

# RATINGS OF ARTICLE III JUDICIAL NOMINEES

## 108<sup>TH</sup> CONGRESS

Last Updated: 1/10/2008

### Key to ABA Rating

WQ = Well Qualified; Q = Qualified; NQ = Not Qualified; sm = substantial majority; m = majority; min = minority  
**Circuit court nominees are printed in bold.**

Unanimous committee ratings appear as a single rating. In other situations, the rating from the majority or substantial majority (constituting ten to thirteen votes) of the committee is recorded first, followed by the rating or ratings of a minority of the committee. The majority rating is the rating of the committee.

### FIRST SESSION

DATE NOMINATED	NAME OF NOMINEE	COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED	ABA RATING
1/7/03	<b>Boyle, Terrence W. (NC)</b>	<b>Fourth Circuit</b>	<b>Q</b>
1/7/03	<b>Bybee, Jay S. (NV)</b>	<b>Ninth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>Cook, Deborah L. (OH)</b>	<b>Sixth Circuit</b>	<b>Q</b>
1/7/03	<b>Estrada, Miguel A. (VA)</b>	<b>DC Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
1/7/03	<b>Griffin, Richard A. (MI)</b>	<b>Sixth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>Kuhl, Carolyn B. (CA)</b>	<b>Ninth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>McKeague, David W. (MI)</b>	<b>Sixth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>Neilson, Susan Bieke (MI)</b>	<b>Sixth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
1/7/03	<b>Owen, Priscilla Richman (TX)</b>	<b>Fifth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
1/7/03	<b>Pickering, Charles W. Sr. (MS)</b>	<b>Fifth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>Roberts, John G. Jr. (MD)</b>	<b>DC Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
1/7/03	<b>Saad, Henry W. (MI)</b>	<b>Sixth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>m</sup>/WQ<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>Sutton, Jeffrey S. (OH)</b>	<b>Sixth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/WQ<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	<b>Tymkovich, Timothy M. (CO)</b>	<b>Tenth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>
1/7/03	Adams, John R.	USDC: Northern District of Ohio	Q
1/7/03	Breen, J. Daniel	USDC: Western District of Tennessee	WQ
1/7/03	Carney, J. Cormac	USDC: Central District of California	Q <sup>sm</sup> /abstain <sup>min</sup>

DATE NOMINATED	NAME OF NOMINEE	COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED	ABA RATING
1/7/03	Dever, James C. III	USDC: Eastern District of North Carolina	Q
1/7/03	Erickson, Ralph R.	USDC: District of North Dakota	Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Feuerstein, Sandra J.	USDC: Eastern District of New York	WQ
1/7/03	Frost, Gregory L.	USDC: Southern District of Ohio	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Hicks, S. Maurice Jr.	USDC: Western District of Louisiana	Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Holwell, Richard J.	USDC: Southern District of New York	WQ
1/7/03	Junell, Robert A.	USDC: Western District of Texas	Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup> / NQ <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Ludington, Thomas L.	USDC: Eastern District of Michigan	WQ
1/7/03	Otero, S. James	USDC: Central District of California	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Quarles, William D. Jr.	USDC: District of Maryland	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Rohlfing, Frederick W. III	USDC: District of Hawaii	NQ
1/7/03	Varlan, Thomas A.	USDC: Eastern District of Tennessee	Q <sup>m</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
1/7/03	Steele, William H.	USDC: Southern District of Alabama	Q
1/7/03	Stanceu, Timothy C.	Court of International Trade	Q
1/15/03	Minaldi, Patricia H.	USDC: Western District of Louisiana	Q
1/15/03	Drell, Dee D.	USDC: Western District of Louisiana	WQ
1/15/03	Altonaga, Cecilia M.	USDC: Southern District of Florida	Q 1 recusal
1/29/03	Bennett, Richard D.	USDC: District of Maryland	WQ
1/29/03	Flanagan, Louise W.	USDC: Eastern District of North Carolina	Q
1/29/03	Holmes, J. Leon	USDC: Eastern District of Arkansas	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
1/29/03	Selna, James V.	USDC: Central District of California	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /abstain <sup>min</sup>
1/29/03	Simon, Philip P.	USDC: Northern District of Indiana	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
1/29/03	Springmann, Theresa Lazar	USDC: Northern District of Indiana	WQ
2/6/03	<b>Prado, Edward C. (TX)</b>	<b>Fifth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
2/12/03	<b>Callahan, Consuelo Maria (CA)</b>	<b>Ninth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
2/12/03	<b>Colloton, Steven M. (IA)</b>	<b>Eighth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/WQ<sup>min</sup>/ NQ<sup>min</sup></b>

