Contents

Preface xiii

Acknowledgments to the First Edition xv

Acknowledgments to the Second Edition xvii

About the Author xix

Chapter 1: Getting Started 1
  The Challenge 1
  Meet the Challenge: Understand Three Key Perspectives 5
  Meet the Challenge: Apply the PLAN Model 7
  The Roadmap 7

Part One: Develop Your PLAN—Three Critical Perspectives 11

Chapter 2: The Emotional Perspective: Emotional Dynamics of Problem Divorces 13
  The Emotional Effects of Divorce and Resiliency 14
  Three Keys to Understanding Problem Divorces 16
    The First Key—“His” and “Her” Marriages 17
    The Second Key—The Marital Separation Events 19
    The Third Key—Recognizing Sources of Impasses to Resolving the Divorce 20
  Summary 22
## Chapter 3: The Legal Perspective: Building the PLAN Model

- Introduction: 23
- The *Frye* Test
  - Introduction and Concerns: 24
  - The Different Faces of *Frye*: 25
- The *Daubert* Test
  - Introduction: 29
  - Applying *Daubert* in Bench Trials: 32
- Comparing *Frye* and *Daubert*: 33
- The PLAN Model: Applying Shared Principles
  - Step One: Determine the Expert’s Qualifications to Testify: 35
  - Step Two: Determine Whether the Expert’s Methods Conform to Relevant Professional Standards—Methods Reliability: 39
  - Step Three: Evaluate the Empirical and Logical Connections Between the Data Arising from the Expert’s Methods and the Expert’s Conclusions—Reasoning Reliability: 45
  - Step Four: Gauge the Connections Between the Expert’s Conclusions and the Expert’s Opinions: 46
- Summary: 48

## Chapter 4: The Psychological Perspective: Filling Out the PLAN Model

- Introduction: 49
- Step One: Determine the Expert’s Qualifications to Testify
  - Professional Identities and Qualifications: 50
  - Sorting Through the Qualifications Maze: 56
  - Choosing Mental Health Experts: Distinguishing Qualities: 58
  - Using Mental Health Experts: The Matter of Professional Roles: 62
- Step Two: Determine Whether the Expert’s Methods Conform to Relevant Professional Standards—Methods Reliability: 71
- Guidelines and Protocols Informing Methodology: 72
- Forensic Interviews: 74
- Collateral or Third-Party Information: 77
- Psychological Testing: 79
- Seven Keys to Understanding Tests: 83
- Step Three: Evaluate the Empirical and Logical Connections Between the Data Arising from the Expert’s Methods and the Expert’s Conclusions—Reasoning Reliability: 99
- Judgment Biases: 100
- MHP Use of Research and Professional Literature: 100
Contents

Problems Inherent in DSM-5 and Syndrome-Based Testimony 102
Organizing Data and Conclusions: A Functional Assessment Model 104
Step Four: Gauge the Connections Between the Expert’s Conclusions and the Expert’s Opinions 116
Summary 119

Part Two: Exposing the Analytical Gaps—Applying Scientific-Critical Thinking 121

Chapter 5: Scientific-Critical Thinking: The Mindset for Exposing
Analytical Gaps 123
Introduction 123
The Scientific-Critical Thinking Mindset 125
Critical Thinking Elements 126
Benefits of the Scientific-Critical Thinking Mindset 128

Chapter 6: Exposing Analytical Gaps 129
Exposing Overly Abstract Psychological Concepts 129
Exposing “Common Sense” Notions Used to Support Expert Opinions 131
Exposing Ipse Dixit Assertions 134
Exposing Attempts to Invoke the General Acceptance Factor Absent Support 136

Chapter 7: Exposing Judgment Biases: Keep It REAL 141
Introduction 141
Types of Biases 143
Overt Biases 143
Covert Judgment Biases 144
The Decision-Making Process 144
Common Judgment Biases 145
Overconfidence Bias 146
Confirmatory Bias 146
Hindsight Bias 147
Anchoring and Adjustment 147
Availability Bias 148
Fundamental Attribution Error 149
Discounting Base Rates 149
## Contents

Can You Expose Experts’ Biases? 150
Conduct the REAL CHECK to Expose Experts’ Biases 151
   The Foundation 151
   Generating and Testing Reasonable Alternative Explanations 152
   Conducting the REAL CHECK to Expose Experts’ Biases 155
Summary 158

Chapter 8: Exposing Misapplied or Misrepresented Research: The Example of Domestic Violence 159
Introduction 159
Conceptual Challenges in Domestic Violence Cases 160
   Definitions and Legal Implications 161
Looking at the Literatures 162
   The Different Faces of Domestic Violence 163
   The Issue of Female-Initiated Violence 169
Looking Inside the Literature 170
Exposing the Gaps in Domestic Violence Testimony 172
   Is the Expert Familiar with the Domestic Violence Literature? 172
   Does the Expert Acknowledge That the Domestic Violence Literature Reflects Different Types of Domestic Violence That May Have Different Causes? 173
   What Methods Does the Expert Use to Generate Data That Inform the Evaluation Conclusions and Expert Opinions? 173

Chapter 9: Exposing Confirmatory Bias: The Example of Sexual Abuse Allegations 177
Introduction 177
Behaviors and Symptoms: Problems in Sexual Abuse Validation 179
   Definitions 179
   What About Sexualized Behaviors? 180
Key Principles When Considering Sexual Abuse Allegations 183
   Allegations—True or False? 183
   Children’s Disclosure Statements 184
   Suggestibility and Its Concerns 188
   The Legal Effects of Suggestibility Research 196
Forensic Interviews 197
   Concerns with Problem Forensic Interviews 198
   The Forensic Interview Structure—Basic Principles 208
   The Forensic Interview in Context 211
### Chapter 10: Exposing Misuse of DSM-5: A Lawyer’s Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic One: Purposes and Development of DSM-5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purposes of DSM-5</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of DSM-5</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic Two: The Elements of a DSM-5 Diagnosis</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The DSM-5 Diagnostic Two-Step</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selected DSM-5 Diagnostic Issues</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Topics One and Two: The Psychological Perspective</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic Three: DSM-5, the Rules of Evidence, and Caselaw—The Legal Perspec</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Legal Backdrop</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating the Psychological and Legal Perspectives</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arguments for Admissibility or Use of DSM-5 Based Testimony</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arguments Against Admissibility or Use of DSM-5 Diagnosis-Based Testimony</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary: Understanding DSM-5—A Lawyer’s Approach</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part Three: Obtaining Mental Health Records

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 11: Negotiating the Mental Health Records Maze: Confidentiality, HIPAA, and Privileges</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Mental Health Record</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Confidentiality</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. HIPAA and the Disclosure of Records</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three Key HIPAA Points</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key HIPAA Terms and Concepts</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIPAA Rules for Disclosing Protected Health Information</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What About Alcohol and Substance Abuse Program Records?</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Obtaining Psychological Test Data</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Psychotherapist-Patient Privilege</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Privilege Rationale</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Privilege Landscape</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Special Issues</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategies for Negotiating the Mental Health Records Maze</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>