................................................. 130
   1. Measures of Reasonable Royalty Damages ................................. 131
   2. Another Possible “Measure” of Damages ................................. 137
   3. Correct Way to Measure Reasonable Royalty Damages ............. 137
G. Value and Cost of an Injunction ......................................................... 138

CHAPTER 7 Examples of Applying the Theory ....................................... 139
A. Important Patent Controlling a Large and Highly Profitable Market ................................................................. 139
   1. Settlement Prospects Based on Expected Values and Cost (Not Risk-Adjusted Value and Cost) .................................................. 142
      a. Prospects for a License for the Future ................................. 143
      b. Settlement for Past Infringement ....................................... 145
      c. Litigation Alternative ...................................................... 145
      d. Prospects for Settlement Including a License ....................... 146
      e. Prospects for Settlement without a License ....................... 146
      f. Summary of Settlement Prospects Based on Expected Values and Cost ................................................................. 147
   2. Settlement Prospects Based on Risk-Adjusted Values and Cost (Not Expected Value and Cost) ............................................. 148
      a. Prospects for a License for the Future ................................. 148
      b. Settlement for Past Infringement ....................................... 150
      c. Litigation Alternative ...................................................... 150
      d. Prospects for Settlement Including a License ....................... 151
      e. Prospects for Settlement without a License ....................... 151
      f. Summary of Settlement Prospects in Dollars Based on Risk-Adjusted Expected Values and Cost ................................. 151
3. Prospects for Settlement Based on the Effects of a Judgment on Third Parties ................................................................. 152
4. Settlement Prospects Given Different Assumptions on the Probabilities of Winning and Losing ........................................... 154
5. The Results of the Analysis Shown as a Percentage of Sales Revenue, a Dollar Amount per Unit, and a Lump Sum ............... 156
   a. Settlement Range as a Percentage of Infringer Sales .......... 157
   b. Settlement Range as Dollars per Unit of Infringer Sales ..... 158
   c. Lump-Sum Payments ............................................................ 158
6. Settlement with a License When No Action Is Pending .......... 160
B. Important Patent Controlling a Smaller Market ..................... 162
   1. Effect of Large Attorneys’ Fees ............................................. 163
   2. Patent Owner Pays No Attorneys’ Fees—Owner with Attorneys on Contingent Fees ..................................................... 165
C. Important Patent Controlling a Smaller Market with Potential for Increased Damages and Attorneys’ Fees Award ............. 166
D. Licensing an Important Patent Controlling a Smaller Market with No Past Infringement—Licensing ........................................... 169
E. Important Patent Controlling a Large Market with a Patent Owner Unable to Produce or Sell—The Nonproducing Patent Owner .... 172
F. Less-Important Patent Controlling a Large Market .................. 173
G. Important Patent Controlling an Average Market with No Gains from Licensing ................................................................. 179

PART III  The Empirical Data on Patent Litigation and Settlement...... 183

CHAPTER 8  The Number, Time, and Manner of Resolution of Patent Actions ................................................................. 185
   A. Overview of Empirical Data on Patent Litigation and Settlement ........................................................................ 185
   B. Increase in Patent Litigation .................................................. 186
   C. Use of Trial to Decide Patent Actions ..................................... 186
   D. Frequency of Patent Actions Resolved by Pretrial Motion .......... 189
   E. Frequency of Patent Actions Resolved by Settlement in the District Courts ................................................................. 191
Contents

F. Uniformity in Method of Disposition Over Time ....................... 194
G. Settlement after Judgment and Prior to Appeal ....................... 197
H. Settlement during Appeal.......................................................... 197
I. Time from Filing to Disposition by Trial, Pretrial Motion,
and Settlement.............................................................................. 199
   1. Median Time to Termination ................................................. 199
   2. Average or Mean Time to Termination................................. 200
   3. Relative Time-wise Efficiency of Different Methods .......... 200
   4. Year-to-Year Variance.......................................................... 204
J. Procedural Stage and Time of Settlement of
Infringement Actions ..................................................................... 208

CHAPTER 9 The Outcome of Patent Actions ................................. 211
A. Patent Owner Win Rates in the District Courts......................... 211
   1. Total Judgments ................................................................... 211
   2. Trial...................................................................................... 212
   3. Pretrial Motion...................................................................... 213
   4. Trial and Pretrial Motion ..................................................... 213
   5. Weighted Average Win Rates .............................................. 213
   6. Historical Win Rates............................................................. 214
   7. Judge and Jury Trial.............................................................. 216
B. Patent Owner Win Rates in the Federal Circuit ....................... 217
   1. The Dunner Study ................................................................ 217
   2. The Moore Study ................................................................ 219
   3. The Allison and Lemley Study ............................................. 219
   4. Janicke and Ren Study.......................................................... 219
   5. Overall Effect........................................................................ 220
C. Observations on Patent Owner Win Rates ............................. 220
   1. Appeal.................................................................................. 221
   2. Declaratory Judgments........................................................... 221
   3. Systematic Differences in Predictions .................................. 221
   4. Third-Party Effects................................................................. 222
Part IV Laws That Influence Decisions to Settle and License .......... 245

Chapter 10 Settlement and the Law .............................................. 247

A. Substantive Patent Law ............................................................... 247

B. Settlement of Patent Disputes before Litigation ..................... 248

1. Background .............................................................................. 248

2. Licensee Estoppel ..................................................................... 249

3. Eviction .................................................................................... 250

4. \textit{Lear} Eliminated Licensee Estoppel .................................... 251

5. \textit{Lear} Is Read (Incorrectly) to Prevent Enforcement of Agreements Not to Contest Validity ........................................... 251
C. Settlement of Patent Disputes during Litigation ....................... 252
   1. License Entered as Part of Settlement ................................. 252
   2. Settlement Agreement and Order ........................................ 253
   3. Settlement Agreement ..................................................... 254
   4. Consent Judgment ......................................................... 256
   5. Dismissal With or Without Prejudice .................................. 259
   6. Injunction and Contempt .................................................. 262
   7. Other Issues .................................................................... 265
D. Declaratory Judgment Actions and Jurisdiction ......................... 265
   1. Declaratory Judgment Actions by Licensees ....................... 266
   2. What Licensees Should Do after Lear and MedImmune .......... 273
   3. What Patent Owners Should Do after Lear and MedImmune .... 275
   4. Declaratory Judgment Actions by Potential Infringers-Licensees ............................................................. 284
E. Antitrust Law and Settlement ...................................................... 289
   1. Enforcement of Patents .................................................... 290
   2. Agreements to Settle Patent Actions ................................. 292
   3. Agreements among Patent Owners about Licensing ............ 294
   4. Agreements among Infringers or Potential Licensees about Licensing ........................................................... 295
   5. Settlement with Payments by Patent Owner to Infringer—Reverse Payments ......................................................... 296
   6. Agreements Not to Contest Validity .................................... 302
F. Patent Misuse and Settlement .................................................... 303
G. Agreements to License on FRAND and RAND Terms .................. 305
H. Legislation to Change the Laws That Interfere with Licensing and Settlement .................................................. 310

Index .................................................................................. 317