DATE NOMINATED	NAME OF NOMINEE	COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED	ABA RATING
3/5/03	<b>Chertoff, Michael (NJ)</b>	<b>Third Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
3/5/03	<b>Wesley, Richard C. (NY)</b>	<b>Second Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
3/5/03	Robinson, Stephen C.	USDC: Southern District of New York	WQ
3/5/03	Castel, P. Kevin	USDC: Southern District of New York	WQ
3/5/03	Der-Yeghiayan, Samuel	USDC: Northern District of Illinois	Q
3/13/03	Campbell, David G.	USDC: District of Arizona	WQ
3/27/03	Woodcock, John A. Jr.	USDC: District of Maine	WQ
3/27/03	Kravitz, Mark R.	USDC: District of Connecticut	WQ
3/27/03	Coogler, L. Scott	USDC: Northern District of Alabama	Q
4/9/03	Greer, J. Ronnie	USDC: Eastern District of Tennessee	Q
4/9/03	Hardiman, Thomas M.	USDC: Western District of Pennsylvania	Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
4/9/03	<b>Pryor, William H. Jr. (AL)</b>	<b>Eleventh Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b> <b>1 recusal</b>
4/11/03	<b>Bea, Carlos T. (CA)</b>	<b>Ninth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>
4/28/03	<b>Duncan, Allyson K. (NC)</b>	<b>Fourth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
4/28/03*	<b>Allen, Claude A. (VA)</b> <small>*withdrawn 12/9/03, renominated 1/20/04</small>	<b>Fourth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>sm</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>
4/28/03	Brack, Robert C.	USDC: District of New Mexico	WQ
4/28/03	Browning, James O.	USDC: District of New Mexico	WQ
4/28/03	Conrad, Glen E.	USDC: Western District of Virginia	WQ
4/28/03	Conrad, Robert J. Jr.	USDC: Western District of North Carolina	Q
4/28/03	Filip, Mark R.	USDC: Northern District of Illinois	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
4/28/03	Gibson, Kim R.	USDC: Western District of Pennsylvania	WQ
4/28/03	Irizarry, Dora L.	USDC: Eastern District of New York	NQ <sup>m</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
4/28/03	McKnight, H. Brent	USDC: Western District of North Carolina	WQ
4/28/03	Ryan, Daniel P.	USDC: Eastern District of Michigan	Q <sup>m</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
4/28/03	Sharpe, Gary L.	USDC: Northern District of New York	WQ
4/28/03	Suko, Lonny R.	USDC: Eastern District of Washington	WQ

<b>DATE NOMINATED</b>	<b>NAME OF NOMINEE</b>	<b>COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED</b>	<b>ABA RATING</b>
5/1/03	<b>Fisher, D. Michael (PA)</b>	<b>Third Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
5/1/03	Benitez, Roger T.	USDC: Southern District of California	NQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
5/1/03	Burns, Larry Alan	USDC: Southern District of California	WQ
5/1/03	Cardone, Kathleen	USDC: Western District of Texas	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
5/1/03	Cohn, James I.	USDC: Southern District of Florida	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
5/1/03	Crone, Marcia A.	USDC: Eastern District of Texas	Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
5/1/03	Fischer, Dale S.	USDC: Central District of California	WQ
5/1/03	Hayes, William Q.	USDC: Southern District of California	Q
5/1/03	Houston, John A.	USDC: Southern District of California	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
5/1/03	Montalvo, Frank	USDC: Western District of Texas	WQ
5/1/03	Proctor, R. David	USDC: Northern District of Alabama	Q
5/1/03	Rodriguez, Xavier	USDC: Western District of Texas	WQ
5/1/03	Sabraw, Dana Makoto	USDC: Southern District of California	WQ
5/1/03	Yeakel, Earl Leroy III	USDC: Western District of Texas	Q <sup>m</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>
5/8/03	Mosman, Michael W.	USDC: District of Oregon	WQ
5/15/03	<b>Myers, William Gerry III (ID)</b>	<b>Ninth Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>m</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>
5/15/03	Floyd, Henry F.	USDC: District of South Carolina	WQ
5/15/03	White, Ronald A.	USDC: Eastern District of Oklahoma	Q
6/9/03	Jones, Robert Clive	USDC: District of Nevada	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
6/9/03	Figa, Phillip S.	USDC: District of Colorado	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
6/18/03	Titus, Roger W.	USDC: District of Maryland	WQ
7/14/03	Rodgers, Margaret Catharine	USDC: Northern District of Florida	WQ <sup>m</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
7/25/03	<b>Brown, Janice R. (CA)</b>	<b>DC Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>m</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>
7/25/03	<b>Kavanaugh, Brett M. (MD)</b>	<b>DC Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
7/30/03	Saylor, F. Dennis IV	USDC: District of Massachusetts	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
8/1/03	Townes, Sandra L.	USDC: Eastern District of New York	WQ
9/18/03	Karas, Kenneth M.	USDC: Southern District of New York	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>

<b>DATE NOMINATED</b>	<b>NAME OF NOMINEE</b>	<b>COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED</b>	<b>ABA RATING</b>
9/23/03	Herrera, Judith C.	USDC: District of New Mexico	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
9/23/03	Guirola, Louis Jr.	USDC: Southern District of Mississippi	WQ
9/29/03	<b>Gruender, Raymond W. (MO)</b>	<b>Eighth Circuit</b>	<b>Q</b>
9/29/03	<b>Haynes, William James II (VA)</b>	<b>Fourth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
10/14/03	Hopkins, Virginia E.	USDC: Northern District of Alabama	Q <sup>m</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
10/14/03	Martinez, Ricardo S.	USDC: Western District of Washington	WQ
10/22/03	Wake, Neil Vincent	USDC: District of Arizona	WQ
10/31/03	Kelley, Walter D. Jr.	USDC: Eastern District of Virginia	WQ
11/3/03	Pratter, Gene E.K.	USDC: Eastern District of Pennsylvania	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup> 1 recusal
11/5/03	Sheridan, Peter G.	USDC: District of New Jersey	Q
11/5/03	Duffey, William S. Jr.	USDC: Northern District of Georgia	WQ
11/6/03	Stengel, Lawrence F.	USDC: Eastern District of Pennsylvania	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>
11/12/03	<b>Sykes, Diane S. (WI)</b>	<b>Seventh Circuit</b>	<b>WQ<sup>sm</sup>/Q<sup>min</sup></b>
11/21/03	<b>Van Antwerpen, Franklin S. (PA)</b>	<b>Third Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
11/24/03	Boyle, Jane J.	USDC: Northern District of Texas	WQ
11/25/03	Cooke, Marcia G.	USDC: Southern District of Florida	WQ
11/25/03	Gomez, Curtis V.	USDC: District of the Virgin Islands	Q <sup>m</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>
11/25/03	Sanchez, Juan R.	USDC: Eastern District of Pennsylvania	WQ
12/9/03	<b>Hall, Peter W. (VT)</b>	<b>Second Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
12/9/03	Robart, James L.	USDC: Western District of Washington	WQ

## SECOND SESSION

DATE NOMINATED	NAME OF NOMINEE	COURT TO WHICH NOMINATED	ABA RATING
1/20/04	Diamond, Paul S.	USDC: Eastern District of Pennsylvania	WQ
1/20/04	Harwell, Robert Bryan	USDC: District of South Carolina	Q
1/20/04	Schiavelli, George P.	USDC: Central District of California	WQ
2/2/04	Finch, Raymond L.	USDC: District of the Virgin Islands	Q <sup>sm</sup> /WQ <sup>min</sup>
2/6/04	<b>Pickering, Charles W. Sr. (MS)</b>	<b>Fifth Circuit</b>	See rating 1/7/03
2/12/04	<b>Benton, William Duane (MO)</b>	<b>Eighth Circuit</b>	<b>WQ</b>
3/12/04	<b>Pryor, William H. Jr. (AL)</b>	<b>Eleventh Circuit</b>	See rating 4/9/03
4/6/04	Watson, Michael H.	USDC: Southern District of Ohio	Q <sup>sm</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
4/20/04	Covington, Virginia Maria Hernandez	USDC: Middle District of Florida	WQ
<b>5/10/04</b>	<b>Griffith, Thomas B. (UT)</b>	<b>D.C. Circuit</b>	<b>Q<sup>m</sup>/NQ<sup>min</sup></b>
5/17/04	Schneider, Michael H., Sr.	USDC: Eastern District of Texas	WQ
6/16/04	Alvarez, Micaela	USDC: Southern District of Texas	Q <sup>m</sup> /NQ <sup>min</sup>
7/6/04	Starrett, Keith	USDC: Southern District of Mississippi	WQ
7/6/04	Boyko, Christopher A.	USDC: Northern District of Ohio	WQ
9/7/04	Crotty, Paul A	USDC: Southern District of New York	WQ
9/10/04	Cox, Sean F.	U.S.D.C: Eastern District of Michigan	WQ
9/15/04	Seabright, J. Michael	U.S.D.C: District of Hawaii	WQ <sup>sm</sup> /Q <sup>min</sup>

**Last Updated: 1/26/2005**